Synchronizing $^{10}$Be in two varved lake sediment records to IntCal13 $^{14}$C during three grand solar minima

Markus Czymzik$^{1,2}$, Raimund Muscheler$^3$, Florian Adolphi$^{3,4}$, Florian Mekhaldi$^3$, Nadine Dräger$^1$, Florian Ott$^{1,5}$, Michał Słowinski$^6$, Mirosław Błaszkiewicz$^{6,7}$, Ala Aldahan$^8$, Göran Possnert$^9$, and Achim Brauer$^1$

$^1$GFZ-German Research Centre for Geosciences, Section 5.2 Climate Dynamics and Landscape Evolution, 14473 Potsdam, Germany
$^2$Leibniz-Institute for Baltic Sea Research Warnemünde (IOW), Marine Geology, 18119 Rostock, Germany
$^3$Department of Geology, Quaternary Sciences, Lund University, 22362 Lund, Sweden
$^4$Physics Institute, Climate and Environmental Physics, University of Bern, 3012 Bern, Switzerland
$^5$Max Planck Institute for the Science of Human History, 07743 Jena, Germany
$^6$Polish Academy of Sciences, Institute of Geography and Spatial Organization, Warszawa 00-818, Poland
$^7$Polish Academy of Sciences, Institute of Geography and Spatial Organization, Torun 87-100, Poland
$^8$Department of Geology, United Arab Emirates University, 15551 Al Ain, UAE
$^9$Tandem Laboratory, Uppsala University, 75120 Uppsala, Sweden

Correspondence: Markus Czymzik (markus.czymzik@io-warnemuende.de)

Received: 12 September 2017 – Discussion started: 19 September 2017
Revised: 17 April 2018 – Accepted: 10 May 2018 – Published: 31 May 2018

Abstract. Timescale uncertainties between paleoclimate reconstructions often inhibit studying the exact timing, spatial expression and driving mechanisms of climate variations. Detecting and aligning the globally common cosmogenic radionuclide production signal via a curve fitting method provides a tool for the quasi-continuous synchronization of paleoclimate archives. In this study, we apply this approach to synchronize $^{10}$Be records from varved sediments of Tiefer See and Lake Czechowskie covering the Maunder, Homeric and 5500 a BP grand solar minima with $^{14}$C production rates inferred from the IntCal13 calibration curve. Our analyses indicate best fits with $^{14}$C production rates when the $^{10}$Be records from Tiefer See were shifted for 8 ($-12/+4$) (Maunder Minimum), 31 ($-16/+12$) (Homeric Minimum) and 86 ($-22/+18$) years (5500 a BP grand solar minimum) towards the past. The best fit between the Lake Czechowskie $^{10}$Be record for the 5500 a BP grand solar minimum and $^{14}$C production was obtained when the $^{10}$Be time series was shifted 29 ($-8/+7$) years towards present. No significant fits were detected between the Lake Czechowskie $^{10}$Be records for the Maunder and Homeric minima and $^{14}$C production, likely due to intensified in-lake sediment resuspension since about 2800 a BP, transporting “old” $^{10}$Be to the coring location. Our results provide a proof of concept for facilitating $^{10}$Be in varved lake sediments as a novel synchronization tool required for investigating leads and lags of proxy responses to climate variability. However, they also point to some limitations of $^{10}$Be in these archives, mainly connected to in-lake sediment resuspension processes.

1 Introduction

Paleoclimate archives provide unique insights into the dynamics of the climate system under various forcing conditions (Adolphi et al., 2014; Brauer et al., 2008; Neugebauer et al., 2016). Particularly the timing and spatial expression of climate variations can provide valuable information about the underlying driving mechanisms (Czymzik et al., 2016b, c; Lane et al., 2013; Rach et al., 2014). However, timescale uncertainties between different paleoclimate records often inhibit the investigation of such climate variations. Climate-independent synchronization tools offer the possibility for synchronizing individual paleoclimate archives and, thereby, robust studies of leads and lags in the climate system.
At > 500-year intervals, further cosmogenic radionuclide production changes induced by the varying geomagnetic field become increasingly important (Lal and Peters, 1967; Snowball and Muscheler, 2007; Simon et al., 2016). Detecting and aligning the externally forced cosmogenic radionuclide production signal via a curve fitting method enables the quasi-continuous synchronization of natural environmental archives (Adolphi and Muscheler, 2016; Muscheler et al., 2014).

One challenge with this approach is the unequivocal detection of the cosmogenic radionuclide production signal because of transport and deposition processes. Subsequent to production, $^{14}\text{C}$ oxidizes to $^{14}\text{CO}_2$ and enters the global carbon cycle. Varying exchange rates between Earth’s carbon reservoirs add non-production variability to the atmospheric $^{14}\text{C}$ record (Muscheler et al., 2004). This uncertainty can theoretically be accounted for by calculating $^{14}\text{C}$ production rates using a carbon cycle model. However, changes in Earth’s carbon reservoirs are difficult to assess (Köhler et al., 2006). $^{10}\text{Be}$ in midlatitude regions is nearly exclusively scavenged from the atmosphere by precipitation (Heikkilä et al., 2013). Varying atmospheric circulation and scavenging during the about 1 month long tropospheric residence time (about 1-year stratospheric residence time) result in spatially nonuniform $^{10}\text{Be}$ deposition patterns (Aldahan et al., 2008; Raisbeck et al., 1981). Despite these non-production effects, common changes in $^{10}\text{Be}$ and $^{14}\text{C}$ records are considered to reflect the cosmogenic radionuclide production signal, due to their common production mechanism and different chemical behavior (Lal and Peters, 1967; Muscheler et al., 2016).

To date, synchronization studies based on cosmogenic radionuclides are mainly limited to $^{14}\text{C}$ records from trees and $^{10}\text{Be}$ time series from Arctic and Antarctic ice cores (Raisbeck et al., 2017; Muscheler et al., 2014). For example, Adolphi and Muscheler (2016) synchronized the Greenland ice core and IntCal13 timescales for the last 11 000 years. Synchronizing $^{10}\text{Be}$ records in sedimentary archives opens the opportunity for the synchronization of paleoclimate records around the globe. Thereby, the temporal resolution of this approach is limited by the lowest-resolution record involved. First studies underline the potential of varved lake sediments for recording the $^{10}\text{Be}$ production signal, down to annual resolution (Berggren et al., 2010, 2013; Czymzik et al., 2015, 2016a; Martin-Puertas et al., 2012).

In the following, we attempt to synchronize $^{10}\text{Be}$ records from varved sediments of Tiefer See (TSK) and Lake Czechowskie (JC) covering the grand solar minima at 250 (Maunder Minimum), 2700 (Homeric Minimum) and 5500 a BP with $^{14}\text{C}$ production rates inferred from the IntCal13 calibration curve (Muscheler et al., 2014; Reimer et al., 2013). Annual $^{10}\text{Be}$ time series from both lake sediment archives yield the broad preservation of the $^{10}\text{Be}$ production
Figure 2. 10Be concentrations ($^{10}$Be$_{con}$) in Tiefer See (TSK) sediments around the Maunder, Homeric and 5500 a BP grand solar minima and corresponding proxy time series from the same archive. $^{10}$Be$_{con}$ compared with sediment accumulation rates (SARs), total organic carbon (TOC), Ti, Ca and Si. Correlation coefficients were calculated for the complete time series covering all three grand solar minima. Significance levels of correlations were calculated using 10 000 iterations of a nonparametric random phase test taking into account trend and autocorrelation present in the time series (Ebisuzaki, 1997). Error bars indicate AMS measurement uncertainties. Non-varved intervals in TSK sediments are indicated by bars.

signal during solar cycles 22 and 23 (Czymzik et al., 2015). The targeted three grand solar minima comprise among the lowest solar activity levels throughout the last 6000 years (Steinhilber et al., 2012).

3 Methods

3.1 Sediment subsampling and proxy records

Continuous series of sediment samples at a ∼ 20-year resolution (about 20 mm sediment) were extracted for 10Be measurements from sediment cores TSK11 and JC-M2015, based on varve chronologies (Dräger et al., 2017; Ott et al., 2016; Słowiński et al., 2017). The lake basins are part of subglacial channel systems formed at the end of the last glaciation and had no major inflows during the Holocene (Dräger et al., 2017; Ott et al., 2016). Both lakes are of similar size (TSK: 0.75 km$^2$; JC: 0.73 km$^2$), but the catchment of JC (19.7 km$^2$) is about 4 times larger than that of TSK (5.5 km$^2$) (Fig. 1). TSK sediments during the investigated grand solar minima are composed of alternating intervals of organic, calcite and rhodochrosite varves as well as intercalated non-varved sections (Dräger et al., 2017). JC sediments for these time windows comprise endogenic calcite varves with couplets of calcite and organic/diatom sub-layers, and an additional layer of resuspended littoral material since about 2800 a BP (Ott et al., 2016; Wulf et al., 2013). TSK and JC are located at the interface of maritime westerly and continental airflow. Mean annual precipitation is similar at both sites: 640 mm a$^{-1}$ at TSK and 680 mm a$^{-1}$ at JC (Czymzik et al., 2015).
3.2 \(^{10}\)Be extraction and accelerator mass spectrometry (AMS) measurements

After spiking with 0.5 mg \(^9\)Be carrier, authigenic Be was leached from 0.2 g ground sediment samples overnight with 8 M HCl at 60 °C (Berggren et al., 2010). The resulting solutions were filtered to separate the undissolved fractions. Further addition of NH\(_3\) and H\(_2\)SO\(_4\) caused the precipitation of metal hydroxides and silicates, which were again removed by filtering. The remaining solutions were treated with EDTA to separate other metals and, then, passed through hydrogen form ion exchange columns in which Be was retained. Be was extracted from the columns using 4 M HCl and Be(OH)\(_2\) precipitated through the addition of NH\(_3\) at pH 10. The samples were washed and dehydrated three times by centrifuging and oxidized to BeO at 600 °C in a muffle furnace. After mixing with Nb, AMS measurements of BeO were performed at the Tandem Laboratory of Uppsala University. Final \(^{10}\)Be concentrations were calculated from measured \(^{10}\)Be/\(^9\)Be ratios, normalized to the NIST SRM 4325 reference standard (\(^{10}\)Be/\(^9\)Be = 2.68 \times 10^{-11}\) (Berggren et al., 2010).

3.3 Original chronologies

The age models for TSK and JC sediments were constructed using a multiple-dating approach. Microscopic varve counts were carried out for both lake sediments. Non-varved intervals in TSK sediments were bridged based on varve thickness measurements in neighboring well-varved sediment sections. Independent age control for the TSK and JC varve chronologies was provided by radiocarbon dating and tephrochronology (for details see: Dräger et al., 2016; Ott et al., 2016, 2017; Wulf et al., 2013). Resulting chronological uncertainties are ±17 (TSK) and ±4 years (JC) for the Maunder Minimum, ±139 (TSK) and ±29 years (JC) for the Homeric Minimum as well as ±74 (TSK) and ±56 years (JC) for the 5500 a BP grand solar minimum (see Fig. 6).

3.4 Timescale synchronization

Lag-correlation analyses were applied to determine best fits between the \(^{10}\)Be records from TSK and JC for the Maunder, Homeric and 5500 a BP grand solar minima and \(^{14}\)C production rates inferred from the IntCal13 calibration curve (Muscheler et al., 2014; Reimer et al., 2013). Before the correlation, all time series were 75- to 500-year band-pass filtered and normalized by dividing by the mean, to reduce
Figure 4. Tiefer See (TSK) and Lake Czechowskie (JC) $^{10}$Be concentration ($^{10}$Be$_{con}$), corrected $^{10}$Be ($^{10}$Be$_{environment}$) and $^{10}$Be composite ($^{10}$Be$_{comp}$) time series around the Maunder, Homeric and 5500 a BP grand solar minima. All time series are resampled to a 20-year resolution and normalized by dividing by the mean. A 75-year low pass filtered was applied to reduce noise. Uncertainty ranges of $^{10}$Be$_{comp}$ (gray shadings) are expressed as the differences between the $^{10}$Be$_{con}$ and $^{10}$Be$_{environment}$ time series. Significance levels of correlations between $^{10}$Be$_{con}$ and $^{10}$Be$_{comp}$ were calculated using a random phase test (Ebisuzaki, 1997).

noise and increase the comparability (Adolphi et al., 2014). Significance levels for all correlation coefficients were calculated using 10,000 iterations of a nonparametric random phase test, taking into account autocorrelation and trend present in the time series (Ebisuzaki, 1997). Chronological uncertainty ranges were reported as the time spans in which significances of correlations are below the given significant level. Before the analyses, all time series were resampled to a 20-year resolution.

4 Results

$^{10}$Be concentrations ($^{10}$Be$_{con}$) were measured in 78 sediment samples from TSK and 73 sediment samples from JC (Figs. 2, 3 and S1 in the Supplement). $^{10}$Be$_{con}$ in TSK sediments range from 1.13 to 7.09 $\times$ 10$^8$ atoms g$^{-1}$, with a mean of 3.91 $\times$ 10$^8$ atoms g$^{-1}$ (Figs. 2 and S1). $^{10}$Be$_{con}$ in JC sediments vary between 0.93 to 3.82 $\times$ 10$^8$ atoms g$^{-1}$, around a mean of 1.89 $\times$ 10$^8$ atoms g$^{-1}$ (Figs. 3 and S1). Mean AMS measurement uncertainties are 0.12 $\times$ 10$^8$ atoms g$^{-1}$ for TSK and 0.07 $\times$ 10$^8$ atoms g$^{-1}$ for JC samples (Figs. 2, 3 and S1). Due to the 1.387 $\pm$ 0.012 Ma long half-life of $^{10}$Be (Korschinek et al., 2010), the effect of radioactive decay is negligible in our $^{10}$Be records.

5 Discussion

5.1 $^{10}$Be production signal in TSK and JC sediments

Environment and catchment conditions can add non-production variations to $^{10}$Be$_{con}$ records from varved lake sediments (Berggren et al., 2010; Czymzik et al., 2015). In the following chapter we will, first, describe our approach used for detecting and correcting possible non-production features in our $^{10}$Be time series and, then, discuss possible mechanisms behind the statistically inferred connections.

To detect and reduce non-production effects in our $^{10}$Be time series, we perform a three-step statistical procedure following Czymzik et al. (2016a), with a slight modification. First, multi-linear regressions were calculated between the $^{10}$Be$_{con}$ records and TOC, SAR, Ca, Si, and Ti proxy time series from TSK and JC, reflecting changes in sediment accumulation and composition (Dräger et al., 2017; Ott et al., 2016; Wulf et al., 2016), to estimate the possible environmental influence ($^{10}$Be$_{bias}$). Only the TOC and Ca time series...
with significant contributions \((p < 0.1)\) for TSK and JC were included in the final multi-regressions. Subsequently, the resulting \(^{10}\)Be\(_{\text{bas}}\) time series from TSK and JC sediments were subtracted from the original \(^{10}\)Be\(_{\text{con}}\) records in an attempt to construct an environment-corrected version of the \(^{10}\)Be record \((^{10}\)Be\(_{\text{environment}}\)). However, this statistical approach also removes variability in the \(^{10}\)Be\(_{\text{con}}\) records only coincident with variations in proxy time series but without a mechanistic linkage, potentially resulting in an overcorrection. Such coinciding variability can be introduced by solar activity variations causing \(^{10}\)Be production changes and climate variations imprinted in the proxy time series. Therefore, final \(^{10}\)Be composite records \((^{10}\)Be\(_{\text{comp}}\)\) were calculated by averaging the \(^{10}\)Be\(_{\text{con}}\) and \(^{10}\)Be\(_{\text{environment}}\) records from each site. To enhance the robustness of the corrections, the procedure was performed on the complete \(^{10}\)Be\(_{\text{con}}\) records from TSK and JC covering all three grand solar minima. Uncertainty ranges of the calculated \(^{10}\)Be\(_{\text{comp}}\) records are expressed as the differences between the \(^{10}\)Be\(_{\text{con}}\) and \(^{10}\)Be\(_{\text{environment}}\) time series (Fig. 4).

Calculated \(^{10}\)Be\(_{\text{comp}}\) time series from TSK and JC sediments yield modified trends but similar multi-decadal variability as the original \(^{10}\)Be\(_{\text{con}}\) records during the Maunder (TSK: \(r = 0.84, \ p < 0.01\); JC: \(r = 0.91, \ p < 0.01\)), Home-
Significant contributions of Ca to the multi-regressions as well as significant negative correlations with $^{10}$Be for TSK ($r = -0.68$, $p < 0.01$) and JC ($r = -0.62$, $p < 0.01$) might point to a reduced affinity of $^{10}$Be for Ca (Figs. 2 and 3). A similar behavior was detected in studies about $^{10}$Be scavenging from the marine realm (Aldahan and Possnert, 1998; Chase et al., 2002, Simon et al., 2016).

5.2 $^{10}$Be$_{comp}$ and group sunspot numbers

To evaluate the preservation of the cosmogenic radionuclide production signal based on observational data, the $^{10}$Be$_{comp}$ time series from TSK and JC were compared with a group sunspot number record reaching back to 340 a BP (AD 1610) (Svalgaard and Schatten, 2016) (Fig. 5). Since sunspot and cosmogenic radionuclide records reflect different components of the heliomagnetic field (closed and open magnetic flux), no perfect correlation is expected (Muscheler et al., 2016). Nevertheless, a comparison of a $^{14}$C based solar activity reconstruction with group sunspot data points to a largely linear relationship between both types of data (Muscheler et al., 2016).

Variations in the $^{10}$Be$_{comp}$ records from TSK and JC resemble multi-decadal to centennial variability in the group sunspot number time series with the highest values around the Maunder Minimum (Fig. 5). Secondary $^{10}$Be$_{comp}$ maxima in TSK and JC sediments broadly coincide with the Dalton Minimum and solar activity minimum around 30 a BP (AD 1920) (Fig. 5). In JC sediments, the $^{10}$Be$_{comp}$ excursion from $-50$ to $0$ a BP (AD 2000–1950) without an expression in the group sunspot number record as well as the about 20-year delayed Maunder Minimum response could be explained by transport of “old” $^{10}$Be from the littoral to the coring site (see details on the sub-layer of resuspended littoral sediments in JC varves back to 2800 a BP in Sect. 5.3) and/or spatially inhomogeneous $^{10}$Be deposition patterns (Fig. 5).

www.clim-past.net/14/687/2018/ Clim. Past, 14, 687–696, 2018
5.3 Synchronizing TSK and JC $^{10}$Be with IntCal13 $^{14}$C

Shared variance of $^{10}$Be and $^{14}$C records can be interpreted in terms common changes in cosmogenic radionuclide production (Czymzik et al., 2016a; Muscheler et al., 2014). Moreover, it provides the opportunity to synchronize cosmogenic radionuclide records from different archives (Adolphi and Muscheler, 2016). Lag-correlation analyses were performed to synchronize the TSK and JC $^{10}$Be$_{\text{comp}}$ records covering the Maunder, Homeric and 5500 a BP grand solar minima with $^{14}$C production rates from the IntCal13 calibration curve (Muscheler et al., 2014).

Best fits with IntCal13 $^{14}$C production rates were obtained when the $^{10}$Be$_{\text{comp}}$ records from TSK were shifted by 8$-12$/ + 4 years (Maunder Minimum; $r = 0.47$, $p < 0.1$), 31$-16$/+12 years (Homeric Minimum; $r = 0.68$, $p = 0.01$) and 86$-22$/+18 years (5500 a BP grand solar minimum; $r = 0.37$, $p < 0.05$) towards the past (Fig. 6). All three best fits occur within the given chronological uncertainties of ±17 years (Maunder Minimum), ±139 years (Homeric Minimum) and ±74 years (5500 a BP grand solar minimum) (Fig. 6). The on average < 10-year resolution of the varve-based sedimentation rate chronology for TSK sediments during the Maunder Minimum due to non-varved intervals does not affect our analyses conducted on records at 20-year resolution.

The best fit between the $^{10}$Be$_{\text{comp}}$ record from JC sediments during the 5500 a BP grand solar minimum and IntCal13 $^{14}$C production rates ($r = 0.81$, $p < 0.01$) was determined when the $^{10}$Be record was shifted for 29$-8$/+7 years towards present (within the given chronological uncertainty of ±56 years) (Fig. 6). No significant correlations between the $^{10}$Be$_{\text{comp}}$ records from JC and $^{14}$C production rates were obtained for the Maunder and Homeric minima, within the respective varve counting uncertainties of ±4 and ±29 years (Fig. 6). This lack of significant correlation might be explained by a change in sedimentation at about 2800 a BP (Fig. 6). Since that time JC varves include an additional sub-layer of littoral calcite and diatoms transported to the profundal by wave driven water turbulences in fall. Presumably, the resuspended material also contains “old” $^{10}$Be inhibiting the clear detection of the expected $^{10}$Be production signal (Fig. 6). Since the $^{10}$Be signal present in the resuspended sediments is unknown, this uncertainty is difficult to correct for. Comparable influences of sediment resuspension were also found in a sample from an annually resolved $^{10}$Be record from JC sediments covering the period AD 2009–1988 (Czymzik et al., 2015). A varve with an exceptionally thick (3.7 mm) layer of resuspended littoral diatoms and calcite deposited in fall 2003 reveals anomalous $^{10}$Be concentrations (Czymzik et al., 2015).

6 Conclusions

Detecting and aligning the common cosmogenic radionuclide production variations allows the synchronization of $^{10}$Be time series from TSK sediments covering the Maunder, Homeric and 5500 a BP grand solar minima and JC sediments for the 5500 a BP grand solar minimum to IntCal13 $^{14}$C production rates. These synchronizations provide a novel type of time marker for varied lake sediment archives enabling improved chronologies and robust investigations of proxy responses to climate variations. Mismatches between $^{10}$Be in JC sediments and $^{14}$C production rates during the Maunder and Homeric minima are likely associated with in-lake resuspension of “old” $^{10}$Be, altering the expected $^{10}$Be production signal.

Data availability. The $^{10}$Be data connected to this study have been submitted to the PANGAEA open access data library.

The Supplement related to this article is available online at https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-14-687-2018-supplement.

Competing interests. The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

Acknowledgements. Markus Czymzik was financed by a German Science Foundation Research Fellowship (DFG grants CZ 227/1-1 and CZ 227/1-2). Further financial support was provided through an Endowment of the Royal Physiographic Society in Lund, a Linnaeus grant to Lund University (Lucci) and the Swedish Research Council (Dnr: 2013-8421). Florian Adolphi is supported by the Swedish Research Council (VR grant: 4.1-2016-00218). Ala Aldahan thanks the UAEU for support through UPAR funding. This study is a contribution to the Virtual Institute of Integrated Climate and Landscape Evolution Analyses (ICLEA) grant number VH-VI-415, the “BaltRap” network of the Leibniz association (The Baltic Sea and its southern lowlands: Proxy-environment interactions in times of rapid changes) and the climate initiative REKLIM Topic 8 “Abrupt climate change derived from proxy data” of the Helmholtz Association. We thank Inger Påhlsson for the extraction of $^{10}$Be from sediment samples. $^{10}$Be data from TSK and JC are available at the PANGAEA data library (www.pangaea.de). Quentin Simon and an anonymous reviewer are acknowledged for their constructive comments which helped to improve the manuscript.

The article processing charges for this open-access publication were covered by a Research Centre of the Helmholtz Association.

Edited by: Zhengtang Guo
Reviewed by: Quentin Simon and one anonymous referee
References


www.clim-past.net/14/687/2018/ Clim. Past, 14, 687–696, 2018


