

Helmholtz-Zentrum

Helmholtz-Zentrum Potsdam DEUTSCHES GEOFORSCHUNGSZENTRUM

Baldini, J. U. L., Lechleitner, F. A., Breitenbach, S. F.
M., van Hunen, J., Baldini, L. M., Wynn, P. M.,
Jamieson, R. A., Ridley, H. E., Baker, A. J., Walczak, I.
W., Fohlmeister, J. (2021): Detecting and
quantifying palaeoseasonality in stalagmites using
geochemical and modelling approaches. Quaternary Science Reviews, 254, 106784.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2020.106784

# 1 Detecting and quantifying palaeoseasonality in stalagmites using geochemical

## 2 and modelling approaches

3 James U.L. Baldini<sup>1</sup>, Franziska A. Lechleitner<sup>2, 3</sup>, Sebastian F.M. Breitenbach<sup>4</sup>, Jeroen van

4 Hunen<sup>1</sup>, Lisa M. Baldini<sup>5</sup>, Peter M. Wynn<sup>6</sup>, Robert A. Jamieson<sup>7</sup>, Harriet E. Ridley<sup>1</sup>, Alex J.

5 Baker<sup>8</sup>, Izabela W. Walczak<sup>9</sup>, and Jens Fohlmeister<sup>10, 11</sup>

- <sup>6</sup> <sup>1</sup>Department of Earth Sciences, Durham University, DH1 3LE, United Kingdom.
- <sup>7</sup> <sup>2</sup>Department of Earth Sciences, University of Oxford, South Parks Road, Oxford OX1 3AN,
- 8 United Kingdom.
- 9 <sup>3</sup>Laboratory for the Analysis of Radiocarbon with AMS (LARA), Department of Chemistry and
- 10 Biochemistry, and Oeschger Centre for Climate Change Research, University of Bern,
- 11 Freiestrasse 3, 3012 Bern, Switzerland.
- 12 <sup>4</sup>Department of Geography and Environmental Sciences, Northumbria University,
- 13 Newcastle upon Tyne, NE1 8ST, United Kingdom.
- <sup>5</sup>School of Health & Life Sciences, Teesside University, Middlesbrough, TS1 3BX, United
   Kingdom
- <sup>6</sup>Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University, Lancaster, LA1 4YQ, United Kingdom.
- <sup>17</sup> <sup>7</sup>School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds, Leeds, LS2 9JT, United Kingdom
- 18 <sup>8</sup>National Centre for Atmospheric Science and Department of Meteorology, University of
- 19 Reading, RG6 6BB, United Kingdom.
- <sup>9</sup>Durham Centre for Academic Development, Durham University, Durham, DH1 1TA, United
   Kingdom.
- <sup>10</sup>Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research, Telegrafenberg, 14473 Potsdam, Germany.
- <sup>23</sup> <sup>11</sup>GFZ German Research Centre for Geosciences, Section 'Climate Dynamics and Landscape
- 24 Development', Telegrafenberg, 14473 Potsdam, Germany.

25

26

#### 28 Abstract

29 Stalagmites are an extraordinarily powerful resource for the reconstruction of climatological 30 palaeoseasonality. Here, we provide a comprehensive review of different types of 31 seasonality preserved by stalagmites and methods for extracting this information. A new drip classification scheme is introduced, which facilitates the identification of stalagmites 32 fed by seasonally responsive drips and which highlights the wide variability in drip types 33 34 feeding stalagmites. This hydrological variability, combined with seasonality in Earth 35 atmospheric processes, meteoric precipitation, biological processes within the soil, and cave 36 atmosphere composition means that every stalagmite retains a different and distinct (but correct) record of environmental conditions. Replication of a record is extremely useful but 37 38 should not be expected unless comparing stalagmites affected by the same processes in the same proportion. A short overview of common microanalytical techniques is presented, and 39 40 suggested best practice discussed. In addition to geochemical methods, a new modelling technique for extracting meteoric precipitation and temperature palaeoseasonality from 41 42 stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O data is discussed and tested with both synthetic and real-world datasets. Finally, world maps of temperature, meteoric precipitation amount, and meteoric 43 precipitation oxygen isotope ratio seasonality are presented and discussed, with an aim of 44 45 helping to identify regions most sensitive to shifts in seasonality.

46

## 47 **1. Introduction**

48 Over the past few decades stalagmites have become one of the most important terrestrial
49 archives of climate and environmental change. Their widespread distribution, amenability to

radiometric dating, and capacity for retaining seasonal- to decadal-scale environmental 50 51 information have made them indispensable archives for a wide variety of climate information, most commonly rainfall or temperature variability. The field has developed rapidly, and it is 52 now clear that stalagmites generally do not record a single climate parameter (e.g., cave 53 54 temperature, rainfall amount, etc.) exclusively, but instead record a combination of 55 processes. It is increasingly acknowledged that every stalagmite contains a robust history of some aspect of environmental change. The issue is one of complexity; generally speaking, the 56 57 stalagmite with the least complex signal is considered the ideal. Records generated from stalagmites with more complex stratigraphies, whose drip flow route changes through time, 58 or that are influenced by numerous environmental processes, often prove more difficult to 59 interpret. Some stalagmite records may miss short-lived climate excursions because they are 60 fed by drips that do not respond to the transient climate forcing in question. Others might 61 62 lose sensitivity or respond non-linearly to a climate forcing; for example, a stalagmite might 63 record droughts faithfully, but miss exceptionally wet intervals when the epikarst (the highly 64 fractured transition zone between soil and bedrock) is saturated with water. To exacerbate the issue further, most published stalagmite records lack the requisite analytical resolution to 65 detect palaeoseasonality, an aspect of the climate signal that is increasingly recognised as 66 critical to the interpretation of geochemical records from stalagmites (Baldini et al., 2019; 67 Morellón et al., 2009; Moreno et al., 2017). In other words, the desired climate signal is often 68 compromised by: i) inherent complexities associated with the hydrological transfer of the 69 climate signal to the stalagmite, ii) overprinting of the desired climate-driven signal by other 70 environmental variables, and iii) bias introduced via the necessarily selective sampling of the 71 72 stalagmite for analysis. The challenge for palaeoclimatologists is to extract and correctly 73 interpret the desired climate signal from a stalagmite, bearing these complexities in mind.

74 The detection of a seasonality signal within a stalagmite can greatly help interpret all datasets from a stalagmite sample, of any temporal resolution. For example, the detection of a 75 seasonal geochemical cycle can contribute to chronological models (Baldini et al., 2002; 76 77 Carlson et al., 2018; Ridley et al., 2015b), in some cases permitting the development of high-78 precision chronologies over extended time intervals (Ban et al., 2018; Carlson et al., 2018; 79 Duan et al., 2015; Nagra et al., 2017; Ridley et al., 2015b; Smith et al., 2009). Unlike most 80 other laminated records (e.g., tree rings, ice cores), high-precision radiometric dates can 81 anchor stalagmite layer count chronologies, reducing accumulated counting errors. Proxy information from laminated stalagmites can be linked to environmental variability at seasonal 82 83 resolution (Mattey et al., 2010; Orland et al., 2019; Ridley et al., 2015b), allowing much needed insights into past climatic dynamics that are difficult to obtain otherwise. 84

The fact that stalagmites can reveal palaeoseasonality, a notoriously difficult climate 85 86 parameter to reconstruct, is critical for identifying wholesale shifts in climate belts. For example, monthly-scale geochemical data from a stalagmite has detected variability in the 87 88 Intertropical Convergence Zone influence on rainfall seasonality in Central America over the 89 last two millennia (Asmerom et al., 2020) and the shift from a maritime to a more continental 90 climate in western Ireland in the early Holocene (Baldini et al., 2002), transitions which must 91 otherwise be inferred using annual- to centennial-resolution data (e.g., Breitenbach et al., 92 2019). High spatial resolution approaches yielding palaeoseasonality can distinguish rainfall 93 occurring at different times of the year, for example, monsoonal rainfall versus dry season rainfall (Ban et al., 2018; Ronay et al., 2019), providing a wealth of information unattainable 94 95 by other means.

96 Seasonality is one of climate's most important aspects, and this is reflected in the basic 97 subdivisions of the Köppen system, the most commonly used climate classification scheme (Köppen, 1918; Peel et al., 2007). Reconstructing past seasonality is not only relevant for pure 98 palaeoclimatological studies, but also for palaeobotany and archaeology, and for establishing 99 100 a benchmark by which to compare recent changes in seasonality during the Anthropocene; recent research suggests seasonality in rainfall (e.g., Feng et al., 2013) and temperature (e.g., 101 Santer et al., 2018) are shifting under modern climate change. This is particularly concerning 102 103 because changing seasonality has had broad ecological and social implications in the past. For example, human dispersal through Asia was limited more by water availability than by 104 temperature, and likely followed habitable corridors with favourable rainfall seasonality (Li et 105 al., 2019; Parton et al., 2015; Taylor et al., 2018). Also, the domestication and dispersal of 106 crops are linked to rainfall seasonality because optimal growth conditions depend on 107 108 hydrological conditions. In the Fertile Crescent, barley and wheat were sown in autumn, 109 because in this semi-arid region the winter rains are the limiting factor for their prosperity (Spengler, 2019). Similarly, abundant evidence now exists that variability in seasonal rainfall 110 111 has played a key role in the waxing and waning of major civilisations (Hsiang et al., 2013; Kennett et al., 2012). 112

Despite the clear importance of reconstructing palaeoseasonality, it is rarely directly observable in climate proxy records. The obfuscation of seasonality by undersampling or aliasing is often a consequence of logical and pragmatic choices designed to maximise returns from available resources. Ideally, analyses would resolve nearly the full climate signal residing within every stalagmite, but this is neither logistically (given the time and funding required) nor realistically (given that the karst system transmutes the signal) possible.

119 Here we review both the advantages of obtaining palaeoseasonality information and methods for its reconstruction using stalagmite geochemistry and modelling, as well as common issues 120 121 in extracting this information. A short review of the history of speleothem science and 122 techniques frames the discussion and highlights how speleothems have become the premier archives for annual- to sub-annual scale terrestrial climate reconstructions, particularly during 123 the Quaternary. We also suggest a methodology to maximise the likelihood of successfully 124 125 extracting palaeoseasonality information from a stalagmite, including evaluating the 126 hydrological characteristics of the drip feeding a stalagmite sample prior to collection, modelling palaeoseasonality from lower resolution data, and determining the seasonality of 127 128 the climate at (and in regions near) the site.

129

#### 130 **2. Background and technique development**

Very early studies demonstrated the potential of stalagmites to record climate information 131 132 (Allison, 1923, 1926; Broecker, 1960; Orr, 1952). However, the real growth in the application of stalagmites as climate archives occurred after the convergence of Thermal Ionisation Mass 133 Spectrometry (TIMS) uranium-thorium dating of stalagmites in the 1990s (e.g., Edwards et al., 134 1987; Edwards and Gallup, 1993) (which allowed accurate dating) and high resolution 135 sampling techniques in the 2000s (permitting the reconstruction of climate on sub-decadal 136 timescales). The subsequent development and proliferation of multi-collector inductively 137 coupled plasma mass spectrometry (MC-ICP-MS) permitted extraordinarily robust (precise 138 139 and accurate) chronological control (e.g., Cheng et al., 2013; Hellstrom, 2003; Hoffmann et 140 al., 2007), while the development of a variety of microanalytical techniques provided climate proxy information of an unparalleled temporal resolution. The realisation in the late 1990s 141

(Roberts et al., 1998) and early 2000s that stalagmite carbonate trace element compositions
and isotope ratios often vary seasonally (Baldini et al., 2002; Fairchild et al., 2000; McMillan
et al., 2005; Treble et al., 2003; Treble et al., 2005b) opened the door to the investigation of
palaeoseasonality on an unprecedented level.

146

#### 147 **2.1.** Increasing resolution of analysis

148 Immense technical progress has facilitated the transition from the first speleothem studies, which broadly placed periods of speleothem growth into the global climatic context (Harmon, 149 150 1979; Hendy and Wilson, 1968; Thompson et al., 1975), to studies adopting increasingly detailed sub-annual resolution sampling (Fairchild et al., 2001; Johnson et al., 2006; Liu et al., 151 152 2013; Mattey et al., 2008; Maupin et al., 2014; Myers et al., 2015; Ridley et al., 2015b; Ronay 153 et al., 2019; Treble et al., 2005a). Methodological developments, particularly after the mid-2000s and particularly with respect to trace element analysis, greatly reduced the required 154 155 sample size and increased measurement precision. This included the widespread adoption of 156 micromilling techniques (Spötl and Mattey, 2006), laser ablation (Müller et al., 2009; Treble 157 et al., 2003), secondary ionisation mass spectrometry (Baldini et al., 2002; Fairchild et al., 2001; Finch et al., 2001; Kolodny et al., 2003; Orland et al., 2008, 2009), and the development 158 of protocols for stable carbon and oxygen isotope measurements with reduced sample sizes 159 160 (Breitenbach and Bernasconi, 2011), including cold-trap methods capable of analysing less than 5 µg of carbonate powders (Vonhof et al., 2020). 161

Here, we apply the recently compiled Speleothem Isotope Synthesis and Analysis (SISAL)
database v1b (Atsawawaranunt et al., 2018; Comas-Bru et al., 2019) to document the

evolution of speleothem stable isotope record resolution. SISAL was created with the primary objective of providing access to a comprehensive repository of published stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O records to the palaeoclimate community and for climate model evaluation (Comas-Bru and Harrison, 2019; Comas-Bru et al., 2019). SISALv1b contains 455 speleothem records (i.e., SISAL 'entities') from 211 globally distributed caves published since 1992 (Comas-Bru et al., 2019). More than half the records (264) included in the database cover at least portions of the last 10,000 years.

To investigate how stable isotope record resolution has evolved over the last three decades, we extracted all records from the database and calculated their temporal resolution as the absolute difference between two consecutive samples. Hiatuses and gaps in the individual records were excluded from the analysis, as these would have erroneously suggested much lower resolution than that actually present. In a second step, we performed the same calculation, considering only Holocene records.

177 The analysis reveals how the number of speleothem stable isotope records steadily increased 178 with publication year (Figure 1), highlighting the increased popularity of speleothem science 179 over the past three decades. A trend of increasing temporal resolution with time becomes 180 apparent after binning all records published in the same year and calculating their mean resolution (Figure 1). This trend becomes even clearer when only Holocene records are 181 182 considered, with a particularly striking increase in resolution over recent years (post-2010) (records pre-2010: mean resolution = 50.1 years, STDEV = 38.9 years; records between 2010 183 184 and 2018: mean resolution = 16.5 years, STDEV = 7.4 years), and is likely related to the 185 widespread adoption of microanalytical advances. Additionally, a record's resolution will typically depend on the time period covered by the record; in general, resolution is higher in 186

Holocene records compared to the full dataset, which includes older records as well. This 187 partly arises because of greater availability of independent data and information on climate 188 189 conditions during more recent time intervals, thus requiring higher resolution records to 190 tackle relevant research questions. It may also be partially due to typically lower growth rates 191 during the last glaciation compared to the Holocene. However, overall, only nine of the records in SISALv1b have resolution <0.5 years, directly allowing for investigations of 192 paleoseasonality. This highlights the difficulties often encountered with conventional 193 194 sampling techniques, as this compilation only includes stable isotope records, and does not consider other methods (e.g., laser ablation trace element analysis), which can generate 195 higher resolution time-series. The increasing resolution possible via technological 196 developments has largely involved the analysis of trace elements, whereas stable isotope 197 analysis still predominantly relies on micromilling or drilling techniques. 198

199

#### 200 **2.2.** Transition from temperature to rainfall amount to seasonality

Early speleothem palaeoclimate studies focused on using  $\delta^{18}$ O to generate quantitative cave 201 202 temperature records (Gascoyne et al., 1980; Hendy and Wilson, 1968; Lauritzen, 1995; 203 Lauritzen and Lundberg, 1999), based on the insight that oxygen isotope fractionation during 204 carbonate deposition is temperature dependent (Epstein et al., 1951; O'Neil et al., 1969), and 205 building on similar work on marine carbonates (Emiliani, 1955). It was quickly recognised however that speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O is a complex mixed signal reflecting variations in cave 206 temperature, changes in dripwater isotope composition, and various kinetic effects, which 207 severely hamper the use of this proxy for quantitative temperature reconstructions 208 (McDermott, 2004). The subsequent shift in how speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O is interpreted led to its 209

establishment as a proxy for past hydroclimate changes, including atmospheric circulation,
regional temperature, moisture source dynamics, and amount of precipitation (Lachniet,
2009).

213 At the same time, the toolkit of geochemical proxies available to speleothem researchers 214 continued to expand. In particular, trace element concentrations in speleothem carbonate 215 emerged as tracers for numerous processes, from surface productivity to karst hydrology and 216 transport (Borsato et al., 2007; Fairchild et al., 2001; Huang and Fairchild, 2001; Treble et al., 217 2005a). The combination of multiple proxies measured on the same speleothem provided a 218 means to disentangle complexities regarding mixed signals in individual proxies and allowed a progressively deeper understanding of the archive and the associated processes in soil, 219 220 karst, atmosphere, and cave. In tandem with these developments regarding the climate proxy 221 development, monitoring of cave and local atmospheric conditions became increasingly 222 important, as it was recognised that understanding sometimes highly localised controls on geochemical signatures is crucial for their interpretation (Genty, 2008; Mattey et al., 2008; 223 224 Mattey et al., 2010; Spötl et al., 2005; Verheyden et al., 2008).

225 The presence of annual petrographic cyclicity within stalagmites was recognised very early on (Allison, 1926). The later identification of visible and luminescent annual banding (Baker et 226 al., 1993; Broecker, 1960; Shopov et al., 1994) underscored that the deposition, mineralogy, 227 228 and chemical composition of speleothems varied seasonally. However, the concept of seasonal shifts in climate variables (e.g., temperature, precipitation) as contributing to the 229 230 net multi-annual climate signal did not gain traction until the early to mid-2000s (Wang et al., 2001). Cave monitoring revealed drip rate seasonality in Pere Noel Cave, Belgium (Genty and 231 Deflandre, 1998), Crag Cave, Ireland (Baldini et al., 2006), and in Soreq Cave, Israel (Ayalon et 232

233 al., 1998), and seasonality was discussed within the context of a speleothem-based trace 234 element study at Grotta di Ernesto, Italy (Huang et al., 2001). Meteorological data were 235 compared to seasonal trace element data for an Australian stalagmite (Treble et al., 2003), 236 and the potential to use seasonal-scale geochemical data to reconstruct the East Asian 237 Summer Monsoon (EASM) was investigated using a stalagmite from Heshang Cave, China (Johnson et al., 2006). Studies coupling cave environmental monitoring and 'farmed' 238 239 carbonate precipitates were critical for clarifying the links between hydrological and cave 240 atmosphere conditions on the chemistry of stalagmites, including at a seasonal scale (Czuppon et al., 2018; Moerman et al., 2014; Sherwin and Baldini, 2011; Tremaine et al., 241 242 2011). Drip monitoring was also key for establishing how cave hydrology attenuates seasonal and interannual rainfall variability, and was used to predict ENSO variability preservation 243 within stalagmites (Chen and Li, 2018; Moerman et al., 2014). These studies all illustrate that 244 245 a thorough understanding of annual geochemical cycles requires the development of 246 extensive cave monitoring records, which highlight the complexities inherent in signal 247 transfer from surface environment to the stalagmite.

248

## 249 **2.3.** Importance of monitoring for understanding the seasonal signal

250 Monitoring environmental conditions in and above a cave at a high temporal resolution 251 greatly improves the accuracy of palaeoclimate interpretations derived from stalagmites. 252 Linking proxy characteristics at a given site with current environmental conditions via 253 monitoring is relevant for reconstructing past conditions. Although modern conditions may 254 differ from ancient conditions, monitoring the cave environment clarifies processes operating 255 at a site, including the timing and extent of ventilation and the general nature of a

hydrological signal, acknowledging that some hydrological re-routing may have occurredthrough time for certain drip types.

Understanding a stalagmite geochemical proxy record is difficult without first understanding how that signal is transferred and altered from the external environment to the sample. Environmental changes affecting the seasonal signal fall under four main categories: *i) Earth atmospheric, ii) meteoric precipitation, iii) biological* (e.g., soil processes), and *iv) cave atmospheric.* 

**Earth atmospheric** processes affect the seasonality signal retained within stalagmites by influencing meteoric precipitation isotope ratios at the cave site. Possibly the most common atmospheric process is the seasonal variation in precipitation  $\delta^{18}$ O induced by shifts in the temperature-dependent water vapour-meteoric precipitation fractionation factor. Other related changes in atmospheric processing include seasonal shifts in moisture source and pathway of the moisture package to the cave site, as, for example, in monsoonal settings.

269 *Meteoric precipitation* variability regards the nature of the primary rainfall amount-derived 270 seasonality signal. Here we include meteoric precipitation amount and seasonal distribution 271 as separate from 'Earth atmospheric' processes (such as changes in moisture source), 272 although clearly the latter affect the former. Meteoric precipitation is a fundamental control 273 on stalagmite seasonality that is worth considering independently of other atmospheric 274 processes. Stalagmites deposited in monsoonal climates (e.g., the East Asian Summer 275 Monsoon, Indian Summer Monsoon, South American Monsoon, and Australian Summer Monsoon) with distinct wet and dry seasons are excellent examples of samples whose 276 277 geochemistry generally (but not always) responds to hydrologic seasonality. In temperate 278 mid-latitude settings with more evenly distributed rainfall, hydrological shifts might record

less seasonal than inter-annual (e.g., ENSO) dynamics or possess a seasonal bias (see section
3.1) derived from effective infiltration dynamics.

281 **Biological (soil-derived)** seasonality is the least clearly defined control, and predominantly 282 affects the trace element composition and carbon isotope ratio of cave percolation waters. However, evidence also exists that increased soil bioproductivity can affect oxygen isotope 283 ratios by preferential uptake of water during the growing season during intervals with 284 285 substantial surface vegetation (Baldini et al., 2005). Trace element transport critically 286 depends on the biological activity and water supply, both factors that are inherently variable 287 and not necessarily in-phase. Hydrology can affect biological seasonality, as leaching of organic matter and trace elements from freshly decomposed litter depends on excess 288 289 infiltration. Soils may thus produce a wet season pulse of colloidal material (organics as well as weathering products) which contributes to an annual peak in trace element concentrations 290 291 in some samples; such dynamics are highly site-specific. The evidence for this pulse is derived both from synchrotron-based stalagmite studies (e.g., Borsato et al., 2007) and daily-scale 292 293 automated dripwater collection schemes (Baldini et al., 2012). Treble et al. (2003) suggest 294 phosphorous enrichment in stalagmite carbonate stemming from seasonal infiltration pulses, and monitoring at Shihua Cave (China) revealed that organic carbon was transported during 295 296 the wet season (Ban et al., 2018; Tan et al., 2006). Whether this pulse is truly independent 297 from hydrological variability is unclear, but some evidence from dripwater monitoring in 298 temperate Irish caves suggests that the seasonal trace element pulse is not associated with increased autumnal water throughput, but rather with seasonal vegetation die-back (Baldini 299 et al., 2012). In monsoonal north-eastern India biologically-induced litter decomposition 300 301 reaches a maximum in early summer (Ramakrishnan and Subhash, 1988), which increases

element availability in the soil that can be leached during the entire wet season (Khiewtam
and Ramakrishnan, 1993). Trace element transport may also hinge directly on the presence
of natural organic matter in dripwater, which may link the dripwater directly to surface
bioproductivity (Hartland et al., 2012; Hartland et al., 2011). Thus, biological seasonality is
highly site-specific and likely variable through time; this and the complexities outlined above,
underscore the importance of dripwater monitoring campaigns.

308 *Cave atmospheric* variability can also impart a seasonal signal to a stalagmite geochemical 309 record. Seasonal changes in cave air mixing with outside air lead to conditions within the cave 310 that lower cave air carbon dioxide partial pressure  $(pCO_2)$  and potentially even contribute to dripwater evaporation, promoting calcite deposition. Cave atmosphere variability, induced by 311 312 ventilation (through thermal gradients or changing wind patterns) therefore affects the calcite deposition seasonality, as well as kinetic fractionation amount. Excellent examples of 313 314 caves whose stalagmites are affected by this variability include New St. Michael's Cave (Gibraltar) (Mattey et al., 2016; Mattey et al., 2010) and numerous caves in Central Texas 315 316 (Banner et al., 2007; Breecker et al., 2012; Cowan et al., 2013; Wong et al., 2011). These effects are discussed in detail below (Section 3). 317

318

#### 319 **3. Issues inherent to speleothem-based high-resolution climate reconstructions**

Detecting any seasonal component in a stalagmite climate signal includes quantifying growth rate and input signal seasonality. It is worth noting that the input signal is sometimes unexpected, and a thorough site monitoring scheme can help identify the main contributing factors. For example, although many trace element ratios (and particularly Mg/Ca) are

324 affected by recharge (often via prior calcite precipitation (PCP) mechanisms (Fairchild and 325 Treble, 2009)), other factors can also influence (seasonal) stalagmite geochemistry. This is the case at ATM Cave, Belize, where various trace element/calcium ratios (including Mg/Ca) 326 327 increase in concentration at the beginning of the annual rainy season, and are probably linked 328 to dry deposition during the preceding dry season followed by transport to the stalagmite with the onset of the rainy season (Jamieson et al., 2015). In other cases, the advection of 329 atmospheric aerosols directly into the cave can affect the stalagmite trace element signal 330 331 (Dredge et al., 2013). Seasonal non-deposition caused by either drying of the feeder drip or by seasonally high cave air  $pCO_2$  can bias any record where every data point integrates more 332 333 than a few months of deposition. From this perspective, most stalagmite records include palaeoseasonality information to some extent, but, without appropriate monitoring 334 strategies in place, deconvolving the extent to which the shifting seasonal signal dominates 335 336 the overall record is difficult.

337

#### 338 **3.1. Mixing within the aquifer**

The degree of recharge mixing within the aquifer and epikarst is a fundamental control on the preservation of a seasonality signal within stalagmites. A long residence time and/or thorough mixing within the overlying aquifer can greatly attenuate any hydrological seasonal signal, and understanding the hydrology feeding a cave drip is therefore critical (Atkinson, 1977; Ayalon et al., 1998; Baker et al., 1997; Baker and Brunsdon, 2003; Baker et al., 2019; Kaufman et al., 2003). For conservation and logistical reasons, monitoring and classification of the drip should ideally occur prior to sampling a stalagmite.

Smart and Friedrich (1987) undertook one of the earliest efforts to comprehensively 346 categorise cave drips. Their scheme involved measuring drip rates at G.B. Cave, in the Mendip 347 Hills, UK, and parameterising them by plotting maximum drip rate versus the coefficient of 348 349 variation (C.V.; the standard deviation divided by the mean multiplied by 100). Baker et al. 350 (1997) later modified the scheme, dividing drips into six categories (seepage flow, seasonal drip, percolation stream, shaft flow, vadose flow, subcutaneous flow). Other classification 351 352 schemes (e.g., Arbel et al., 2010; Arbel et al., 2008) focussed on analysing drip hydrographs, 353 and suggested terminology such as 'post-storm', 'seasonal', 'perennial', and 'overflow', which are broadly consistent with the categories introduced by Smart and Friedrich (1987). The 354 355 introduction of automated drip loggers revolutionised the field (Mattey and Collister, 2008), partly by ensuring that short-lived hydrological events were not missed. This ensured a 356 substantially more robust characterisation of drips than that possible via manually measuring 357 358 drip rates only during on-site visits.

359 Understanding the hydrology feeding a stalagmite is fundamental for determining if a 360 stalagmite retains a seasonal signal. Drip rate is controlled by surface processes (e.g., meteoric precipitation, evaporation, soil moisture capacity, and susceptibility to runoff) and 361 aquifer characteristics including reservoir capacity and bedrock permeability (Markowska et 362 363 al., 2015; Treble et al., 2013). Bedrock pathways recharging a drip are broadly divisible into diffuse (or 'matrix'), fracture, and conduit flows (Ayalon et al., 1998; Baker et al., 1997; Perrin 364 365 et al., 2003; Smart and Friedrich, 1987), and recent models suggest that many drips are a 366 combination of diffuse and fracture flow. Diffuse permeability typically refers to either the primary intra-granular bedrock permeability or to secondary permeability along fine 367 fractures, and is characterised by a slow response to precipitation events and a large reservoir 368 369 capacity (Atkinson, 1977; Smart and Friedrich, 1987). Fracture permeability relates to

370 potentially solution-enlarged bedding plane partings and joints and is characterised by a rapid 371 to intermediate response to precipitation events, and a low to moderate storage capacity. 372 Conduit permeability refers to often solutionally-enlarged pipe-like openings >1 cm in 373 diameter (Atkinson, 1977; Smart and Friedrich, 1987). Such conduit flow is characterised by a 374 rapid response to storm events followed by a rapid return to baseline flow (Baldini et al., 2006), and often carries chemically aggressive waters that do not allow secondary carbonate 375 376 deposition. Large conduits or bedding planes may intersect a network of more diffuse 377 hydrological pathways, leading to dual-component flow where the fracture is itself fed by some diffuse recharge in addition to the fracture flow. The hydrologic permeability of the 378 379 fracture flow component compared to the diffuse flow component essentially defines the drip type; 100% diffuse flow would exhibit no response to storm events, whereas 100% fracture 380 flow would usually have no drip except for immediately following storm events large enough 381 382 to activate the pathway (Figure 2). Most drips would fall along the spectrum between these 383 two endmembers; a constant base drip (the diffuse flow component) combined with a variably rapid response to storm events (the fracture flow component). 384

385 From a seasonality perspective, pure fracture-flow drips vary considerably seasonally but may experience occasional dripwater undersaturation and/or drying, and consequently the 386 resultant stalagmite could have abundant 'crypto-hiatuses' (hiatuses in growth too brief to 387 leave a clear petrographic expression, or appear in chronological models (Stoll et al., 2015), 388 389 also referred to as 'microhiatuses' (Baker et al., 2014; Moseley et al., 2015)). We suggest that 390 if these hiatuses are demonstrably seasonally, 'seasonal hiatus' is appropriate terminology. Drips characterised by 100% diffuse flow would be stable with little hydrological or biological 391 seasonality. Although the likelihood for seasonal hiatuses or drying is low for stalagmites fed 392 393 by diffuse flow, the seasonal signal is probably muted, unless at a site where the seasonal

signal is controlled by a forcing other than hydrological variability (see Section 2.4.). The optimal hydrology for imparting seasonality onto a stalagmite is a drip fed by moderately diffuse flow that is responsive to monthly-scale shifts in rainfall, but that does not have a substantial fracture component to transmit event-scale (and possibly undersaturated) water.

398

#### **399 3.2.** Non-deposition and seasonal bias in samples

400 Although growth hiatuses lasting longer than a few years are often (but not always) apparent within stalagmites as horizons of detrital material followed by competitive growth of 401 carbonate crystals (Broughton, 1983), brief growth hiatuses occurring seasonally are often 402 403 undetectable (though occasionally they have a petrographic manifestation). Thus, the 404 existence of these seasonal hiatuses is often inferred by applying monitoring data to isolate 405 intervals through the year where environmental conditions suggest temporary non-406 deposition could exist. Because drip rate is one of the fundamental controls on stalagmite 407 growth (Genty et al., 2001), the use of drip loggers to detect seasonal drying of the stalagmite 408 feeder drip is important for understanding whether a stalagmite record excludes a certain 409 season's climate information.

Additionally, careful examination of sample petrography can reveal important insights into the nature of the climate signal retained by a stalagmite. Petrographic microscopy helps in identifying growth interruptions caused by lack of water, and dissolution features caused by undersaturated dripwater. An excellent example of this approach exists for Holocene stalagmites from northern Spain (Railsback et al., 2011; Railsback et al., 2017); the analysis reveals horizons of dissolution (termed Type 'E' surfaces), interpreted as reflecting occasional

undersaturation of the feeder drip. Other examples of careful petrographic analysis informing
seasonality studies are provided from Drotsky's Cave, Botswana, where the alternating wet
and dry seasons are manifested by alternating calcite and aragonite (respectively) laminae
(Railsback et al., 1994) and from Grotta di Carburangeli, Italy, where columnar fabrics were
interpreted as reflected pronounced seasonal drip rate variability (Frisia, 2015).

Cave air carbon dioxide concentrations ( $pCO_2$ ) are inversely linked to stalagmite growth rate 421 422 (Banner et al., 2007; Sherwin and Baldini, 2011). For example, in a study of three caves across 423 Texas, it was observed that farmed calcite growth rate was inversely correlated with cave air 424 pCO<sub>2</sub> (Banner et al., 2007). Negligible calcite growth and even seasonal hiatuses occurred during the warmest summer months, when cave air  $pCO_2$  increased due to low cave 425 426 ventilation rates (Banner et al., 2007). Elevated cave air  $pCO_2$  discourages the dripwater's thermodynamic tendency to degas CO<sub>2</sub>, thereby slowing the carbonate precipitation rate. In 427 428 most caves where the entrance is located above the rest of the cave, outside air with low  $pCO_2$  advects into the cave when the outside air density becomes greater than the cave air 429 430 density (e.g., Spötl et al., 2005). This is usually driven by temperature gradients; colder, denser 431 air moves down into a cave during winter, lowering the cave air pCO<sub>2</sub> and encouraging stalagmite growth (James et al., 2015). However, cave air pCO<sub>2</sub> does not act in isolation, but 432 instead the critical growth determining variable is the differential between cave air  $pCO_2$  and 433 dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> in dripwater (Baldini et al., 2008). Carbonate deposition thus could increase in 434 435 the high cave air  $pCO_2$  season if the dripwater had equilibrated with an atmosphere with even greater seasonal dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> increases (e.g., stemming from seasonal soil bioproductivity 436 increases) which exceed those of the cave atmosphere. These types of drips are generally 437 quite responsive to rain events, so determining if a seasonal growth bias exists should 438

incorporate both hydrology and cave atmospheric chemistry. Drips with stable drip rates, that 439 are not responsive to storm events may have more constant dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> and therefore 440 seasonal deposition rates that are affected exclusively by cave air pCO<sub>2</sub> dynamics. However, 441 several recent publications suggest that dripwater equilibrates not only with soil air, but also 442 with a reservoir of carbon dioxide within the unsaturated zone of aquifers (termed 'ground 443 air') that may have very high  $pCO_2$  values (2 to 7%), much higher than typical soils (0.1 to 2%) 444 (Baldini et al., 2018; Bergel et al., 2017; Markowska et al., 2019; Mattey et al., 2016; Noronha 445 446 et al., 2015). Thus, it is possible that drip dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> is often near-constant, having equilibrated with a ground air reservoir of near-constant pCO<sub>2</sub>, and that carbonate 447 precipitation is anticorrelated with cave air  $pCO_2$  regardless of drip type, although this 448 requires further research. The complexities of cave atmospheres are now reasonably well 449 understood, but more long datasets describing the dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> of cave drips are essential 450 451 for determining the variability of cave percolation waters.

452 Although a temperate-zone (Peel et al., 2007) cave's tendency to ventilate during the winter 453 is generally predictable from seasonality in external temperature (James et al., 2015), occasionally cave geometry provides a more dominant control. In New St. Michael's Cave in 454 Gibraltar, ventilation is driven by seasonal changes in wind speed and direction (Mattey et al., 455 456 2016; Mattey et al., 2009). The cave experiences the lowest cave air *p*CO<sub>2</sub> values in summer, and consequently growth (assuming constant drip rate) is biased towards summer (Baker et 457 458 al., 2014). The cave's position high within the Rock of Gibraltar contributes to strong winds and unusual seasonal ventilation, illustrating how cave position or geometry can dominate 459 seasonal ventilation patterns. Other examples include Bunker Cave in Germany, where an 460 461 essentially horizontal plan with little altitude difference between entrances produces very

462 little seasonal variability in  $pCO_2$  (e.g., Riechelmann et al., 2011; Riechelmann et al., 2019), 463 and Císařská Cave (Czech Republic) where a U-shaped cave produces nonlinearities between 464 air temperature, density, and ventilation (Faimon and Lang, 2013).

465 Because seasonal hiatuses can lack either a petrological or a geochemical manifestation, cave monitoring is critical for assessing the likelihood of seasonal non-deposition (Shen et al., 466 2013). Stalagmite growth rate modelling, informed by cave monitoring data, can provide 467 468 invaluable information regarding how seasonal growth variability affects geochemical climate 469 proxy records integrating more than one year's worth of growth. For example, seasonal non-470 deposition during summer due to either high evapotranspiration-induced drip cessation or elevated cave air pCO<sub>2</sub> might bias lower resolution records towards wintertime rainfall values 471 (generally towards lower  $\delta^{18}$ O values) (e.g., James et al., 2015) at sites where drip water is not 472 well mixed. Stoll et al. (2012) used an inverse model to illustrate that rainfall seasonality shifts 473 relative to the cave air pCO<sub>2</sub> can greatly affect PCP and consequently stalagmite trace element 474 concentrations. Baldini et al. (2008) used theoretical stalagmite growth rate equations and 475 476 theory developed previously (Buhmann and Dreybrodt, 1985; Dreybrodt, 1980, 1988, 1999), coupled with monitoring information, to model stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O for various drips within Crag 477 478 Cave (Ireland). The results suggest that the amount of time integrated by the analyses, the nature of the drip, and the ventilation dynamics of the cave, all strongly modulate carbonate 479  $\delta^{18}$ O signals. 480

These studies all highlight how characterising the surface and depositional environment is critical for interpreting the climate signal. Either seasonal hiatuses or reduced growth may bias annual- (or coarser-) scale geochemical records towards particular seasons. Additionally, it is also important to consider how regional climate shifts may have affected a sample in the

past, because modern processes may not have applied throughout the record. Understanding
climate signal emplacement processes within stalagmite carbonate is therefore fundamental
for building robust climate records.

488

### 489 **3.3. A drip classification scheme to quantify seasonal responsiveness**

490 Existing drip classification schemes are not designed to characterise the likelihood that a 491 sampled stalagmite retains a hydrologically induced seasonal signal. However, such 492 knowledge is crucial if research goals include a component of seasonal climate reconstruction. Here, we introduce a new drip categorisation scheme that not only permits the identification 493 494 of stalagmites most likely to retain a hydrology-modulated seasonal climate signal, but that 495 also helps predict the general nature of the climate signal within any sample. This is important 496 for both the accurate interpretation of stalagmite palaeoclimate records, but also for cave conservation (i.e., to maximise the usefulness of collected samples for the purpose of the 497 research goals) and for the appropriate usage of research-related resources. A seasonal-498 499 resolution stable isotope record of any length requires considerable resources, and we hope 500 that this new drip classification scheme will help direct these resources to appropriate 501 stalagmite samples.

The scheme's essence is the collection of (ideally) at least one year of hourly drip rate data for a drip feeding a stalagmite of interest. For every month, the minimum and maximum hourly drip rate values are extracted. When plotted, these data reveal the extent to which the drip is affected by seasonal activation of fracture permeability, and what proportion of the drip consists of diffuse 'baseflow' (and whether this varies through the year). Drip categorisation then involves evaluating the distribution of the datapoints, and is described

508 with terminology broadly consistent with the Smart and Friedrich (1987) scheme. Because the classification scheme uses multiple data points per site, a very large number of possible 509 510 combinations of descriptors are possible. For example, some drip sites (e.g., drip site YOK-LD 511 within Yok Balum Cave, Belize; (Ridley et al., 2015a)) are fed by a slow diffuse flow most of the year, where the minimum and maximum monthly drip rates are almost identical (Figure 512 3). However, during wetter months an overflow route is activated, and the maximum drip 513 514 rate increases substantially, whereas the minimum remains the same; this would be 515 characterised as a diffuse drip with a seasonally active overflow component. If this overflow component is saturated with respect to calcite or aragonite, some seasonal signal may be 516 517 preserved, but if the overflow water is undersaturated a stalagmite fed by this drip type has less potential for seasonal climate reconstructions. Similarly, drip YOK-SK is characterised by 518 almost entirely invariant diffuse recharge and would not record seasonal changes in recharge 519 520 (Figure 3). At Learnington Cave (Bermuda), drip BER-drip #5 is fed by diffuse recharge during 521 drier intervals of the year, but during wetter months more water is routed to the diffuse flow, 522 increasing the base flow (Walczak, 2016). Consequently, the drip does experience some 523 seasonality without risk of undersaturation, and thus a stalagmite fed by it should retain hydrology-induced seasonality. 524

In this new drip classification plot, drips that are expected to produce stalagmites that retain the clearest seasonal signal are those that plot with a slope approaching unity. In other words, those that are not fed by either an extremely diffuse drip or an extremely flashy drip, and that consequently respond to seasonal rainfall shifts without transient extreme rapid drip rate episodes caused by individual storm events (which may lead to dripwater undersaturation and signal loss). The two drip sites plotted in Figure 3 that best display this type of behaviour (drips YOK-G and BER-drip #5) have both yielded stalagmites retaining exceptional seasonal signals, stalagmites YOK-G (Ridley et al., 2015b) and BER-SWI-13 (Walczak, 2016). Other drip
sites that have a slope approaching unity and have a pronounced difference between the
highest and the lowest set of drip rates (Figure 3B) should also produce stalagmites with welldeveloped records of seasonality.

Importantly, this drip classification scheme equally helps to identify drips that are unlikely to 536 537 produce good seasonality records. For example, stalagmites fed by drips that are invariant throughout the year would not record hydrologically-induced seasonality (although a 538 539 seasonal signal might still be preserved based on non-hydrological factors – see Section 2.4). Stalagmites fed by drips that have one or more monthly values plotting at the origin (i.e., no 540 drips for an entire month, Figure 3D) would contain seasonal hiatuses and would 541 consequently not record that interval's climate information. Drips where the diffuse flow 542 543 component (i.e., the monthly minimum flow) remains constant but the fracture flow component (i.e., the monthly maximum flow) changes considerably (Figure 3C) may 544 545 experience undersaturation and either non-deposition or even corrosion of the stalagmite.

546 This classification scheme comes with some caveats. First, as discussed in Section 2.4., it is possible that the seasonality signal is imparted onto the stalagmite independent of hydrology. 547 For example, if seasonal cave ventilation controls the seasonality signal, the application of the 548 scheme would differ. At a site with strong seasonal ventilation, a stalagmite deposited by a 549 550 purely diffuse flow-fed drip would reflect a largely cave atmospheric seasonality signal (i.e., 551 with no hydrological seasonality). This would reduce the complexity of the geochemical signal 552 and obviate the need to deconvolve hydrological- and cave atmosphere-induced seasonality from any geochemical record produced. Second, some drips are so-called 'underflow' drip 553 554 sites, which respond to recharge linearly up until a maximum drip rate and then become

unresponsive to further recharge increases. This is often caused by a constriction in the flow 555 556 pathway leading to the water egress point into the cave. Despite the lack of variability at high flow, the dripwater is still in dynamic equilibrium with recharge (unlike high residence time 557 diffuse flow fed sites) and the stalagmite may reflect the dripwater isotopic variability. 558 559 Similarly, some drips are affected by piston flow, whereby an increase in hydrologic head might push through a slug of older water, leading to an instantaneous response to recharge 560 but of water with a signature of 'old' water; careful monitoring can identify and mitigate these 561 562 issues (see Section 3.4). Despite these caveats, this drip evaluation scheme will hopefully provide an efficient means for identifying actively growing stalagmite samples most likely to 563 record a seasonal climate signal prior to collection of that sample. 564

565

#### 566 **3.4. Dripwater oxygen isotope seasonality**

The extent that cave dripwater  $\delta^{18}$  O ( $\delta^{18}O_{dw}$  ) values reflect the  $\delta^{18}$  O of meteoric precipitation 567 568  $(\delta^{18}O_p)$  is critical to climate studies and for understanding the palaeoseasonality signal in particular. Many publications have investigated the relationship between  $\delta^{18}O_p$  and  $\delta^{18}O_{dw}$ 569 (Ayalon et al., 1998; Baker et al., 2019; Baldini et al., 2015; Bar-Matthews et al., 1996; Cruz Jr. 570 et al., 2005; Duan et al., 2016; Feng et al., 2014; Harmon, 1979; Luo et al., 2014; Markowska 571 et al., 2016; Mischel et al., 2015; Moquet et al., 2016; Moreno et al., 2014; Oster et al., 2012; 572 573 Pu et al., 2016; Riechelmann et al., 2011; Riechelmann et al., 2017; Surić et al., 2017; Tadros 574 et al., 2016; Tremaine et al., 2011; Verheyden et al., 2008; Wu et al., 2014; Yonge et al., 1985; Zeng et al., 2015). Depending on the drip site's hydrological characteristics (Arbel et al., 2010; 575 Baker and Brunsdon, 2003; Smart and Friedrich, 1987),  $\delta^{18}O_{dw}$  values may reflect  $\delta^{18}O_p$  on 576 timescales ranging from the annual weighted mean (Baker et al., 2019; Cabellero et al., 1996; 577

578 Chapman et al., 1992; Yonge et al., 1985) to individual (intense) recharge events (Atkinson et
579 al., 1985; Frappier et al., 2007; Harmon, 1979).

580 Factors such as depth below surface, residence time and mixing of the water within the unsaturated zone, soil depth and texture, and aquifer hydraulics can vary between drip sites. 581 Important reservoirs for storage and mixing of effective rainfall are documented as the soil 582 583 and epikarst zones (Cabellero et al., 1996; Chapman et al., 1992; Gazis and Feng, 2004; Perrin et al., 2003; Yonge et al., 1985). Rainwater infiltrating into the soil reservoir is variably lost to 584 585 evapotranspiration but in karst regions preferential recharge through dolines and grikes may 586 occasionally circumvent the soil and related evapotranspiration (e.g., Hess and White, 1989). Dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\delta$ D values potted relative to the local meteoric water line can detect 587 secondary evaporation from infiltrating water (Ayalon et al., 1998; Breitenbach et al., 2015). 588 Bar-Matthews et al. (1996) observed a 1.5  $\infty \delta^{18}O_{dw}$  enrichment relative to rainwater and 589 attributed this primarily to seasonal evaporation in the soil and epikarst zones above their 590 Israeli cave site. Evaporative enrichment of infiltrating rainwater is greater in arid and 591 semiarid regions than in temperate regions where conditions of water excess occur through 592 593 much of the year (Markowska et al., 2016; McDermott, 2004). Any excess, nonevapotranspired water is then transmitted to the epikarst, karst, and finally the cave. 594 Dripwater residence times in the aquifer or epikarst are highly variable, ranging from minutes 595 596 to years, depending on soil thickness, hydraulic properties (Gazis and Feng, 2004), and drip 597 pathway (e.g., diffuse vs. conduit flow) (Baldini et al., 2006). Mixing of infiltrating rainwater with existing epikarst water can buffer the climate signal and reduce seasonal  $\delta^{18}O_{dw}$ 598 599 variability from muted to invariant (within analytical error, and assuming no cave 600 atmosphere-induced seasonality) (Baker et al., 2019; Breitenbach et al., 2019; Onac et al.,

601 2008; Schwarz et al., 2009). At some cave sites,  $\delta^{18}O_{dw}$  does not necessarily correlate with 602  $\delta^{18}O_p$  shifts, most likely due to mixing within the aquifer (Moquet et al., 2016), underscoring 603 that different hydrologies produce stalagmites retaining different environmental signals.

A recent global compilation of available dripwater monitoring data has further clarified the

relationship between climate (e.g., mean annual temperature and annual precipitation) and

 $\delta^{18}O_{dw}$  (Baker et al., 2019). In cooler regions where mean annual temperature (MAT) < 10°C,

 $\delta^{18}O_{dw}$  most closely reflects the amount-weighted  $\delta^{18}O_{p}$  (i.e., evaporation from the soil and

608 epikarst does not exert much influence). In seasonal climates with MAT between 10°C and

16°C,  $\delta^{18}O_{dw}$  values generally reflect the recharge-weighted  $\delta^{18}O_p$  (see Fig. 1 of (Baker et al.,

610 2019)). In regions where MAT > 16°C,  $\delta^{18}O_{dw}$  is generally higher relative to amount-

611 weighted precipitation  $\delta^{18}O_p$  because fractionation processes related to evaporative effects

on stored karst water are more substantial (Baker et al., 2019). Stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O records

from regions experiencing high temperatures and/or aridity will probably not reflect rainfall  $\delta^{18}$ O (Baker et al., 2019).

615

## 616 **3.5. The uniqueness of each stalagmite record**

Recent publications have made a case for the importance of replication in stalagmite geochemical records (Wong and Breecker, 2015; Zeng et al., 2015), which is a worthwhile and useful goal. Producing the same geochemical record from multiple samples ensures that no analytical issues exist and can facilitate correlating records whose growth intervals overlap in regions and for time periods with high signal-to-noise ratios. Particularly in cases where evidence for a short-lived climate anomaly exists, replication from within the same sample

and from other stalagmites is critical. However, stalagmite geochemistry is affected by a myriad of variables, and the precise combination of factors affecting any one sample are essentially unique. Thus, every stalagmite retains a different component of the environmental signal, and a lack of reproducibility does not necessarily indicate that a record is 'incorrect' or flawed. Even stalagmites that are affected by strong kinetic effects retain accurate environmental data; it is a matter of recognising this control and basing any interpretations accordingly.

Unless two stalagmites are fed by a very similar drip type (often two samples growing near 630 631 each other whose feeder drips share the same hydrological pathway), stalagmite records from the same cave may not match. This is a clear consequence of the diversity of possible 632 633 drip pathways feeding individual stalagmites. For example, a stalagmite growing underneath a diffuse drip fed by an extremely low hydrologic permeability pathway that is unresponsive 634 635 to large rain events would not contain the same record as a stalagmite growing underneath a drip with no diffuse component but that is instead fed by fracture flow. The former (diffuse 636 637 flow-fed) stalagmite may retain long-term climate information but lack seasonal-scale information, whereas the latter (fracture flow-fed) stalagmite may retain some seasonal 638 environmental information but may also experience occasional undersaturation following 639 640 large rain events, leading to hiatuses and information loss. The fracture flow-fed stalagmite may have a more rapid overall growth rate but may experience flow re-routing and stochastic 641 642 drip variability due to solutional enlargement of the fracture pathway, potentially leading to a shorter overall growth interval due to the eventual diversion of water away from the 643 stalagmite. Once cave- and site-specific ventilation factors are considered as well, it is 644 645 apparent that no two stalagmites can yield precisely the same record; rather it is imperative

to understand the environmental conditions recorded by each individual sample. If the goal
is to reconstruct seasonality, it is important to understand the nature of the seasonality signal
for each potential sample, e.g., whether the sample is affected by hydrological seasonality or
cave atmospheric seasonality. In the latter case, it is then favourable to select a stalagmite
from a diffuse flow drip in order to simplify the extraction of the seasonal ventilation signal.

651 The considerable range of stalagmite records possible, even from the same site, is potentially 652 advantageous. The individuality of stalagmite records may yield a powerful tool for the 653 quantitative reconstruction of historically elusive environmental variables. For example, 654 differences in oxygen isotope ratios between two samples from the same site could reflect in-cave temperature-induced kinetic fractionation effects, and modelling (Deininger and 655 656 Scholz, 2019; Deininger et al., 2016; Dreybrodt, 1988; Dreybrodt and Deininger, 2014; Riechelmann et al., 2013) could theoretically yield the cave temperature, potentially even at 657 658 a seasonal resolution. This perspective is consistent with the recent appreciation that speleothems deposited at isotopic equilibrium are extremely rare (Daëron et al., 2019; 659 660 Mickler et al., 2006) and that kinetic effects are an integral part of the environmental signal retained by stalagmites (Millo et al., 2017; Sade and Halevy, 2017). The concept that kinetic 661 effects are undesirable is a vestige of early studies attempting to derive absolute 662 palaeotemperatures from stalagmite oxygen isotope ratios, in which case kinetic effects do 663 indeed interfere with the extraction of the desired signal. However, because stalagmite  $\delta^{18}O$ 664 values are no longer considered pure in-cave temperature proxies, kinetic effects no longer 665 666 present a serious issue, provided that they are considered within any interpretations. In fact, because kinetic effects often vary in sync with the primary rainfall signal (e.g., kinetic effects 667

tend to occur during drier periods accentuating the already elevated stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\delta^{13}$ C signature) they tend to help the climate signal stand out above background noise.

Stalagmite climate reconstructions are usually based around one record or an overlapping 670 671 series of records; future research could use the differences between two records (considering 672 in-cave kinetic effects) to reconstruct aspects of the environmental signal, including seasonal 673 temperature shifts. Recent research utilising several stalagmites from along the same moisture trajectory across a wide region to reconstruct oxygen isotope systematics and 674 675 temperature represent an exciting development in speleothem climate sciences (Deininger et al., 2017; Hu et al., 2008; McDermott et al., 2011; Wang et al., 2017), and similar 676 677 methodologies could reveal in-cave fractionation processes that are ultimately relatable to temperature, potentially on a seasonal-scale. For example, changes in outside temperature-678 induced ventilation may affect samples fed by different hydrologies differently (promoting 679 more kinetic fractionation in slower dripping sample), and comparing the isotope ratio 680 records may reveal the range of external seasonal temperature variability. We suggest that 681 682 the comparison of multiple coeval stalagmite geochemical records from within the same cave 683 site is a crucial research frontier that is well worth investigating further.

684

### 685 **4. Analytical techniques**

Direct detection of seasonal variations in stalagmite geochemical parameters requires
sampling or analysis at sufficiently high spatial resolution to mitigate signal averaging (Figure
4). Sampling frequency should approach monthly resolution to detect a seasonality signal and
to avoid aliasing issues during intervals with slower growth. This necessitates careful

consideration prior to analysis to ensure both sufficient sampling resolution to detect seasonal-scale variability, and sufficient material for the analytical method. In addition to the pre-analysis considerations, we also recommend publishing complete micro-analytical data tables, in order to increase transparency. Below we discuss common microanalytical techniques capable of palaeoseasonality reconstruction and compare advantages and disadvantages of each.

696

### 697 4.1. Sampling for palaeoseasonality

Sub-sampling stalagmites for geochemical analysis requires careful planning and execution.
We recommend a thorough reconnaissance of a sample's petrography using microscopy prior
to geochemical analysis. The conversion of a sample into polished thin sections can provide
critical information but is destructive. Reflected light microscopy provides a non-destructive
alternative that can yield crucial information regarding crystal growth habit, the location of
possible hiatuses, inclusions, and porosity.

The various methods available for the extraction of proxy data all require different sample 704 705 amounts depending on analytical limits of detection and other factors (Fairchild et al., 2006). 706 Methods are broadly categorizable as destructive and non-destructive, depending on the 707 amount of material required. The former is further divisible into: i) macro-destructive (e.g., 708 cuttings for fluid inclusion studies, low-concentration proxies like biomarkers or DNA) (e.g., 709 Blyth et al., 2011; Vonhof et al., 2006; Wang et al., 2019a), ii) meso-destructive (e.g., 710 conventional and micro-milling for U-series samples, stable isotopes, ICP-OES, <sup>14</sup>C) (e.g., 711 Lechleitner et al., 2016a; Ridley et al., 2015b; Spötl and Mattey, 2006), and iii) microdestructive (e.g., laser ablation or secondary ionization mass spectrometer (SIMS) analyses 712

713 for traditional and non-traditional isotope systems, element concentrations or ratios) (Baldini 714 et al., 2002; Luetscher et al., 2015; Treble et al., 2007; Webb et al., 2014; Welte et al., 2016). 715 Non-destructive methods include (but are not restricted to): i) simple desktop scanning and 716 photography, ii) µXRF line scanning and mapping (e.g., Breitenbach et al., 2019; Scroxton et 717 al., 2018), iii) synchrotron analyses (e.g., Frisia et al., 2005; Vanghi et al., 2019; Wang et al., 718 2019b; Wynn et al., 2014), iv) phosphor mapping via beta-scanning (e.g., Cole et al., 2003), v) 719 reflected light, and fluorescence, including confocal laser fluorescent microscopy (CLFM) (e.g., 720 Orland et al., 2012) and other microscopy techniques (e.g. SEM, EMPA, RAMAN), or vi) X-ray 721 Computed Tomography (CT) scanning (e.g., Walczak et al., 2015; Wortham et al., 2019). The 722 choice of technique should consider suitability for answering the targeted research questions, 723 and logistical considerations such as sample sectioning. Although the list above categorises 724 techniques based on their destructiveness, it does not account for sample preparation; for example, SIMS analysis uses only a small amount of sample (i.e., essentially non-destructive), 725 726 but requires sectioning of the stalagmite into centimetre-scale cubes, polishing and epoxy-727 mounting. Another major consideration is the length of the record required; it is possible (though labour-intensive) to produce seasonal-scale records extending hundreds or even 728 thousands of years using micromilling, but this is not practical using SIMS, unless automated 729 730 protocols allowing for unattended analysis can be developed.

Although macro-destructive sampling can inform interpretations based on higher resolution data, it cannot generally reconstruct seasonality on its own. Thus, here we discuss only selected meso-, micro-, and non-destructive techniques. The focus is first on 'conventional drilling' and 'micromilling' of powder samples, which probably are the most widely used techniques to obtain material for inorganic chemistry, followed by the highly versatile, fast, and cost-effective laser ablation sampling (LA-ICPMS). SIMS requires substantial sample preparation, offers excellent resolution and is a good choice in situations requiring in-depth
characterisation of a short interval. Synchrotron-µXRF (SR-µXRF) has advanced considerably
over the past decade, and it is now possible to obtain high-resolution (0.5-5 µm) quantitative
trace element data non-destructively through fast scanning of large samples (Borsato et al.,
2019). Below we describe the relevance and applicability of these techniques towards the
reconstruction of palaeoseasonality.

743

## 744 **4.1.1. Conventional drilling**

Conventional drilling (or 'spot-sampling') (Fairchild et al., 2006) is the drilling of powders from discrete spots that are normally separated by unsampled material, and is still amongst the most widely used methods to obtain carbonate powders from speleothems. This method is comparably fast and, with a sufficiently small drill bit (typical  $\emptyset$  ca. 0.2-1 mm), can achieve a spatial resolution of up to 0.3-0.5 mm along the growth axis, although more frequently the resolution is ~1 mm. Conventional drilling is ideally performed with instruments that allow computer-aided control of x-y-z dimensions, such as Sherline<sup>®</sup> or Mercantek<sup>®</sup> instruments.

752 With typical stalagmite growth rates of 0.1 to 0.2 mm year<sup>-1</sup>, this technique is usually inadequate when targeting sub-annual resolution (Figure 5). If used on samples with growth 753 754 rates approaching twice the sampling interval, aliasing may occur and unfavourably affect the recovery of high-frequency variability (Fairchild et al., 2006). Furthermore, this type of spot 755 sampling usually does not integrate all the carbonate material, i.e. the time slices at the top 756 757 and bottom of the hole are under-represented in the average for the drill-hole; this undersampling could miss short-lived climate excursions. Consequently, we cannot 758 recommend conventional drilling for recovering a seasonal signal, although the technique is 759

reffective at quickly producing a lower-resolution record and is well suited for longer records of climate (e.g., those covering multiple glacial cycles), and for screening potential target stalagmites. Additionally, conventional drilling is possible on a large stalagmite slab, obviating the need for sectioning into multiple smaller slabs. A related technique which is preferred for sampling at seasonal scale is micromilling, discussed below.

765

## 766 4.1.2. Micromilling

Micromilling refers to continuous sample cutting along a trench parallel to a stalagmite's 767 growth axis (Fairchild et al., 2006; Frappier et al., 2002; Spötl and Mattey, 2006). Usually 768 769 performed with computer-controlled milling devices (such as the ESI/New Wave micromill) this technique can achieve ~10-micron spatial resolution e.g. Ridley et al., 2015b, but is 770 771 critically dependent on the textural characteristics of the sample. Dense columnar, fascicular, radiaxial, or radial fibrous calcites are the most suitable material, but needle-like aragonite 772 can also be sampled, although gaps between needle-shaped crystals may lead to loss of 773 774 sample and require painstaking cleaning procedures. The sample morphology throughout the stalagmite also warrants consideration. Planar, parallel, and laterally continuous laminae 775 across the sample are ideal, but often stalagmite laminae appear curved in a slabbed sample. 776 777 These are normally convex, but in some cases are concave (particularly in the case of a 'splash' 778 cup), and with laminae that thin towards the edges. The greater such curvature, the narrower the micromilling trough required for sub-annual (seasonal-scale) sampling (Figure 5), because 779 780 a wider trench would integrate material from other laminae. Similarly, the sample should allow 2-3 mm sampling into the depth of the sample slab, and ideally the growth layers should 781 782 not taper out in the third dimension. X-ray and Neutron CT scans can help visualise the 3D

internal structure of the sample (Walczak et al., 2015; Wortham et al., 2019), and the
appropriate milling depth.

785 The determination of the x, y, and z dimensions of the sampling increment is the first step of any sampling strategy (Figure 5). For seasonal resolution, this strategy will ideally permit a 786 787 very small y-axis increment (the y-axis is parallel to the stalagmite growth axis). The other 788 dimensions must then allow the collection of enough carbonate for analysis (typically 50-120 789 µg for carbon and oxygen stable isotopes). Depending on sample characteristics and desired resolution, dimensions of y = 10-100  $\mu$ m and x = 10-300 \* y  $\mu$ m (parallel to growth layers on 790 791 the slab) are ideal (Figure 5). The sampling depth (z-axis) is best minimised because lamina 792 behaviour into the sample is often unknown, unless CT scans of the sample exist. Larger sample masses are occasionally needed for non-traditional proxies. 793

794 A common issue in the speleothem sciences is the precise correlation between two datasets 795 obtained via different means, for example a micromilled stable isotope dataset and a LA-796 ICPMS derived trace element dataset. Annual- to decadal-scale correlations are usually possible, but rarely are the records correlative on the seasonal- or even annual-scale. 797 798 Comparisons are achievable using very careful measurements from a datum (often the stalagmite top), with or without the use of banding as 'landmarks' (e.g., (Johnson et al., 2006; 799 800 Treble et al., 2005a)). A recent technological advance is the development of software, such as the open-source GIS-based QGIS software (Linzmeier et al., 2018), which integrates micro-801 802 imaging and analysis into a single spatial reference frame. This approach is particularly useful 803 for organising different analyses derived from differently sectioned portions of samples and 804 has been successfully applied to stalagmite data (Orland et al., 2019).
The problem of correlating different types of data is to some extent avoidable by sampling sufficient material with the micromill for both stable isotope and trace elemental analysis via ICP-MS. The sampled powder is divided into two aliquots, one for each analytical technique. The resultant trace element and stable isotope data permit zero-lag cross-correlations and highly robust interpretations of different environmental processes (e.g., Jamieson et al., 2016).

811 For example, if planned multi-proxy analyses require 0.8 mg of carbonate powder (e.g., stable isotope ratios, <sup>14</sup>C, and trace elements), and a 50 µm spatial resolution is desired using a 812 813 milling bit diameter of 0.8 mm, a 0.05 mm x 4.15 mm x 1 mm trench would suffice (assuming 814 calcite density of 2.7 g/cm<sup>3</sup> and no sample loss via incomplete recovery); sample loss and a particularly low-density sample would require a larger volume. An often-overlooked 815 816 additional consideration involves the corners that are initially unsampled when milling trenches (red corner areas, Figure 5). Depending on the drill bit diameter and trench 817 dimensions, the corners at each end of the trench would lead to unwanted integration of 818 819 material from several sample increments and thus time slices. Use of a smaller milling bit 820 diameter minimizes this effect. Additionally, a 50% reduction of this sampling effect is achieved if a trench is milled along the growth axis prior to the high-resolution milling, or if 821 822 the milled trench is adjacent to a longitudinal cut (Figure 5). Material from the first trench can 823 be used for reconnaissance studies. Another approach yielding similar results involves collecting the desired powder, and then moving the milling bit along the horizontal sampling 824 825 track (i.e., parallel to the growth layer) for a distance corresponding to half the width of the milling bit. This powder is then discarded (or collected as auxiliary powder), and the milling 826 bit returns to the original position, ready to produce the next aliquot of powder. Either of 827 these sampling approaches effectively reduce spatial integration of sample (Kennett et al., 828

2012; Myers et al., 2015; Ridley et al., 2015b), thereby increasing the likelihood of obtaining
a clear seasonal signal (Figure 6). These considerations are important because many
stalagmites, particularly from non-tropical localities, may have low growth rates (Railsback,
2018) that require a very high sampling resolution with minimal integration across samples
to extract a seasonal signal.

Many samples may deviate from an idealised geometry, and may contain imperfections along preferred micromilling tracks, growth rate changes, or growth axis shifts. These instances may require special consideration and sample-specific solutions, such as moving to a different track within the sample or changing the resolution of the analyses in response to major changes in growth rate. In the case of the latter, interpretations should consider how changes in sampling resolution might have affected the amplitude of any seasonal cycle.

Other issues include growth layers that slope inward rather than geometrically perfect layers 840 841 (where the layering is perpendicular to section) and the use of tapered rather than cyclindrical 842 drill bits, which samples less carbonate at depth than the step size implies, and then integrates 843 this carbonate into subsequent samples. A study comparing micromilling/IRMS and SIMS techniques on annually layered otoliths found that an offset existed between the two 844 techniques (with SIMS yielding values ~0.5‰ lower) and that the amplitude of annual oxygen 845 isotope signal derived via micromilling was approximately half of the SIMS signal; both of 846 847 these observations are potentially explained by deviations from an ideal sample geometry, 848 and consequently greater integration of unwanted material arising from micromilling (Helser 849 et al., 2018). Despite these differences, both techniques were able to detect annual isotope 850 ratio cycles (Helser et al., 2018). A thorough reconnaissance of the sample using CT scanning 851 or other means to characterise its geometry in advance of slabbing can minimise these issues.

Other minor issues include the possible conversion of aragonite to calcite during milling, 852 which would result in a decrease in  $\delta^{18}$ O values of 0.02‰ for every 1% aragonite converted 853 854 to calcite (Waite and Swart, 2015). This effect may have implications for modelling oxygen 855 isotope variability or calculating deviations from equilibrium deposition. However, using a 856 slower rotation rate of the milling bit (500-800 rpm) will minimise, or even eliminate, this 857 effect. A final recommendation is to run micromilled samples through the IRMS non-858 sequentially (i.e., out of stratigraphic order). Ideally the laboratory environment is static and will not affect results, but any unaccounted for changes (e.g., lab temperature) may affect the 859 860 analyses in a cyclical way. Running samples non-sequentially both helps ensure that any cycles detected (e.g., a seasonal cycle) are not analytical artefacts and helps to identify issues, if they 861 862 exist (e.g., a persistent cycle when samples are arranged in the order that they were run).

863

#### 864 **4.1.3. LA-ICPMS**

Laser Ablation Inductively Coupled Plasma Mass Spectrometry (LA-ICPMS) is a beam method 865 866 sampling technique. A polished speleothem slab is analysed by ablating small portions of material using a laser within a sample cell. The laser (typically an ArF excimer laser at a 193 867 868 nm wavelength) physically ablates the sample, aerosolising the material which is then carried into the ICP-MS system by a carrier gas (typically helium and/or argon, with helium yielding a 869 greater signal intensity (Luo et al., 2018)) where trace element concentrations are measured 870 871 and quantified against standards of known compositions. The specific mass spectrometer setup depends on the research question; for example, by using a quadrupole ICP-MS for 872 elemental measurements using a reference isotope, or a multi-collector ICP-MS for isotope 873 ratio analyses. Additional analytical set-ups are compatible with LA-ICPMS, including reaction 874

cells, triple-quadrupoles, and split-stream analysis using two mass spectrometers in tandem
(Frick et al., 2016; Kylander-Clark et al., 2013; Woodhead et al., 2016).

877 The advantages of LA-ICPMS for speleothem trace element analysis are numerous and include excellent spatial resolution (down to ~3 microns (Müller and Fietzke, 2016) using a 878 879 rectangular aperture with long axis oriented along laminae) whilst preserving low detection 880 limits (Figure 6). Although historically LA-ICPMS instruments used round 'spots', some laser ablation instruments are now fitted with rectangular masks (apertures), resulting in 881 rectangular spots optimised for speleothem analysis, where the ablation spot's long 882 883 dimension is oriented perpendicular to speleothem growth axis, along the x-axis (Müller et al., 2009). This permits the ablation of a surface area equivalent to large circular spot sizes, 884 while retaining high spatial resolution in the growth direction (similar to the micromill 885 886 sampling described in 4.1.2). The speed of analysis via this method is also exceptionally high, with typical scan speed of 10  $\mu$ m s<sup>-1</sup> (e.g., (Jamieson et al., 2015)). Two-volume laser cells are 887 888 now available, minimising sample damage incurred via sectioning and ensuring consistent 889 aerosol flow within the cell. The coupling of a laser ablation system with a large-capacity gas 890 exchange device even allows analysis under atmospheric air (Tabersky et al., 2013) although with somewhat elevated limits of detection. This technique is particularly suitable for large 891 stalagmites, or archaeological samples, because it minimises physical sample destruction by 892 requiring less sectioning. 893

The presence of a localised impurity can produce a trace elemental concentration peak even in the absence of a laterally contiguous geochemical horizon with that geochemistry. LA-ICPMS can produce elemental maps that can verify the spatial continuity of geochemical laminae of interest, particularly when combined with a square aperture (Evans and Müller,

2013; Rittner and Muller, 2012; Treble et al., 2005b; Woodhead et al., 2007). This permits the
resolution of spatial relationships with greater confidence and can corroborate
interpretations based on stacked and parallel line scans, thereby avoiding issues related to
the overinterpretation of a small number of points. Other microanalytical techniques (e.g.,
SIMS, synchrotron, µXRF, etc.) can also produce elemental maps, but LA-ICPMS techniques
can provide greater spatial coverage more rapidly.

904 The most significant disadvantage to LA-ICPMS is related to difficulties with standardisation. 905 The use of matrix matched standards (i.e., made of the same material as the sample) during 906 laser ablation analysis is ideal, but the limited availability, variable degrees of standard 907 homogeneity, and accurate standardisation of carbonate materials are ongoing challenges. 908 Orland et al. (2014) and later Müller et al. (2015) provide promising tests for a carbonate standard, albeit for a limited range of elements. Many analyses are standardised with 909 910 somewhat greater uncertainty than is ideal using glasses such as NIST 620 or 622. These analyses are often regarded as semi-quantitative, with high levels of confidence regarding 911 912 variability and data trends but uncertainty regarding absolute values. Another minor 913 disadvantage is lack of precise knowledge regarding the position of individual analytical spots. The sheer number of analyses possible via this technique (often >10,000) and indistinct, 914 continuous track means that the exact position of any one individual spot is often difficult to 915 916 determine precisely, complicating the correlation with other climate proxies. This 917 disadvantage is mitigatable by precise notetaking, syn-analytical microscopy recording, careful reflected light imaging, cross-correlation, application of QGIS or similar software, and 918 judicious 'wiggle-matching' with other proxy records, as well as creating marker laser lines at 919 920 certain intervals to further help to constrain spatial uncertainties.

921

### 922 4.1.4. Secondary ionisation mass spectrometry

923 Secondary ionisation mass spectrometry (SIMS) uses a primary beam of positive (often 924 caesium) or negative (often oxygen) ions to impact a sample surface under a vacuum, 925 'sputtering' secondary ions into a mass spectrometer (Wiedenbeck et al., 2012). The 926 sputtered secondary ions are then accelerated into a double-focusing mass spectrometer and counted by ion detectors (electron multiplier or Faraday cup). This analytical technique can 927 928 yield both trace element analysis and stable isotope ratio data in speleothem carbonate at the micron scale, with very little damage to the sample, and with very high sensitivity (Figure 929 930 6).

931 The spatial resolution typically ranges between 1 to 10 µm spot size and 1-2 µm spot depth 932 for trace elements, with stable isotope analyses historically restricted to 20–30 µm resolution (Fairchild and Baker, 2012) but now capable of achieving 10 µm resolution (Orland et al., 933 934 2019). This represents a very high-resolution method for stable isotope analysis within 935 speleothem carbonate and is therefore ideal for detecting palaeoseasonality (Fairchild et al., 936 2006). The analytical resolution for trace elements is lower than when using synchrotron radiation, but with the added advantage of full quantification of concentration data and the 937 ability to cover much greater areas of sample. Matrix matched materials, typically calcium 938 939 carbonate, are used for standardisation to ensure consistent ionisation of chemical species and ablation rates (Fairchild and Treble, 2009). 940

Early studies of SIMS-derived trace element trends in speleothems helped to demonstrate that many stalagmites retained a seasonal signal (Baldini et al., 2002; Finch et al., 2001;

943 Roberts et al., 1998), representing a considerable shift in resolving power compared to the former decadal- to centennial-scale of analysis previously possible. The presence of annual 944 trace element cycles was quickly established as the norm rather than the exception for 945 shallow cave sites, even in the absence of visible speleothem laminations (Fairchild et al., 946 947 2001). Divalent alkaline earth metals such as magnesium and barium were suggested as palaeohydrological proxies, phosphorus as indicative of bioproductivity, and strontium as 948 reflecting calcite growth rate and/or PCP (Fairchild et al., 2001; Fairchild et al., 2000; Treble 949 950 et al., 2003). However, the need for better empirical transfer functions between speleothems and external climatic processes, and partitioning between drip waters and speleothem 951 calcite, complicated interpretations (Fairchild et al., 2001). Subsequent process-based studies 952 953 have revealed the complexity involved in interpreting trace elements at seasonal scales, highlighting the role they play in complexation with organic matter as colloids (Borsato et al., 954 955 2007), in speleothem diagenesis (Martin-Garcia et al., 2014), and the complex controls on 956 transfer through vegetation/soil/epikarst (Hartland et al., 2009; Hartland et al., 2012), as well as controls on partitioning via internal cave microclimate and crystallographic structures 957 (Fairchild and Treble, 2009). The use of trace element cycles obtained via SIMS as 958 chronological markers is exemplified through the work of Smith et al. (2009), where the ability 959 of trace element cycles to provide relative age constraints at a finer spatial resolution than 960 traditional U-series age models is unambiguously demonstrated. 961

A frontier for SIMS trace element measurements lies in the potential of combining these trace element records with stable isotope measurements undertaken at sub-annual scale. Prior to the advent of SIMS techniques for stable isotope analysis, there were very few combined trace element – stable isotope studies due to the incompatibility of analytical resolution

between the two parameters (Orland et al., 2014). However, the analysis of stable isotopes
by SIMS now achieves a spatial resolution capable of allowing direct comparability between
both isotopic and trace element indicators of seasonality (Orland et al., 2014).

969 SIMS stable isotope studies have investigated the  $\delta^{18}$ O,  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{34}$ S-SO<sub>4</sub> dynamics in stalagmite records (typical uncertainties (2 $\sigma$ ):  $\delta^{18}$ O = 0.2‰ (Orland et al., 2019);  $\delta^{13}$ C = 0.6-970 0.7‰ (Oerter et al., 2016; Sliwinski et al., 2015);  $\delta^{34}$ S = 1.6‰ (1 $\sigma$ ) at 70 ppm S concentrations 971 (Wynn et al., 2010)). Whereas each of these isotope ratios reflects changing surface 972 environmental conditions over inter-annual timescales, only the  $\delta^{18}$ O measurements by SIMS 973 can produce records of intra-annual seasonality. Analysis of  $\delta^{13}$ C in speleothem carbonate 974 cannot be undertaken simultaneously with  $\delta^{18}$ O, and any available records in the literature 975 (e.g., (Pacton et al., 2013)) are not undertaken at seasonal resolution. The apparent lack of 976 seasonal change in cave dripwater  $\delta^{34}$ S-SO<sub>4</sub> (Borsato et al., 2015) has also so far prevented 977 SIMS speleothem sulphur isotope measurements at the seasonal scale (Wynn et al., 2010). 978 Treble et al. (2005a) produced the first  $\delta^{18}$ O record unambiguously linking seasonal cycles in 979 980 speleothem oxygen isotopes to rainfall dynamics and corroborated these interpretations with trace element cycles and contemporary rainfall monitoring. Subsequent work at Soreq Cave 981 982 (Israel), further developed the technique to detect seasonality and links with rainfall dynamics across a range of time periods (Orland et al., 2012; Orland et al., 2009; Orland et al., 2014). 983 Coupled annual variability in fluorescence and  $\delta^{18}$ O provided a seasonal marker of annual 984 variability in rainfall from before the climate instrumental record (Orland et al., 2012; Orland 985 et al., 2009). Careful correlation between fluorescent banding,  $\delta^{18}$ O and trace element 986 measurements, and surface environmental conditions demonstrated that the fluorescent 987 banding represented seasonal organic colloid flux variability into the cave. 988

Despite the clear advantages of utilising SIMS stable isotope analyses of speleothem 989 990 carbonate to reveal seasonal patterns of rainfall delivery and drivers of climatic change, the technique also comes with its analytical challenges, including the considerable impact of 991 geometric imperfections (e.g., sample topography, porosity, inclusions, cracks, etc) (Kita et 992 993 al., 2011; Liu et al., 2015; Pacton et al., 2013; Treble et al., 2005a). In most instances, the ability to control the precise location of SIMS analyses enable geometric imperfections to be 994 avoided, provided that i) good surface mapping can be used to identify optimal locations for 995 996 analysis and that ii) post-processing can visualise geometric imperfections in each analysis pit (Orland et al., 2009). This contrasts with micromilling, where large swathes of sample are 997 often bulked together regardless of sample porosity or imperfections. The need to use matrix 998 999 matched standard materials presents similar problems of availability and homogeneity for the 1000 accuracy of data analysis as encountered with LA-ICPMS. However, recent improvements in 1001 this area, alongside improvements in sample preparation techniques have been substantial 1002 enough to enable accurate correction for instrumental drift (Valley and Kita, 2009). The impact of trace element content on carbonate  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\delta^{13}$ C analyses also requires careful 1003 1004 consideration (Sliwinski et al., 2017), but can be corrected following careful standardisation and is generally not a problem encountered through speleothem analysis where the trace 1005 1006 element content is typically less than 1 weight %. An emerging analytical frontier concerns the impact of water and/or organic content on SIMS carbonate  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\delta^{13}$ C, requiring 1007 1008 careful pre-screening of sample material and simultaneous analysis of OH- and CH-1009 respectively (Orland et al., 2015; Orland et al., 2019; Orland, 2013; Wycech et al., 2018).

Despite these issues, SIMS remains an appealing choice for palaeoseasonality reconstruction
 using stalagmites due to its sensitivity and resolution. SIMS has produced some of the highest

resolution records of palaeoseasonality available and will continue to play an important role in linking stalagmite records to seasonal changes in environmental conditions, particularly across discrete, short-lived events. Although the technique is not suitable for building long records, the comparison of discrete timeslices permits seasonality to be contrasted for key intervals (Orland et al., 2012; Orland et al., 2015; Orland et al., 2019).

1017

# 1018 **4.1.5. Synchrotron**

1019 The application of Synchrotron Radiation micro X-Ray Fluorescence (SR-µXRF) to the study of 1020 speleothem carbonate opened up new possibilities in terms of greater resolving power for geochemical analysis (Kuczumow et al., 2003; Kuczumow et al., 2001). Based on the emission 1021 1022 of electromagnetic radiation from charged electrons accelerated in an orbit, synchrotron radiation generates secondary radiation from speleothem carbonate based on the 1023 1024 characteristic fluorescent properties of chemical elements. The excellent spatial resolution of analysis (0.5–5 microns), low detection limits, low background, and the ability to 1025 quantitatively map trace element variability across a given area has enabled the study of 1026 1027 speleothem geochemical structures at the sub-annual timescale and in two dimensions 1028 (Figure 6). The use of XANES (X-Ray Absorption Near Edge structure) can define the oxidation 1029 state of the element under consideration, thereby adding further resolving power to determine environmental processes. 1030

Applications range from using SR-µXRF to determine long-term (100 year) secular changes in
 elemental signals (Frisia et al., 2005), high resolution event imaging across sub-annual to
 multi-annual timescales (Badertscher et al., 2014; Frisia et al., 2008; Vanghi et al., 2019; Wang

et al., 2019b), and for investigating petrological controls on geochemical composition (Frisia et al., 2018; Ortega et al., 2005; Vanghi et al., 2019). However, it is at the seasonal scale of analysis where the resolving power of synchrotron radiation has really pushed the boundaries of speleothem science.

1038 No conventional dating technique provides an absolute timeframe at the sub-annual scale of 1039 speleothem carbonate deposition. However, linking the seasonality of external environmental processes to speleothem petrology and geochemical characteristics can yield 1040 1041 a monthly scale resolution of trace element content. SR-µXRF was used to determine the 1042 coincidence of trace element distributions and physical calcite characteristics within annual stalagmite laminations (Borsato et al., 2007). Based on the annually laminated stalagmite 1043 1044 ER78 from Ernesto Cave, Italy, a suite of trace elements (P, Cu, Zn, Br, Y, and Pb) were found 1045 to form an annual peak, coincident with a characteristic thin (0.5-4 µm) brown UV-fluorescent 1046 layer in each annual couplet. The brown colouration of each UV-fluorescent layer is probably 1047 due to organic acids derived from high rates of water infiltration during each autumn (Frisia 1048 et al., 2000; Huang et al., 2001; Orland et al., 2014). The transport of trace elements is 1049 associated with colloidal organic molecules (Hartland et al., 2010; Hartland et al., 2012), and leads to the incorporation of this distinctive elemental suite on a seasonal basis associated 1050 1051 with the autumnal rains (the 'autumnal pulse' as described in Section 2.4). SR-μXRF permits the detection of variability inherent to each individual year, which then can be contrasted 1052 1053 against the symmetrical mean annual profile. Any differences (e.g., double peaks or shoulder 1054 peaks) provide an indication that the rainfall distribution throughout that year deviated from 1055 the mean annual profile. Strontium was observed to vary inversely to colloidally transported elements (Borsato et al., 2007), possibly due to competition for binding to defect sites, thus 1056 1057 limiting incorporation into the calcite lattice. SR-µXRF revealed seasonal patterns of zinc, lead,

phosphorus, and strontium within speleothem Obi84 from Obir Cave, Austria, whose concentration peaks also coincided with the dark coloured visible laminae. These were similarly interpreted as hydrological event markers associated with autumnal infiltration but could also result from dry deposition of aerosols (Dredge et al., 2013).

1062 SR-µXRF 2D mapping within speleothem Obi84 over three annual cycles demonstrated the 1063 effects of several infiltration events each year, present as short-lived peaks in Zn 1064 concentration and which build in magnitude towards the main autumnal flush (Wynn et al., 1065 2014) (Figure 6). Using these event peaks as markers of autumnal flushing permitted attribution of annual sulphate cycles to summer high and winter low concentrations. At the 1066 1067 Obir Cave site, these seasonal shifts in speleothem sulphate content were attributed to 1068 temperature-driven cave ventilation and associated cave air  $pCO_2$  variability which controlled 1069 the dripwater pH and the sulphate:carbonate ratio. Wynn et al. (2018) later verified this proposed seasonal mechanism using controlled laboratory experiments, thereby permitting 1070 1071 the extraction of seasonal temperature information based on the annual sulphate cycle's 1072 topology. SR-µXRF can thus extract geochemical expressions of seasonality, and the technique 1073 is well-suited to investigating changing rainfall and temperature seasonality dynamics back 1074 through time.

1075

### 1076 **4.1.6. Data analysis**

Following the geochemical analyses and data processing, the information must be interpreted. For techniques producing tens to hundreds of data points, this is not particularly challenging. On the other hand, techniques such as LA-ICPMS can produce tens of thousands of data points for multiple elements and can greatly increase the processing time on common 1081 spreadsheet programmes. To circumvent these issues, it is possible to simplify the data using 1082 a Principal Component Analysis (PCA), a multivariate statistical analysis technique which extracts modes of variation from large multivariate timeseries datasets that best describe 1083 overall variability of those datasets. The technique is ideal for large multivariate stalagmite-1084 1085 derived LA-ICPMS datasets (Borsato et al., 2007; Jamieson et al., 2015; Orland et al., 2014; Wassenburg et al., 2012). PCA has also been used to extract a seasonal signal from trace 1086 elemental concentrations even in the absence of visible laminae and applied towards the 1087 1088 development of a chronology (Ban et al., 2018).

1089 Comparing the intra-annual amplitude of a geochemical signal (Orland et al., 2012; Orland 1090 et al., 2009; Orland et al., 2014; Orland et al., 2019) from monthly-resolved datasets is ideal 1091 for extracting seasonal information from an otherwise difficult to interpret dataset. For example, Ridley et al. (2015b) used the well-developed annual carbon isotope cycles with 1092 their Belizean stalagmite to extract seasonal amplitudes, which were then interpreted in 1093 terms of the strength of the seasonal ITCZ incursion into southern Belize. Orland et al. 1094 1095 (2015) used the topology of oxygen isotope variability within individual growth bands in a Chinese stalagmite to clarify the origin the oxygen isotope variability. Spectral analysis of 1096 well-dated samples can also reduce data complexity (Myers et al., 2015; Ronay et al., 2019). 1097 1098 For example, Asmerom et al. (2020) used a wavelet analysis to reconstruct the strength of 1099 the wet season in Central America over the last two millennia, and to show that modern 1100 seasonality in rainfall was only emplaced in the 15<sup>th</sup> Century. Extracting a meaningful metric from numerous more complex data using statistical techniques is one way of simplifying a 1101 1102 complex geochemical dataset.

1103

### 1104 **5. Modelling techniques**

1105 There have been many efforts at modelling both the hydrology feeding a stalagmite and the 1106 climate signal within. Proxy system models (PSMs) describe how geological or chemical 1107 archives are imprinted with a climate signal (Evans et al., 2013). In terms of stalagmite-specific 1108 models, several exciting geochemical models now exist which can explore the emplacement 1109 of a geochemical signal in a stalagmite (Wong and Breecker, 2015), often based on established 1110 processes which govern stalagmite precipitation (e.g., (Buhmann and Dreybrodt, 1985)). Two recent examples (specifically of disequilibrium isotope fractionation processes proxy system 1111 1112 models) are the IsoCave model, which can examine disequilibrium isotope effects in 1113 speleothems and related implications for speleothem isotope thermometry (Guo and Zhou, 1114 2019), and the ISOLUTION model which similarly helps to better understand the effect of 1115 these disequilibrium isotope fractionation processes on stalagmite proxy records (Deininger and Scholz, 2019). The I-STAL model allows the simulation of PCP and how this affects 1116 1117 dripwater Mg, Sr, and Ba (Stoll et al., 2012). Numerous models looking specifically at drip 1118 hydrology now exist (e.g., KarstHydroModel (Baker and Bradley, 2010; Treble et al., 2003)), and these are extremely useful for understanding how the rainfall input signal is transformed 1119 before reaching the stalagmite. Rather than using hydrological or geochemical modelling, a 1120 1121 recent publication introduced a Monte Carlo approach to model rainfall and temperature 1122 seasonality in a stalagmite from La Garma Cave, northern Spain, over the Holocene (Baldini 1123 et al., 2019). Here, we build a second generation of this model and compare results to both synthetic and real-world input data. Whereas the older version of the model could only run a 1124 limited number of simulations and a run stopped once the model converged upon a solution 1125 1126 (though it could be run multiple times), this next generation model is able to run a large number (user-defined; we used 1,000 simulations in the runs presented here) of simulations
and retain the output of each one, permitting the creation of probability distributions for each
timeslice.

1130 This new model requires some widely available types of input data, including: i) a stalagmitebased  $\delta^{18}$ O record, ii) a record of regional mean annual temperature (MAT) of any resolution 1131 1132 (e.g., borehole, marine sediments, stalagmite fluid inclusions) over the interval of interest, iii) monthly-scale modern instrumental records of rainfall and temperature above the site (or as 1133 1134 close as possible to the site), and iv) cave air temperature and its relationship with above ground temperature. The relationship between meteoric precipitation  $\delta^{18}$ O and temperature 1135 at the site is useful but not required information because regional or global meteoric 1136 precipitation  $\delta^{18}$ O and temperature equations can provide a suitable alternative. 1137

Essentially, the model assumes that the MAT of the cave site is similar to the MAT of the 1138 1139 regional surface temperature input record (ii above) and produces a sine function around this 1140 value of an amplitude reflecting modern surface temperature seasonality but with random variability added to the absolute minimum and maximum temperatures (the amount of 1141 randomness is user-defined). A second sine function reflects the rainfall seasonality, and 1142 1143 whereas the temperature wave's polarity is fixed (i.e., summers are always warmer than winters), the rainfall seasonality sine wave's polarity is allowed to flip randomly (but where 1144 1145 only outputs that 'converge' are retained, and unrealistic results are rejected – see below). 1146 The seasonal extreme values ('extreme' meaning minima and maxima) associated with either sine function are fixed to the same calendar months, linked to the timing of the modern 1147 minima and maxima. 1148

These two sine waves produce synthetic monthly temperature and rainfall values, which are 1149 then converted to  $\delta^{18}O_p$  based ideally on local temperature-rainfall  $\delta^{18}O$  relationships, or in 1150 1151 cases where this relationship is not known, to more global equations (e.g., (Schubert and 1152 Jahren, 2015)). It is assumed that the  $\delta^{18}O_p$  is conveyed to the dripwater (see discussion regarding evapotranspiration, Section 4.3) and that this is converted to carbonate  $\delta^{18}$ O using 1153 the Tremaine equation (Tremaine et al., 2011) at ambient cave air temperature adjusted 1154 according to observed relationships between outside and inside air. This equation was chosen 1155 1156 as most appropriate because its empirical nature accounts for in-cave disequilibrium 1157 fractionation processes more completely than other equations. The model therefore 1158 considers seasonal changes in rainfall but is independent of total annual rainfall. The annual amount-weighted mean modelled carbonate  $\delta^{18}$ O value is then compared with the actual 1159 measured carbonate  $\delta^{18}$ O value, and if it is within a certain user-defined value, it is logged as 1160 a successful simulation. If the difference between the modelled and actual carbonate  $\delta^{18}$ O is 1161 greater than this value (generally ~0.1 per mil), the simulation is logged as unsuccessful. 1,000 1162 1163 of these coupled temperature and rainfall simulations are conducted per time slice, all the 1164 successful and unsuccessful simulations are logged, and the mean monthly modelled rainfall and temperature values calculated from the successful simulations. For a table describing the 1165 steps in the modelling process, please see Baldini et al. (2019). 1166

1167

# 1168 **5.1 Test Runs: Gradual shifts in rainfall polarity**

1169 In this section we test the ability of the second-generation model to extract seasonality 1170 information using synthetic data. The model reproduces shifts in rainfall polarity in synthetic

datasets well (Figure 7). In one experiment, the input  $\delta^{18}$ O dataset was created by using i) a 1171 temperature sine function that was set as invariant (i.e., it maintained its polarity and 1172 1173 amplitude throughout the run), and ii) a rainfall sine function that shifted in polarity 1174 completely over 14 model years. The input sine waves were used to create the annuallyresolved synthetic  $\delta^{18}$ O record but were independent from the sine waves generated by the 1175 model. The wettest month in the input rainfall record was April in Year 1, gradually changing 1176 1177 polarity to November by Year 14. As such, model Year 7 was characterised by no seasonality (Figure 7). The model was run without *a priori* knowledge of these shifts other than the mean 1178 annually-resolved synthetic  $\delta^{18}$ O record, MAT, 'modern' seasonality range, and cave 1179 1180 temperature (i.e., the simulations were run 'modeller blind'), but the output reproduced the 1181 shifting rainfall pattern very well. The gradual shift in rainfall polarity is detected, and the lack of seasonality in the input rainfall signal during Year 7 is reproduced. The input temperature 1182 data had a 15 °C annual temperature range, and two model simulations were conducted: one 1183 1184 derived using an annual seasonal temperature range of  $10 \pm 6$  °C, and a second using an annual seasonal temperature range of 15 ± 6 °C. In the case of the lower annual temperature 1185 1186 range, the model overestimates rainfall seasonality to compensate for the inappropriate 1187 annual temperature range, but still detects shifts in rainfall polarity (Figure 7). When the more 1188 appropriate temperature range is used, the simulation captures both the amplitude and 1189 polarity of the shifting rainfall input signal. However, this experiment highlights a limitation of this modelling approach;  $\delta^{18}$ O data is explicable both in terms of rainfall and temperature 1190 1191 seasonality shifts, and an unknown annual temperature range introduces uncertainties.

1192 A second experiment involved synthetic temperature and rainfall input records with both 1193 considerable inter-annual variability and noise introduced (Figure 8). Notably, one model year

(Year 4) had the polarity of the rainfall signal completely reversed. Again, the model was able
to extract the salient features of the input data very well. Reproduced were inter-annual
variations in rainfall and temperature, and, importantly, the model detected the reversed
seasonality of the rainfall signal in Year 4 (Figure 8).

1198

# 1199 **5.2** Application to a stalagmite $\delta^{18}$ O dataset from a seasonally arid continental region

1200 The first version of the model was run successfully across the Holocene using a  $\delta^{18}$ O dataset 1201 derived from the maritime climate of northern Spain (Baldini et al., 2019). Here, we apply the 1202 second-generation model to a dataset from Bir-Uja Cave in the Keklik-Too mountain ridge, Kyrgyzstan, a location characterised by extremely strong seasonal fluctuations in both 1203 1204 temperature and rainfall. The cave (40°29'N, 72°35'E) is ~60 m long and is developed at an 1205 altitude of ~1,325 m above sea level (Fohlmeister et al., 2017). The input data consisted of 1206 the  $\delta^{18}$ O dataset from stalagmite Keklik1 reported on in Fohlmeister et al. (2017), a 500-year long, centennial-resolution borehole temperature record from the Tian Shan mountains 1207 1208 (~461 km to the north of the cave site) (Huang et al., 2000), instrumental precipitation and temperature records since 1880 C.E. from Tashkent, Uzbekistan (~300 km to the east) (Menne 1209 1210 et al., 2012), and cave temperature (Fohlmeister et al., 2017). The  $\delta^{18}$ O input data were 1211 decadally-resolved, and the stalagmite was dated using a recently developed radiocarbon 1212 technique (Fohlmeister and Lechleitner, 2019; Fohlmeister et al., 2017; Lechleitner et al., 1213 2016b). The Keklik1 record extends from 2011 C.E. back to 1150 C.E., but the borehole record 1214 only extends back to 1500 C.E., so the interval modelled only extends to 1500 C.E. On average, 1215 the site receives ~450 mm of precipitation per year (based on Global Network of Isotopes in

Precipitation data from Tashkent), with ~80% falling from November to April. Summers are 1216 1217 very dry, with August (the driest month) receiving ~5 mm of rainfall. Monthly temperatures range from -1.4 °C in January to 25.0 °C in July, with a MAT of 12.1 °C. Stalagmite Keklik1 was 1218 located ~40 meters from the cave entrance and was collected in October 2011. Cave 1219 1220 temperature varies seasonally, from 12 °C from the end of November until April, to a maximum of 16.5 °C in May. The site is characterised by near 100% relative humidity in the 1221 cold season which drops considerably to ~60% during the warmer months (Fohlmeister et al., 1222 1223 2017).

1224 Unlike the Spanish GAR-01 record which extended back to ~13,500 years BP and was modelled using 100-year timeslices (Baldini et al., 2019), the Keklik1  $\delta^{18}$ O record was 1225 modelled using annual timeslices. The duration of the timeslice is user-defined and is 1226 independent of the resolution of the original stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O dataset, but a timeslice with a 1227 somewhat higher resolution than the  $\delta^{18}$ O dataset ensures that the input data are entirely 1228 1229 represented. The timings of the minimum and maximum values of the modelled temperature sine function were fixed at January and July, respectively. These months were also designated 1230 1231 as the minimum/maximum of the modelled rainfall sine wave, which fits present day 1232 observations, but the sine function's polarity was not prescribed in advance.

Baldini et al. (2019) noted that the modelled temperature curve for northern Iberia closely resembled a previously published temperature reconstruction for the region (Martin-Chivelet et al., 2011) with a temporal resolution that exceeded the information provided by the lowresolution input dataset. Although no annual-scale MAT record exists in the Kyrgyzstan region for the last 500 years, summer temperatures are well constrained by tree ring records. A comparison of the modelled July temperature derived from the Keklik1  $\delta^{18}$ O record reveals a

very good match with the NTREND AG2 temperature anomalies (~300 km to the north of the 1239 1240 cave site) (Anchukaitis et al., 2017; Cook et al., 2013) (Figure 9). The model's ability to reconstruct palaeotemperature may reflect the fact that the probability of a successful model 1241 run is maximised when modelled temperature approximates the actual temperature shift. 1242 1243 Successful model runs with a different (and incorrect) temperature pattern are possible with certain modelled rainfall simulations, but the mean monthly temperature values (reflecting 1244 the mean of all successful runs) will be biased towards model simulations with the correct 1245 1246 temperature shift. The apparently robust reconstruction of warm-season palaeotemperature is an unexpected and exciting model outcome, but one that requires further evaluation. 1247

1248 The rainfall reconstruction reproduces many of the same features highlighted by Fohlmeister 1249 et al. (2017). In particular, decreases in the winter rainfall contributions in the late 1500s, the mid-1700s, and the early 1800s are apparent in both records. This agreement is expected 1250 because the  $\delta^{18}$ O record is integral to both reconstructions, but it is interesting that the two 1251 reconstructions use two fundamentally different techniques (numerical versus geochemical 1252 1253 modelling) to estimate the importance of winter rainfall to the overall annual water budget at the site and arrive at broadly similar results. For example, a winter rainfall peak occurs in 1254 1797 CE in both records and transitions to drier winters by 1815 CE, with ~22% and ~50% 1255 reductions in winter rainfall implied by the model and  $\delta^{18}$ O data, respectively. The model 1256 1257 underestimating the reduction in rainfall probably arises because of the model's utilisation of 1258 smooth sine waves rather than more step-like functions; in other words, although it is possible for one month per year to have zero rainfall in the model, the adjacent two months 1259 1260 must necessarily have some rainfall, whereas in reality, several dry months per summer could 1261 occur. The use of step functions would permit the incorporation of several dry months annually and would amplify apparent shifts in seasonal rainfall amounts. Modelled DJFM rainfall compares reasonably well with GHCN rainfall from Tashkent (Figure 9), particularly considering that the Tashkent meteorological station is ~300 km away from and ~1,000 m lower in altitude than the cave site.

1266

### 1267 **5.3 Limitations to the modelling technique and future work**

1268 Several limitations to the presented modelling technique exist. First, the timing of the rainfall minima and maxima versus temperature signal could affect the model's efficacy; for example, 1269 if the rainiest month occurs three months after (or before) the warmest month, the use of 1270 1271 the sine function means that all outcomes are possible. This is because the maxima/minima 1272 in one parameter's sine function occur at the nodes of the other sine wave, effectively making both sine waves independent of each other. At many sites, temperature and rainfall are 1273 1274 intrinsically linked and their seasonal cycle broadly synchronous, but the above may be an 1275 issue at some locations. Additionally, the model would require a differently shaped rainfall-1276 function to model rainfall at locations with two distinct rainy intervals every year, such as low 1277 latitude sites affected by the ITCZ twice each year.

1278 The current version of the model does not incorporate evapotranspiration, and this is an 1279 obvious oversimplification. This may have repercussions for sites like Kyrgyzstan that 1280 experience a pronounced hot and dry season with negative effective infiltration. Similarly, 1281 variable kinetic fractionation almost certainly occurred within the cave (Fohlmeister et al., 1282 2017) but is not considered within the model. Future versions of the model will incorporate 1283 both evapotranspiration and kinetic effects, but the model currently likely overcomes this

limitation simply by reducing rainfall amount for months with high evapotranspiration rates.
Potentially, coupling the new model discussed here with a dripwater isotope evolution model
(e.g., ISOLUTION (Deininger and Scholz, 2019)) could produce very robust results. The model
also cannot identify intervals characterized by changes in moisture pathway or fractionation
amount; rather, it highlights intervals that are not explicable in terms of changes in
temperature or rainfall amount seasonality (intervals where the model cannot converge on
any solutions), and thus points to the involvement of other processes.

1291 The model is allowed to randomly vary MAT above or below the low-resolution temperature 1292 input record, but only within user-defined bounds. Too great a range of permissible MAT 1293 values would allow essentially any outcome. For example, if there were no limits to minimum winter temperature, a low  $\delta^{18}$ O value could be modelled as either a very cold winter with a 1294 subdued rainfall seasonality or as a mild winter but with substantial winter rain. Limiting the 1295 1296 temperature seasonality to reasonable bounds (for example, based modern interannual MAT 1297 variability) permits assessing whether any given month is warmer or colder than the low-1298 resolution temperature input, but may underestimate the total amount of cooling and warming. In extreme cases, this may manifest itself as a failure to converge upon any 1299 successful model, thus highlighting timeslices that require closer inspection and potentially 1300 an alternative explanation. 1301

As discussed in Section 5.2, the utilisation of step functions to describe rainfall seasonality may facilitate the modelling of climate for sites where several months receive similar amounts of rainfall. Future studies should investigate the ramifications of function choice on output. Additionally, theoretically arriving at a mathematical solution utilising the relevant equations and input data is possible, obviating the need for MC simulations, and future research will

investigate this possibility. Finally, future models could incorporate options for geochemicalmodelling of drip and carbonate chemistry.

1309

# 1310 6. Regional seasonality

1311 In this section we analyse global meteoric precipitation and temperature data to highlight 1312 regions experiencing pronounced seasonal variability in temperature, precipitation amount, 1313 and precipitation  $\delta^{18}$ O (Figures 10 and 11), helping to facilitate the identification of cave sites 1314 sensitive to seasonality. This also highlights locations that are at the margins of such regions, 1315 where seasonality may have affected the record in the past, despite the lack of a modern 1316 influence.

1317

### 1318 **6.1. Identification of seasonally sensitive regions**

1319 WorldClim Version 2 data were obtained at a 2.5 minute (~4.5 km at the equator) spatial resolution (Fick and Hijmans, 2017). Inland continental regions within the mid- to high-1320 1321 latitudes of the Northern Hemisphere (e.g., central and northern Canada, eastern Russia, 1322 northeast China, and Mongolia) are characterised by the greatest mean annual temperature 1323 range (Figure 10a). A greater annual temperature range is characteristic of continental climates due to the reduced oceanic influence, with ocean water's high heat capacity and 1324 1325 moderating influence on air temperature. The lowest mean annual temperature ranges occur 1326 in the low latitudes (where insolation remains high year-round) and maritime regions of the 1327 world (where oceans moderate temperature variability) (Figure 10a). The pattern of global temperature seasonality (herein calculated as the maximum temperature of the warmest
month minus the minimum temperature of the coldest month averaged over the period 1970
- 2000 based on WorldClim Version 2 data) is consistent with the geographic pattern of cave
air ventilation reported in (James et al., 2015), a study concerning the role of outside
temperature seasonality in the seasonal ventilation of caves.

1333 Seasonality in precipitation amount (Figure 10b) is greatest in the low latitudes due to the 1334 annual migration of the Intertropical Convergence Zone (ITCZ) and monsoonal systems that cause distinct wet and dry seasons, along the western coast of North America, southern South 1335 1336 America, and Europe where seasonal westerlies preferentially bring enhanced winter precipitation, and bordering the Mediterranean where a 'Mediterranean climate' 1337 characterised by wet-winters and dry-summer dominates (Figure 10b). The lowest 1338 precipitation amount seasonality occurs in arid and semi-arid regions of the world and the 1339 non-coastal mid- to high-latitudes of the northern and southern hemispheres. 1340

Global seasonality in amount-weighted  $\delta^{18}O_p$  (Figure 11) approximates the pattern of 1341 temperature seasonality (Figure 10a), with the greatest annual range in  $\delta^{18}O_p$  observed at 1342 1343 Northern Hemisphere continental interior and high latitude sites (e.g., northeast Asia, central 1344 Canada, northern Greenland). In addition, high altitude sites (e.g., the Andes in western South 1345 America, the Caucasus Mountains at the intersection of Europe and Asia) also exhibit higher annual WM  $\delta^{18}O_p$  ranges due to the altitude effect. The lowest  $\delta^{18}O_p$  seasonality occurs within 1346 maritime (e.g., NW Europe, SW and SE Australia) and arid/semi-arid regions (e.g., East Africa, 1347 eastern Brazil, South Africa). Many stalagmite records are from temperate regions where 1348 modern MAT ranges from 10 to 16 °C (Baldini et al., 2019; Baldini et al., 2015; Ban et al., 2018; 1349 Huang et al., 2001; Johnson et al., 2006; Orland et al., 2014). Global cave dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O data 1350

reveal that caves from regions with this MAT range have dripwater chemistry that reflects recharge-weighted  $\delta^{18}O_p$  (Baker et al., 2019). The seasonal distribution of  $\delta^{18}O_p$  is therefore a critical control in the case of many different stalagmite samples.

1354 In other cases, very pronounced seasonality inherent in stalagmite geochemical records are not due to seasonality in  $\delta^{18}O_p$ , but instead to seasonality in rainfall amount (Ridley et al., 1355 2015b) and associated shifts in bioproductivity (Baldini et al., 2005) or PCP (Fairchild and 1356 Hartland, 2010; Fairchild et al., 2006). Seasonality in temperature can also induce cave 1357 ventilation in temperate zone caves during the winter (providing the cave geometry is 1358 appropriate), promoting carbonate deposition within the cave and biasing annual- to decadal-1359 1360 scale records towards the winter season rainfall (James et al., 2015). The maps provided 1361 herein can help identify regions containing speleothems retaining the desired seasonal signal, and determine what the most likely control is on any seasonal signal found within a 1362 1363 stalagmite. Furthermore, the maps help highlight cave sites that are located on the peripheries of climatologically seasonal zones at present, where past seasonality shifts could 1364 have influenced a record. Examples include the Sahel and southern Belize (Figure 12), both 1365 1366 currently at the very northern extent of the ITCZ, where a small ITCZ shift to the south would 1367 produce both severe drying and a substantial decrease in rainfall seasonality. This perspective was underscored by recent results from Central America that used monthly-scale rainfall 1368 1369 proxy data over the last two millennia to suggest that the region has only been affected by 1370 the ITCZ since ~1400 C.E., and that the ITCZ influence may wane in the near future (Asmerom et al., 2020) (Figure 12). 1371

1372

#### 1373 **6.2.** Complexities despite strong seasonality: northeast India as an example

1374 The seasonality maps presented here highlight regions most likely to contain stalagmites which retain seasonal signals in temperature, rainfall amount, or  $\delta^{18}O_p$ . However, they also 1375 illustrate that not all seasonal variations in  $\delta^{18}O_p$  are explicable in regional temperature or 1376 1377 rainfall amount terms. In many cases, complex moisture source variability overprints 1378 temperature-induced seasonality, hampering the use of models such as the one presented in 1379 Section 5. Here, we discuss the Indian Summer Monsoon (ISM) as an example of such a situation, and focus specifically on Mawmluh Cave in Meghalaya, northeast India, one of the 1380 most seasonal locations on Earth in terms of rainfall amount (Fig. 10). In Meghalaya, 1381 1382 hydroclimate is characterised by extreme seasonality, as the plateau constitutes the first 1383 topographic barrier for moisture-laden air masses travelling inland from the Bay of Bengal (Murata et al., 2007; Prokop and Walanus, 2003). At present, the ISM brings ~80% of the 1384 1385 annual rainfall to the cave site, inducing extreme amounts of rainfall (up to 12 meters per 1386 year (Breitenbach et al., 2015). The seasonal precipitation cycle is reflected in rainfall  $\delta^{18}$ O 1387 composition (Berkelhammer et al., 2012; Breitenbach et al., 2010). Rainfall  $\delta^{18}$ O becomes progressively lighter during the ISM, but this effect is only partially driven by increasing 1388 precipitation intensity and the amount effect because the period of maximum precipitation 1389 1390 (June-August) precedes maximum <sup>18</sup>O depletion (August-October) (Breitenbach et al., 2010)). 1391 Instead, the <sup>18</sup>O-depletion results predominantly from the moisture source shifting from a 1392 proximal location (the Bay of Bengal) in the early and late ISM to a more distal location (the 1393 open Indian Ocean) during the peak ISM (longer transport times resulting in more Rayleigh 1394 distillation). Rainfall and dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O at Mawmluh Cave are thus highly seasonal, but the 1395 relationship between temperature, rainfall amount, and rainfall  $\delta^{18}$ O is not straightforward (Breitenbach et al., 2010; Breitenbach et al., 2015). Additional complexity arises from the 1396 filtering and buffering capacity of the karst aquifer through which rainwater percolates en 1397

*route* to a stalagmite. Although a clear seasonal dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O cycle exists, with its lowest 1398 value approximating ISM rainfall  $\delta^{18}$ O, its annual amplitude is compressed, reflecting buffering 1399 1400 in the karst (Breitenbach et al., 2015). This further complicates the interpretation of  $\delta^{18}$ O 1401 records from these stalagmites, and information from independent proxies that are sensitive 1402 to processes dominating during the winter season is required to disentangle such processes. 1403 Combining summer-sensitive  $\delta^{18}$ O with winter-sensitive Mg/Ca (reflecting PCP) permitted 1404 disentangling ISM strength and the degree of dry season dryness in a stalagmite from 1405 Mawmluh Cave (Myers et al., 2015; Ronay et al., 2019). Such a multi-proxy approach, supported by local monitoring and karst process modelling, allows robust interpretations of 1406 1407 seasonal-scale climate from stalagmites, even when the proxy seasonality is driven by more 1408 complex processes than temperature or rainfall amount alone.

1409

# 1410 **7. Future directions and recommendations**

In this review, we introduce and discuss several concepts that we hope will facilitate the 1411 1412 development and interpretation of robust seasonal-resolution climate records from 1413 stalagmites, will improve the extraction and interpretation of seasonal information from 1414 stalagmites, and promote future discussion, including: A) that replication of records should not always be an expectation without *a priori* knowledge that the drip type and 1415 environmental conditions responsible for the deposition of the stalagmites are comparable 1416 1417 (e.g., some stalagmites retain seasonal information, others do not), B) that every stalagmite-1418 based geochemical record is different and records a unique component of the environmental 1419 signal of varying complexity (i.e., each stalagmite retains an accurate history of its 1420 environment; the question is whether or not this history can be deconvolved), and C) that the

application of at least one year's worth of hourly-resolved drip rate monitoring combined 1421 1422 with a new drip classification scheme presented here may help identify stalagmites retaining a seasonal signal. Furthermore, we have (D) developed global seasonality maps of 1423 1424 temperature (as was done previously by (James et al., 2015)), meteoric precipitation amount, and meteoric precipitation  $\delta^{18}$ O ratios which allow the identification of regions sensitive to 1425 different types of seasonality recordable by stalagmites. The maps facilitate predicting what 1426 1427 type of seasonality potentially affects modern stalagmite samples from that region. They also 1428 assist in palaeoclimate interpretations by identifying locations proximal to regions with 1429 pronounced seasonality, where past migration of key atmospheric circulation systems could 1430 have altered the geochemical record retained by a stalagmite. On a similar note, we (E) present a model that interprets annual- to centennial-scale stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O records in terms 1431 1432 of seasonal temperature and meteoric precipitation seasonality shifts. Although we stress 1433 that this model only highlights one possible interpretation (that the data were modulated primarily by regional long-term mean annual temperature variability combined with 1434 1435 seasonality shifts in rainfall and temperature), often this interpretation is the most 1436 parsimonious. The modelling technique also helps identify time intervals when altered seasonality cannot account for the observed isotope shifts, suggesting that another variable 1437 1438 needs consideration. We (F) discuss four major controls on the seasonality signal within 1439 stalagmites: i) Earth atmospheric, ii) Meteoric precipitation, iii) biological (e.g., soil processes), and iv) cave atmospheric, and (G) discuss a case study from India that serves as an example 1440 1441 of a stalagmite whose seasonal signal is not derived from rainfall amount or regional 1442 temperature, but instead results from seasonal shifts in air mass trajectories (i.e., affected by 1443 seasonal shifts in Earth atmospheric processes).

Stalagmites are remarkable archives of information regarding climate (on both seasonal and 1444 1445 longer timescales), surface and cave environmental conditions, dry deposition, moisture source pathway, marine aerosols contributions, and hydrological routing. Replication of proxy 1446 records present strong support for palaeoclimatic interpretations and should remain a goal 1447 1448 of any stalagmite science research programme, but unless the climate signal-to-noise ratio of a region is unusually high, replication is only possible when comparing stalagmites deposited 1449 under similar conditions. A thorough understanding of the environmental processes affecting 1450 1451 both entire caves (e.g., ventilation) as well as individual stalagmites (e.g., drip rate) facilitates replication efforts. The geochemical record from even adjacent stalagmites will reflect 1452 numerous processes, some of which are common to the two samples but many which are 1453 1454 not, and only through a thorough understanding of the processes affecting each sample are robust (and replicable) climate interpretations achievable. However, unless analytical issues 1455 1456 exist, non-replication does not imply that one record is incorrect; rather it generally implies 1457 that the two records simply record different environmental parameters.

1458 Cave monitoring prior to the collection of a stalagmite will increase the likelihood of obtaining a record of the desired sensitivity to seasonal climate shifts, or other desired forcing. We 1459 recommend monitoring the drip feeding the stalagmite for at least one year using an 1460 1461 automated drip logger and plotting the results in a diagram similar to Figure 3 to evaluate a 1462 stalagmite's likelihood of retaining hydrological seasonality. We recommend monitoring 1463 multiple sites within the cave and selecting the most appropriate stalagmite for collection 1464 based on the monitoring results. It is worth bearing in mind that unless the seasonality signal in a stalagmite is conveyed via seasonal cave ventilation, stalagmites fed by diffuse flow drips 1465 1466 with long residence times may not retain seasonal information. Other drips that are

seasonally either dry or undersaturated with respect to carbonate will lead to the occurrence 1467 1468 of seasonal hiatuses in the stalagmites and signal loss for that particular season. Monitoring a stalagmite's drip rate and drip chemistry for as long as possible represents one of the 1469 simplest but most effective means of understanding the potential climate signal contained 1470 1471 within a sample prior to collection. This also has implications for cave conservation and protection efforts, because clearly formulated research goals and drip monitoring prior to 1472 stalagmite sample collection can greatly reduce the number of samples removed from a cave 1473 1474 for research purposes.

1475 If sample growth rate permits, we suggest that the extraction of the palaeoseasonality signal 1476 over millennial timescales is best achieved via micromilling, leaving no gap between adjacent 1477 samples, or LA-ICPMS. The major disadvantages of micromilling are that it is resource 1478 intensive and that many samples may not have growth rates high enough to permit the 1479 required temporal resolution. The major disadvantage of LA-ICPMS is that the trace element 1480 signature of a stalagmite is often dominated by site-specific factors such as temperature, sea 1481 spray, volcanic aerosols, fire, variable throughput of colloidal material, or rainfall, and consequently aligning the data with other records is sometimes complex. Micromilled 1482 carbonate powders that are divided into two or more aliquots that are subsequently analysed 1483 1484 for stable isotope ratios, trace elements, and other geochemical proxies can provide very 1485 robust interpretations (e.g., Jamieson et al., 2016). This eliminates issues of cross-correlation 1486 and enables a powerful multiproxy approach, where each stable isotope ratio value is linked directly and unambiguously to numerous elemental concentration values. The technique can 1487 yield important information regarding palaeoseasonality but is considerably more resource 1488 1489 intensive than running multiple LA-ICPMS tracks parallel to each other and the micromilled

stable isotope track. An alternative is to produce a long decadal-scale isotope ratio traverse
complemented by higher resolution transects or maps across key intervals of interest using
LA-ICPMS, SIMS, synchrotron, or µXRF to corroborate interpretations based on the longer
transects. In the future, proxy mapping at micron-scale resolution using these techniques will
help reduce uncertainties related to geometric ambiguities such as those associated with
crystal boundaries and improve the robustness of interpretations.

1496

### 1497 **9. Conclusions**

The reconstruction of palaeoseasonality using stalagmites is an exciting research direction that has yet to mature into its full potential. Numerous records of palaeoseasonality exist, but few direct reconstructions extend before the last two millennia. Ideally, future studies concluding that a decadal- to annual-scale isotope ratio record is affected by seasonality changes should support this by either using short windows of sub-annual data or by modelling.

1504 Any stalagmite-based climate proxy record is affected by inherent complexities in climate signal transfer to the stalagmite and by selective sampling of the stalagmite for analysis. A 1505 1506 high-resolution (sub-annual to annual-scale) sampling strategy coupled with appropriate site 1507 monitoring maximises the likelihood of extracting a signal approximating the climate input 1508 signal. For long records annual- to decadal-scale resolution is ideal, and shorter records could 1509 benefit from an even higher resolution if resources permit. Large shifts in isotope ratios could reflect changes in seasonality, potentially associated with the migration of key atmospheric 1510 circulation systems over the cave site. New models incorporating seasonality can provide 1511

information regarding whether observed geochemical shifts are interpretable in terms of altered seasonality, and these represent an exciting and inexpensive new research tool. A seasonal-scale sampling strategy over short intervals of interest can verify these model interpretations, and LA-ICPMS or line-scan  $\mu$ XRF represent potentially the most efficient methods to achieve this; other alternatives include monthly-scale micromilling, synchrotron analysis (SR- $\mu$ XRF), and SIMS.

The robust interpretation of stalagmite geochemical records in terms of seasonality 1518 1519 represents a key challenge for the next decade. Achieving this is complicated by multiple in-1520 cave and exogenic environmental forcings with dynamic seasonality, including: rainfall, 1521 temperature, humidity, bioproductivity, cave air  $pCO_2$ , drip rate, source moisture region and  $\delta^{18}$ O, and moisture mass trajectory from the source region. Even apparently straightforward 1522 1523  $\delta^{18}$ O records from regions with high signal-to-noise ratios typically interpretable as either 1524 varying total annual rainfall or summer rainfall may reflect another parameter instead (e.g., a 1525 change in moisture source or rainfall seasonality), as is the case with the Indian Summer 1526 Monsoon. Most records would benefit from a rigorous multi-proxy approach utilising not only multiple geochemical proxy datasets, but also site monitoring and new modelling approaches. 1527 Similarly, focussing research efforts at the same well-understood cave sites both maximises 1528 1529 the quality of interpretations and contributes to the conservation of caves and stalagmite samples. The application of multiple stalagmites from the same site but with different drip 1530 rates and affected by different amounts of disequilibrium fractionation may provide the key 1531 1532 to reconstructing formerly elusive climate variables, such as temperature. Instead of 1533 representing an irresolvable issue, we suggest that disequilibrium fractionation may present 1534 opportunities to quantify temperature, potentially even at seasonal resolutions. Similarly,

multi-proxy data could yield seasonal information even in the absence of seasonal sampling
resolution; if two or more independent proxies reflect different seasonal data, combining the
proxies could yield palaeoseasonality.

1538 Over the past few decades stalagmites have provided some of the most iconic records in palaeoclimatology. In the future, stalagmites will continue to not only provide long records of 1539 1540 exceptional quality, but they will also provide rare glimpses into palaeoseasonality at 1541 unprecedented temporal resolution. Recent microanalytical advances have facilitated the 1542 construction of exquisitely resolved stalagmite-based climate records; we are now at a stage 1543 where the interpretation of these records is catching up with their remarkable technical aspects. Extracting quantitative and accurate seasonal climate information from these 1544 1545 geochemical records is a key challenge over the next decade, and, if this is achieved, stalagmites will truly be considered in a class of their own as climate archives. 1546

1547

#### 1548 Acknowledgements

We thank SISAL and PAGES for access to the SISAL database v1b. Portions of this research were funded by European Research Council Grant #240167. Tim Horscroft is thanked for his support in facilitating the preparation of the manuscript. Ian Orland and Jasper Wassenburg are thanked for detailed constructive reviews that greatly improved the manuscript. Alex Iveson is thanked for useful comments regarding LA-ICPMS.

1554

#### 1555 **References:**

- Allison, V.C., 1923. The growth of stalagmites and stalactites. Journal of Geology 31, 106-125.
- Allison, V.C., 1926. The antiquity of the deposit in Jacob's cavern. American Museum of Natural
  History, Anthropological Papers 19, 204-225.
- 1559 Anchukaitis, K.J., Wilson, R., Briffa, K.R., Buntgen, U., Cook, E.R., D'Arrigo, R., Davi, N., Esper, J.,
- 1560 Frank, D., Gunnarson, B.E., Hegerl, G., Helama, S., Klesse, S., Krusic, P.J., Linderholm, H.W., Myglan,
- 1561 V., Osborn, T.J., Zhang, P., Rydval, M., Schneider, L., Schurer, A., Wiles, G., Zorita, E., 2017. Last
- 1562 millennium Northern Hemisphere summer temperatures from tree rings: Part II, spatially resolved
- 1563 reconstructions. Quaternary Sci. Rev. 163, 1-22.
- 1564 Arbel, Y., Greenbaum, N., Lange, J., Inbar, M., 2010. Infiltration processes and flow rates in
- developed karst vadose zone using tracers in cave drips. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms 35,1566 1682-1693.
- 1567 Arbel, Y., Greenbaum, N., Lange, J., Shtober-Zisu, N., Grodek, T., Wittenberg, L., Inbar, M., 2008.
- 1568 Hydrologic classification of cave drips in a Mediterranean climate, based on hydrograph separation
- and flow mechanisms. Israel Journal of Earth Sciences 57, 291-310.
- 1570 Asmerom, Y., Baldini, J.U.L., Prufer, K.M., Polyak, V.J., Ridley, H.E., Aquino, V.V., Baldini, L.M.,
- 1571 Breitenbach, S.F.M., Macpherson, C.G., Kennett, D.J., 2020. Intertropical convergence zone
- 1572 variability in the Neotropics during the Common Era. Science Advances 6, eaax3644.
- Atkinson, T.C., 1977. Diffuse flow and conduit flow in limestone terrain in the Mendip Hills, Somerset(Great Britain). J Hydrol 35, 93-110.
- 1575 Atkinson, T.C., Hess, J.W., Harmon, R.S., 1985. Stable isotope variations in recharge to a karstic
- 1576 aquifer, Yorkshire dales, England. Annales de la Société Géologique de Belgique 108, 225.

- 1577 Atsawawaranunt, K., Comas-Bru, L., Mozhdehi, S.A., Deininger, M., Harrison, S.P., Baker, A., Boyd,
- 1578 M., Kaushal, N., Ahmad, S.M., Brahim, Y.A., Arienzo, M., Bajo, P., Braun, K., Burstyn, Y., Chawchai, S.,
- 1579 Duan, W.H., Hatvani, I.G., Hu, J., Kern, Z., Labuhn, I., Lachniet, M., Lechleitner, F.A., Lorrey, A., Perez-
- 1580 Mejias, C., Pickering, R., Scroxton, N., Members, S.W.G., 2018. The SISAL database: a global resource
- to document oxygen and carbon isotope records from speleothems. Earth System Science Data 10,
- 1582 1687-1713.
- Ayalon, A., Bar-Matthews, M., Sass, E., 1998. Rainfall-recharge relationships within a karstic terrain
  in the Eastern Mediterranean semi-arid region, Israel: δ18O and δD characteristics Journal of
  Hydrology 207, 18-31.
- 1586 Badertscher, S., Borsato, A., Frisia, S., Cheng, H., Edwards, R.L., Tuysuz, O., Fleitmann, D., 2014.
- 1587 Speleothems as sensitive recorders of volcanic eruptions the Bronze Age Minoan eruption recorded1588 in a stalagmite from Turkey. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 392, 58-66.
- 1589 Baker, A., Barnes, W.L., Smart, P.L., 1997. Variations in the discharge and organic matter content of
- 1590 stalagmite drip waters in Lower Cave, Bristol. Hydrological Processes 11, 1541-1555.
- 1591 Baker, A., Bradley, C., 2010. Modern stalagmite δ18O: Instrumental calibration and forward
- 1592 modelling. Global and Planetary Change 71, 201-206.
- 1593 Baker, A., Brunsdon, C., 2003. Non-linearities in drip water hydrology: an example from Stump Cross
- 1594 Caverns, Yorkshire. Journal of Hydrology 277, 151-163.
- 1595 Baker, A., Hartmann, A., Duan, W., Hankin, S., Comas-Bru, L., Cuthbert, M.O., Treble, P.C., Banner, J.,
- 1596 Genty, D., Baldini, L.M., Bartolomé, M., Moreno, A., Pérez-Mejías, C., Werner, M., 2019. Global
- 1597 analysis reveals climatic controls on the oxygen isotope composition of cave drip water. Nature
- 1598 Communications 10, 2984.

- Baker, A., Smart, P.L., Edwards, R.L., Richards, D.A., 1993. Annual growth banding in a cavestalagmite. Nature 364, 518-520.
- 1601 Baker, A.J., Mattey, D.P., Baldini, J.U.L., 2014. Reconstructing modern stalagmite growth from cave
- 1602 monitoring, local meteorology, and experimental measurements of dripwater films. Earth Planet.

1603 Sci. Lett. 392, 239-249.

- Baldini, J.U.L., Bertram, R.A., Ridley, H.E., 2018. Ground air: A first approximation of the Earth's
  second largest reservoir of carbon dioxide gas. Sci. Total Environ. 616-617, 1007-1013.
- 1606 Baldini, J.U.L., McDermott, F., Baker, A., Baldini, L.M., Mattey, D.P., Railsback, L.B., 2005. Biomass
- 1607 effects on stalagmite growth and isotope ratios: A 20th century analogue from Wiltshire, England.
- 1608 Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 240, 486-494.
- 1609 Baldini, J.U.L., McDermott, F., Baldini, L.M., Ottley, C.J., Linge, K.L., Clipson, N., Jarvis, K.E., 2012.
- 1610 Identifying short-term and seasonal trends in cave drip water trace element concentrations based on
- a daily-scale automatically collected drip water dataset. Chem. Geol. 330, 1-16.
- 1612 Baldini, J.U.L., McDermott, F., Fairchild, I.J., 2002. Structure of the 8200-year cold event revealed by
- a speleothem trace element record. Science 296, 2203-2206.
- 1614 Baldini, J.U.L., McDermott, F., Fairchild, I.J., 2006. Spatial variability in cave drip water
- 1615 hydrochemistry: Implications for stalagmite paleoclimate records. Chem. Geol. 235, 390-404.
- 1616 Baldini, J.U.L., McDermott, F., Hoffmann, D.L., Richards, D.A., Clipson, N., 2008. Very high-frequency
- and seasonal cave atmosphere *P*<sub>CO2</sub> variability: Implications for stalagmite growth and oxygen
- 1618 isotope-based paleoclimate records. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 272, 118-129.
- 1619 Baldini, L.M., Baldini, J.U.L., McDermott, F., Arias, P., Cueto, M., Fairchild, I.J., Hoffmann, D.L.,
- 1620 Mattey, D.P., Müller, W., Nita, D.C., Ontañón, R., Garciá-Moncó, C., Richards, D.A., 2019. North
- 1621 Iberian temperature and rainfall seasonality over the Younger Dryas and Holocene. Quaternary Sci.1622 Rev. 226, 105998.
- 1623 Baldini, L.M., McDermott, F., Baldini, J.U.L., Arias, P., Cueto, M., Fairchild, I.J., Hoffmann, D.L.,
- 1624 Mattey, D.P., Müller, W., Nita, D.C., Ontañón, R., Garciá-Moncó, C., Richards, D.A., 2015. Regional
- 1625 temperature, atmospheric circulation, and sea-ice variability within the Younger Dryas Event
- 1626 constrained using a speleothem from northern Iberia. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 419, 101-110.
- 1627 Ban, F.M., Baker, A., Marjo, C.E., Duan, W.H., Li, X.L., Han, J.X., Coleborn, K., Akter, R., Tan, M.,
- 1628 Nagra, G., 2018. An optimized chronology for a stalagmite using seasonal trace element cycles from
- 1629 Shihua Cave, Beijing, North China. Scientific Reports 8, 4551.
- 1630 Banner, J.L., Guilfoyle, A., James, E.W., Stern, L.A., Musgrove, M., 2007. Seasonal variations in
- 1631 modern speleothem calcite growth in Central Texas, USA. J Sediment Res 77, 615-622.
- 1632 Bar-Matthews, M., Ayalon, A., Matthews, A., Sass, E., Halicz, L., 1996. Carbon and oxygen isotope
- 1633 study of the active water-carbonate system in a karstic Mediterranean cave: Implications for
- 1634 paleoclimate research in semiarid regions. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 60, 337-347.
- 1635 Bergel, S.J., Carlson, P.E., Larson, T.E., Wood, C.T., Johnson, K.R., Banner, J., Breecker, D.O., 2017.
- 1636 Constraining the subsoil carbon source to cave-air CO<sub>2</sub> and speleothem calcite in central Texas. 217,
  1637 112-127.
- Berkelhammer, M., Sinha, A., Stott, L., Cheng, H., Pausata, F.S.R., Yoshimura, K., 2012. An abrupt
  shift in the Indian Monsoon 4000 years ago. Geophysical Monograph Series 198, 75-87.
- 1640 Blyth, A.J., Baker, A., Thomas, L.E., Van Calsteren, P., 2011. A 2000-year lipid biomarker record
- 1641 preserved in a stalagmite from north-west Scotland. J. of Quaternary Sci. 26, 326-334.

- Borsato, A., Frisia, S., Fairchild, I.J., Somogyi, A., Susini, J., 2007. Trace element distribution in annual
- 1643 stalagmite laminae mapped by micrometer-resolution X-ray fluorescence: Implications for
- 1644 incorporation of environmentally significant species. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 71, 1494-1512.
- 1645 Borsato, A., Frisia, S., Hellstrom, J., Treble, P., Johnson, K., Howard, D., Greig, A., 2019. Fast high-
- 1646 resolution synchrotron micro-XRF mapping of annuallylaminated stalagmites, European Geoscience
- 1647 Union General Assembly. EGU, Vienna.
- 1648 Borsato, A., Frisia, S., Wynn, P.M., Fairchild, I.J., Miorandi, R., 2015. Sulphate concentration in cave
- 1649 dripwater and speleothems: long-term trends and overview of its significance as proxy for
- 1650 environmental processes and climate changes. Quaternary Sci. Rev. 127, 48-60.
- 1651 Breecker, D.O., Payne, A.E., Quade, J., Banner, J.L., Ball, C.E., Meyer, K.W., Cowan, B.D., 2012. The
- 1652 sources and sinks of CO2 in caves under mixed woodland and grassland vegetation. Geochim.
- 1653 Cosmochim. Acta 96, 230-246.
- 1654 Breitenbach, S.F.M., Adkins, J.F., Meyer, H., Marwan, N., Kumar, K.K., Haug, G.H., 2010. Strong
- 1655 influence of water vapor source dynamics on stable isotopes in precipitation observed in Southern
- 1656 Meghalaya, NE India. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 292, 212-220.
- Breitenbach, S.F.M., Bernasconi, S.M., 2011. Carbon and oxygen isotope analysis of small carbonate
  samples (20 to 100 mu g) with a GasBench II preparation device. Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom.
  25, 1910-1914.
- 1660 Breitenbach, S.F.M., Lechleitner, F.A., Meyer, H., Diengdoh, G., Mattey, D., Marwan, N., 2015. Cave
- 1661 ventilation and rainfall signals in dripwater in a monsoonal setting a monitoring study from NE
- 1662 India. Chemical Geology 402, 111-124.
- 1663 Breitenbach, S.F.M., Plessen, B., Waltgenbach, S., Tjallingii, R., Leonhardt, J., Jochum, K.P., Meyer, H.,
- 1664 Goswami, B., Marwan, N., Scholz, D., 2019. Holocene interaction of maritime and continental climate

- 1665 in Central Europe: New speleothem evidence from Central Germany. Global and Planet. Change 176,1666 144-161.
- Broecker, W.S., 1960. Radiocarbon measurements and annual rings in cave formations. Nature 185,93-94.
- 1669 Broughton, P.L., 1983. Environmental Implications of competitive growth fabrics in stalactitic
- 1670 carbonate. International Journal of Speleology. 13, 31-41.
- 1671 Buhmann, D., Dreybrodt, W., 1985. The kinetics of calcite dissolution and precipitation in
- 1672 geologically relevant situations of karst areas. 2. closed system. Chem. Geol. 53, 109-124.
- 1673 Cabellero, E., Jimenez de Cisneros, C., Reyes, E., 1996. A stable isotope study of cave seepage waters.
- 1674 Applied Geochemistry 11, 583-587.
- 1675 Carlson, P.E., Miller, N.R., Banner, J.L., Breecker, D.O., Casteel, R.C., 2018. The potential of near-
- 1676 entrance stalagmites as high-resolution terrestrial paleoclimate proxies: Application of isotope and
- 1677 trace-element geochemistry to seasonally-resolved chronology. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta
- 1678 235, 55-75.
- 1679 Chapman, J.B., Ingraham, N.L., Hess, J.W., 1992. Isotopic investigation of infiltration and unsaturated
  1680 zone flow processes at Carlsbad Caverns. Journal of Hydrology 133, 343-363.
- 1681 Chen, C.-J., Li, T.-Y., 2018. Geochemical characteristics of cave drip water respond to ENSO based on
- a 6-year monitoring work in Yangkou Cave, Southwest China. Journal of Hydrology 561, 896-907.
- 1683 Cheng, H., Lawrence Edwards, R., Shen, C.-C., Polyak, V.J., Asmerom, Y., Woodhead, J., Hellstrom, J.,
- 1684 Wang, Y., Kong, X., Spötl, C., Wang, X., Calvin Alexander, E., 2013. Improvements in 230Th dating,
- 1685 230Th and 234U half-life values, and U–Th isotopic measurements by multi-collector inductively
- 1686 coupled plasma mass spectrometry. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 371-372, 82-91.

- Cole, J.M., Nienstedt, J., Spataro, G., Rasbury, E.T., Lanzirotti, A., Celestian, A.J., Nilsson, M., Hanson,
  G.N., 2003. Phosphor imaging as a tool for in situ mapping of ppm levels of uranium and thorium in
  rocks and minerals. Chem. Geol. 193, 127-136.
- 1690 Comas-Bru, L., Harrison, S.P., 2019. SISAL: Bringing Added Value to Speleothem Research.

1691 Quaternary 2, 7.

- 1692 Comas-Bru, L., Harrison, S.P., Werner, M., Rehfeld, K., Scroxton, N., Veiga-Pires, C., Ahmad, S.M.,
- 1693 Brahim, Y.A., Mozhdehi, S.A., Arienzo, M., Atsawawaranunt, K., Baker, A., Braun, K., Breitenbach, S.,
- 1694 Burstyn, Y., Chawchai, S., Columbu, A., Deininger, M., Demeny, A., Dixon, B., Hatvani, I.G., Hu, J.,
- 1695 Kaushal, N., Kern, Z., Labuhn, I., Lachniet, M.S., Lechleitner, F.A., Lorrey, A., Markowska, M., Nehme,
- 1696 C., Novello, V.F., Oster, J., Perez-Mejias, C., Pickering, R., Sekhon, N., Wang, X.F., Warken, S.,
- 1697 Atkinson, T., Ayalon, A., Baldini, J., Bar-Matthews, M., Bernal, J.P., Boch, R., Borsato, A., Boyd, M.,
- 1698 Brierley, C., Cai, Y.J., Carolin, S., Cheng, H., Constantin, S., Couchoud, I., Cruz, F., Denniston, R.,
- 1699 Dragusin, V., Duan, W.H., Ersek, V., Finne, M., Fleitmann, D., Fohlmeister, J., Frappier, A., Genty, D.,
- 1700 Holzkamper, S., Hopley, P., Johnston, V., Kathayat, G., Keenan-Jones, D., Koltai, G., Li, T.Y., Lone,
- 1701 M.A., Luetscher, M., Mattey, D., Moreno, A., Moseley, G., Psomiadis, D., Ruan, J.Y., Scholz, D., Sha,
- 1702 L.J., Smith, A.C., Strikis, N., Treble, P., Unal-Imer, E., Vaks, A., Vansteenberge, S., Voarintsoa, N.R.G.,
- 1703 Wong, C., Wortham, B., Wurtzel, J., Zhang, H., Grp, S.W., 2019. Evaluating model outputs using
- 1704 integrated global speleothem records of climate change since the last glacial. Clim Past 15, 1557-

1705 1579.

- 1706 Cook, E.R., Krusic, P.J., Anchukaitis, K.J., Buckley, B.M., Nakatsuka, T., Sano, M., Asia2K, P., 2013.
- 1707 Tree-ring reconstructed summer temperature anomalies for temperate East Asia since 800 CE. Clim.
  1708 Dynam. 41, 2957-2972.
- 1709 Cowan, B.D., Osborne, M.C., Banner, J.L., 2013. Temporal variability of cave air PCO2 in Central
  1710 Texas. J Cave Karst Stud 75, 38-50.

- 1711 Cruz Jr., F.W., Karmann, I., Vianna, J., O., Burns, S.J., Ferrari, J.A., Vuille, M., Sial, A.N., Moreira, M.Z.,
- 1712 2005. Stable isotope study of cave percolation waters in subtropical Brazil: Implications for
- 1713 paleoclimate inferences from speleothems. Chemical Geology 220, 245-262.
- 1714 Czuppon, G., Demény, A., Leél-Össy, S., Óvari, M., Stieber, J., Kiss, K., Kármán, K., Surányi, G.,
- 1715 Haszpra, L., 2018. Cave monitoring in the Béke and Baradla caves (Northeastern Hungary):
- 1716 implications for the conditions for the formation cave carbonates. International Journal of
- 1717 Speleology, 13-28.
- 1718 Daëron, M., Drysdale, R.N., Peral, M., Huyghe, D., Blamart, D., Coplen, T.B., Lartaud, F., Zanchetta,
- 1719 G., 2019. Most Earth-surface calcites precipitate out of isotopic equilibrium. Nat Commun 10.
- 1720 Deininger, M., McDermott, F., Mudelsee, M., Werner, M., Frank, N., Mangini, A., 2017. Coherency of
- 1721 late Holocene European speleothem delta O-18 records linked to North Atlantic Ocean circulation.
- 1722 Clim. Dynam. 49, 595-618.
- 1723 Deininger, M., Scholz, D., 2019. ISOLUTION 1.0: an ISOtope evoLUTION model describing the stable
- 1724 oxygen (delta O-18) and carbon (delta C-13) isotope values of speleothems. Int J Speleol 48, 21-32.
- 1725 Deininger, M., Werner, M., McDermott, F., 2016. North Atlantic Oscillation controls on oxygen and
- 1726 hydrogen isotope gradients in winter precipitation across Europe; implications for palaeoclimate
- 1727 studies. Clim Past 12, 2127-2143.
- 1728 Dredge, J., Fairchild, I.J., Harrison, R.M., Fernandez-Cortes, A., Sanchez-Moral, S., Jurado, V., Gunn, J.,
- 1729 Smith, A., Spotl, C., Mattey, D., Wynn, P.M., Grassineau, N., 2013. Cave aerosols: distribution and
- 1730 contribution to speleothem geochemistry. Quaternary Sci. Rev. 63, 23-41.
- 1731 Dreybrodt, W., 1980. Deposition of calcite from thin films of natural calcareous solutions and the
- 1732 growth of speleothems. Chem. Geol. 29, 89-105.

- 1733 Dreybrodt, W., 1988. Processes in karst systems physics, chemistry and geology. Springer, Berlin,
  1734 New York.
- 1735 Dreybrodt, W., 1999. Chemical kinetics, speleothem growth and climate. Boreas 28, 347-356.
- 1736 Dreybrodt, W., Deininger, M., 2014. The impact of evaporation to the isotope composition of DIC in
- 1737 calcite precipitating water films in equilibrium and kinetic fractionation models. Geochim.
- 1738 Cosmochim. Acta 125, 433-439.
- 1739 Duan, F.C., Wu, J.Y., Wang, Y.J., Edwards, R.L., Cheng, H., Kong, X.G., Zhang, W.H., 2015. A 3000-yr
- 1740 annually laminated stalagmite record of the Last Glacial Maximum from Hulu Cave, China.
- 1741 Quaternary Res. 83, 360-369.
- 1742 Duan, W., Ruan, J., Luo, W., Li, T., Tian, L., Zeng, G., Zhang, D., Bai, Y., Li, J., Tao, T., Zhang, P., Baker,
- 1743 A., Tan, M., 2016. The transfer of seasonal isotopic variability between precipitation and drip water
- 1744 at eight caves in the monsoon regions of China. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 183, 250-266.
- 1745 Edwards, L.R., Chen, J.H., Wasserburg, G.J., 1987. 238U-234U-230Th-232Th systematics and the
- 1746 precise measurement of time over the past 500,000 years. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 81, 175-192.
- 1747 Edwards, R.L., Gallup, C.D., 1993. Dating of the Devils Hole Calcite Vein. Science 259, 1626-1627.
- 1748 Emiliani, C., 1955. Pleistocene temperatures. Journal of Geology 63, 538-578.
- 1749 Epstein, S., Buchsbaum, R., Lowenstam, H.A., Urey, H.C., 1951. Carbonate-water isotopic
- temperature scale. Bulletin of the Geological Society of America 62, 417-427.
- 1751 Evans, D., Müller, W., 2013. LA-ICPMS elemental imaging of complex discontinuous carbonates: An
- example using large benthic foraminifera. J. Anal. At. Spectrom. 28, 1039-1044.
- 1753 Evans, M.N., Tolwinski-Ward, S.E., Thompson, D.M., Achukaitis, K.J., 2013. Applications of proxy
- 1754 system modeling in high resolution paleoclimatology. Quaternary Science Reviews 76, 16-28.

- Faimon, J., Lang, M., 2013. Variances in airflows during different ventilation modes in a dynamic Ushaped cave. Int J Speleol 42, 115-122.
- Fairchild, I.J., Baker, A., 2012. Speleothem Science: From Processes to Past Environments. WileyBlackwell, Chichester, UK.
- 1759 Fairchild, I.J., Baker, A., Borsato, A., Frisia, S., Hinton, R.W., McDermott, F., Tooth, A.F., 2001. Annual
- to sub-annual resolution of multiple trace-element trends in speleothems. Journal of the GeologicalSociety of London 158, 831-841.
- 1762 Fairchild, I.J., Borsato, A., Tooth, A.F., Frisia, S., Hawkesworth, C.J., Huang, Y., McDermott, F., Spiro,
- 1763 B., 2000. Controls on trace element (Sr-Mg) compositions of carbonate cave waters: implications for
- 1764 speleothem climatic records. Chem. Geol. 166, 255-269.
- Fairchild, I.J., Hartland, A., 2010. Trace element variations in stalagmites: controls by climate and by
  karst system processes. EMU Notes in Mineralogy 10, 259-287.
- 1767 Fairchild, I.J., Smith, C.L., Baker, A., Fuller, L., Spotl, C., Mattey, D., McDermott, F., Eimp, 2006.
- 1768 Modification and preservation of environmental signals in speleothems. Earth Sci. Rev. 75, 105-153.
- 1769 Fairchild, I.J., Treble, P.C., 2009. Trace elements in speleothems as recorders of environmental
- 1770 change. Quaternary Science Reviews 28, 449-468.
- 1771 Feng, W., Casteel, R.C., Banner, J.L., Heinze-Fry, A., 2014. Oxygen isotope variations in rainfall, drip-
- 1772 water and speleothem calcite from a well-ventilated cave in Texas, USA: Assessing a new
- 1773 speleothem temperature proxy. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 127, 233-250.
- 1774 Feng, X., Porporato, A., Rodriguez-Iturbe, I., 2013. Changes in rainfall seasonality in the tropics.
- 1775 Nature Climate Change 3, 811-815.

- 1776 Fick, S.E., Hijmans, R.J., 2017. WorldClim 2: new 1-km spatial resolution climate surfaces for global
  1777 land areas. Int J Climatol 37, 4302-4315.
- 1778 Finch, A.A., Shaw, P.A., Weedon, G.P., Holmgren, K., 2001. Trace element variation in speleothem
- aragonite: potential for palaeoenvironmental reconstruction. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 186, 255-267.
- 1780 Fohlmeister, J., Lechleitner, F.A., 2019. STAlagmite dating by radiocarbon (star): A software tool for
- 1781 reliable and fast age depth modelling. Quat Geochronol 51, 120-129.
- 1782 Fohlmeister, J., Plessen, B., Dudashvili, A.S., Tjallingii, R., Wolff, C., Gafurov, A., Cheng, H., 2017.
- 1783 Winter precipitation changes during the Medieval Climate Anomaly and the Little Ice Age in arid
- 1784 Central Asia. Quaternary Science Reviews 178, 24-36.
- 1785 Frappier, A., Sahagian, D., González, L.A., Carpenter, S.J., 2002. El Niño Events Recorded by
- 1786 Stalagmite Carbon Isotopes. Science 298, 565-565.
- 1787 Frappier, A.B., Sahagian, D., Carpenter, S.J., González, L.A., Frappier, B.R., 2007. Stalagmite stable
- isotope record of recent tropical cyclone events. Geology 35.
- 1789 Frick, D.A., Schuessler, J.A., von Blanckenburg, F., 2016. Development of routines for simultaneous in
- 1790 situ chemical composition and stable Si isotope ratio analysis by femtosecond laser ablation
- inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry. Analytica Chimica Acta 938, 33-43.
- 1792 Frisia, S., 2015. Microstratigraphic logging of calcite fabrics in speleothems as tool for palaeoclimate
- 1793 studies. Int J Speleol 44, 1-16.
- 1794 Frisia, S., Borsato, A., Fairchild, I.J., McDermott, F., 2000. Calcite fabrics, growth mechanisms, and
- 1795 environments of formation in speleothems from the Italian Alps and southwestern Ireland. J
- 1796 Sediment Res 70, 1183-1196.

- 1797 Frisia, S., Borsato, A., Fairchild, I.J., Susini, J., 2005. Variations in atmospheric sulphate recorded in
- 1798 stalagmites by synchrotron micro-XU and XANES analyses. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 235, 729-740.
- 1799 Frisia, S., Borsato, A., Hellstrom, J., 2018. High spatial resolution investigation of nucleation, growth
- 1800 and early diagenesis in speleothems as exemplar for sedimentary carbonates. Earth Sci. Rev. 178, 68-
- 1801 91.
- 1802 Frisia, S., Borsato, A., Susini, J., 2008. Synchrotron radiation applications to past volcanism archived
  1803 in speleothems: An overview. J. Volcanol. Geotherm. Res. 177, 96-100.
- 1804 Gascoyne, M., Schwarcz, H.P., Ford, D.C., 1980. A palaeotemperature record for the mid-Wisconsin
  1805 in Vancouver Island. Nature 285, 474-476.
- 1806 Gazis, C., Feng, X.H., 2004. A stable isotope study of soil water: evidence for mixing and preferential
  1807 flow paths. Geoderma 119, 97-111.
- 1808 Genty, D., 2008. Palaeoclimate research in Villars Cave (Dordogne, SW France). Int J Speleol 37, 1731809 191.
- 1810 Genty, D., Baker, A., Vokal, B., 2001. Intra- and inter-annual growth rate of modern stalagmites.
- 1811 Chemical Geology 176, 191-212.
- 1812 Genty, D., Deflandre, G., 1998. Drip flow variations under a stalactite of the Père Noël cave
- 1813 (Belgium). Evidence of seasonal variations and air pressure constraints. J Hydrol 211, 208-232.
- 1814 Guo, W., Zhou, C., 2019. Patterns and controls of disequilibrium isotope effects in speleothems:
- 1815 Insights from an isotope-enabled diffusion-reaction model and implications for quantitative
- 1816 thermometry. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 267, 196-226.
- 1817 Harmon, R.S., 1979. An isotopic study of groundwater seepage in the Central Kentucky karst. Water
- 1818 Resources Research 15, 476.

- Hartland, A., Fairchild, I.J., Lead, J.R., 2009. Colloids in karstic percolation waters: Implications for the
  interpretation of trace element variations in speleothems. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 73, A498A498.
- 1822 Hartland, A., Fairchild, I.J., Lead, J.R., Baker, A., 2010. Fluorescent properties of organic carbon in
- 1823 cave dripwaters: Effects of filtration, temperature and pH. Sci. Total Environ. 408, 5940-5950.
- Hartland, A., Fairchild, I.J., Lead, J.R., Borsato, A., Baker, A., Frisia, S., Baalousha, M., 2012. From soil
  to cave: Transport of trace metals by natural organic matter in karst dripwaters. Chem. Geol. 304,
  68-82.
- 1827 Hartland, A., Fairchild, I.J., Lead, J.R., Zhang, H., Baalousha, M., 2011. Size, speciation and lability of
- 1828 NOM-metal complexes in hyperalkaline cave dripwater. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 75, 7533-7551.
- Hellstrom, J., 2003. Rapid and accurate U/Th dating using parallel ion-counting multi-collector ICPMS. J. Anal. At. Spectrom. 18, 1346-1351.
- 1831 Helser, T.E., Kastelle, C.R., McKay, J.L., Orland, I.J., Kodzon, R., Valley, J.W., 2018. Evaluation of
- 1832 micromilling/conventional isotope ratio mass spectrometry and secondary ion mass spectrometry of
- 1833 δ18O values in fish otoliths for sclerochronology. Rapid Commun Mass Spectrom 32, 1781-1790.
- 1834 Hendy, C.H., Wilson, A.T., 1968. Paleoclimatic data from speleothems. Nature 216, 48-51.
- 1835 Hess, J.W., White, W.B., 1989. Water Budget and Physical Hydrology, in: B., W.W., White, E.L. (Eds.),
- 1836 Karst Hydrology: Concepts from the Mammoth Cave Area. Springer-Verlag, Boston, pp. 105-126.
- 1837 Hoffmann, D.L., Prytulak, J., Richards, D.A., Elliott, T.R., Coath, C.D., Smart, P.L., Scholz, D., 2007.
- 1838 Procedures for accurate U and Th isotope measurements by high precision MC-ICPMS. Int. J. Mass
- 1839 Spectrom. Ion Processes 264, 97-109.

- Hsiang, S.M., Burke, M., Miguel, E., 2013. Quantifying the Influence of Climate on Human Conflict.Science 341, 1235367.
- 1842 Hu, C., Henderson, G.M., Huang, J., Xie, S., Sun, Y., Johnson, K.R., 2008. Quantification of Holocene
- 1843 Asian monsoon rainfall from spatially separated cave records. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 266, 221-232.
- 1844 Huang, S.P., Pollack, H.N., Shen, P.Y., 2000. Temperature trends ever the past five centuries
- 1845 reconstructed from borehole temperatures. Nature 403, 756-758.
- 1846 Huang, Y., Fairchild, I.J., 2001. Partitioning of Sr<sup>2+</sup> and Mg<sup>2+</sup> into calcite under karst-analogue
- 1847 experimental conditions. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 65, 47-62.
- 1848 Huang, Y., Fairchild, I.J., Borsato, A., Frisia, S., Cassidy, N.J., McDermott, F., Hawkesworth, C.J., 2001.
- 1849 Seasonal variations in Sr, Mg and P in modern speleothems (Grotta di Ernesto, Italy). Chem. Geol.
- 1850 175, 429-448.
- 1851 IAEA, 2001. GNIP Maps and Animations. , Vienna.
- 1852 IAEA/WMO, 2001. Global Network of Isotopes in Precipitation. The GNIP Database.
- 1853 James, E., Banner, J., Hardt, B., 2015. A global model for cave ventilation and seasonal bias in
- 1854 speleothem paleoclimate records.
- 1855 Jamieson, R.A., Baldini, J.U.L., Brett, M.J., Taylor, J., Ridley, H.E., Ottley, C.J., Prufer, K.M.,
- 1856 Wassenburg, J.A., Scholz, D., Breitenbach, S.F.M., 2016. Intra- and inter-annual uranium
- 1857 concentration variability in a Belizean stalagmite controlled by prior aragonite precipitation: A new
- 1858 tool for reconstructing hydro-climate using aragonitic speleothems. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 190,

1859 332-346.

- Jamieson, R.A., Baldini, J.U.L., Frappier, A.B., Muller, W., 2015. Volcanic ash fall events identified
  using principle component analysis of a high-resolution speleothem trace element dataset. Earth
  Planet. Sci. Lett. 426, 36-45.
- 1863 Johnson, K.R., Hu, C., Belshaw, N.S., Henderson, G.M., 2006. Seasonal trace-element and stable-
- 1864 isotope variations in a Chinese speleothem: The potential for high-resolution paleomonsoon
- 1865 reconstruction. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 244, 394-407.
- 1866 Kaufman, A., Bar-Matthews, M., Ayalon, A., Carmi, I., 2003. The vadose flow above Soreq Cave,
- 1867 Israel: a tritium study of the cave waters. Journal of Hydrology 273, 155-163.
- 1868 Kennett, D.J., Breitenbach, S.F.M., Aquino, V.V., Asmerom, Y., Awe, J., Baldini, J.U.L., Bartlein, P.,
- 1869 Culleton, B.J., Ebert, C., Jazwa, C., Macri, M.J., Marwan, N., Polyak, V., Prufer, K.M., Ridley, H.E.,
- 1870 Sodemann, H., Winterhalder, B., Haug, G.H., 2012. Development and Disintegration of Maya Political
- 1871 Systems in Response to Climate Change. Science 338, 788-791.
- 1872 Khiewtam, R.S., Ramakrishnan, P.S., 1993. Litter and fine root dynamics of a relict sacred grove
- 1873 forest at Cherrapunji in north-eastern India. Forest Ecology and Management 60, 327-344.
- 1874 Kita, N.T., Huberty, J.M., Kozdon, R., Beard, B.L., Valley, J.W., 2011. High-precision SIMS oxygen,
- 1875 sulfur and iron stable isotope analyses of geological materials: accuracy, surface topography and
- 1876 crystal orientation. Surf. Interface Anal. 43, 427-431.
- 1877 Kolodny, Y., Bar-Matthews, M., Ayalon, A., McKeegan, K.D., 2003. A high spatial resolution  $\delta^{18}$ O
- 1878 profile of a speleothem using an ion-microprobe. Chemical Geology 197, 21-28.
- 1879 Köppen, W., 1918. Classification of climates according to temperature, precipitation and course of
  1880 the year. Petermanns Mitt 64, 193-203.

- 1881 Kuczumow, A., Genty, D., Chevallier, P., Nowak, J., Ro, C.U., 2003. Annual resolution analysis of a
- 1882 SW-France stalagmite by X-ray synchrotron microprobe analysis. Spectrochim Acta B 58, 851-865.
- 1883 Kuczumow, A., Vekemans, B., Schalm, O., Gysels, K., Ro, C.U., Van Grieken, R., 2001. Analysis of
- 1884 speleothems by electron and X-ray microprobes. J. Anal. At. Spectrom. 16, 90-95.
- 1885 Kylander-Clark, A.R.C., Hacker, B.R., Cottle, J.M., 2013. Laser-ablation split-stream ICP
- 1886 petrochronology. Chemical Geology 345, 99-112.
- 1887 Lachniet, M.S., 2009. Climatic and environmental controls on speleothem oxygen-isotope values.
- 1888 Quaternary Science Reviews 28, 412-432.
- 1889 Lauritzen, S., 1995. High Resolution Paleotemperature Proxy Record for the Last Interglaciation
- 1890 Based on Norwegian Speleothems. Quaternary Res. 43, 133-146.
- 1891 Lauritzen, S., Lundberg, J., 1999. Calibration of the speleothem delta function: an absolute
- temperature record for the Holocene in northern Norway. Holocene 9, 659-669.
- 1893 Lechleitner, F.A., Baldini, J.U.L., Breitenbach, S.F.M., Fohlmeister, J., McIntyre, C., Goswami, B.,
- 1894 Jamieson, R.A., van der Voort, T.S., Prufer, K., Marwan, N., Culleton, B.J., Kennett, D.J., Asmerom, Y.,
- 1895 Polyak, V., Eglinton, T.I., 2016a. Hydrological and climatological controls on radiocarbon
- 1896 concentrations in a tropical stalagmite. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 194, 233-252.
- 1897 Lechleitner, F.A., Fohlmeister, J., McIntyre, C., Baldini, L.M., Jamieson, R.A., Hercman, H.,
- 1898 Gąsiorowski, M., Pawlak, J., Stefaniak, K., Socha, P., Eglinton, T.I., Baldini, J.U.L., 2016b. A novel
- approach for construction of radiocarbon-based chronologies for speleothems. Quaternary
- 1900 Geochronology 35, 54-66.
- 1901 Li, F., Vanwezer, N., Boivin, N., Gao, X., Ott, F., Petraglia, M., Roberts, P., 2019. Heading north: Late
- 1902 Pleistocene environments and human dispersals in central and eastern Asia. Plos One 14, e0216433.

- Linzmeier, B.J., Kitajima, K., Denny, A.C., Cammack, J.N., 2018. Making maps on a micrometer scale.Eos 99.
- Liu, Y., Tang, G., Ling, X., Hu, C., Li, X., 2015. Speleothem annual layers revealed by seasonal SIMS
   δ180 measurements. Science China Earth Sciences 58, 1741-1747.
- 1907 Liu, Y.H., Henderson, G.M., Hu, C.Y., Mason, A.J., Charnley, N., Johnson, K.R., Xie, S.C., 2013. Links
- between the East Asian monsoon and North Atlantic climate during the 8,200 year event. Nat.Geosci. 6, 117-120.
- 1910 Luetscher, M., Boch, R., Sodemann, H., Spotl, C., Cheng, H., Edwards, R.L., Frisia, S., Hof, F., Müller,
- 1911 W., 2015. North Atlantic storm track changes during the Last Glacial Maximum recorded by Alpine
- 1912 speleothems. Nat Commun 6, 6344.
- 1913 Luo, T., Hu, Z., Zhang, W., Günther, D., Liu, Y., Zong, K., Hu, S., 2018. Reassessment of the influence
- 1914 of carrier gases He and Ar on signal intensities in 193 nm excimer LA-ICP-MS analysis. Journal of
- 1915 Analytical Atomic Spectrometry 33, 1655-1663.
- 1916 Luo, W., Wang, S., Zeng, G., Zhu, X., Liu, W., 2014. Daily response of drip water isotopes to
- 1917 precipitation in Liangfeng Cave, Guizhou Province, SW China. Quaternary International 349, 153-158.
- 1918 Markowska, M., Baker, A., Andersen, M.S., Jex, C.N., Cuthbert, M.O., Rau, G.C., Graham, P.W.,
- 1919 Rutlidge, H., Mariethoz, G., Marjo, C.E., Treble, P.C., Edwards, N., 2016. Semi-arid zone caves:
- 1920 Evaporation and hydrological controls on delta O-18 drip water composition and implications for
- 1921 speleothem paleoclimate reconstructions. Quaternary Sci. Rev. 131, 285-301.
- 1922 Markowska, M., Baker, A., Treble, P.C., Andersen, M.S., Hankin, S., Jex, C.N., Tadros, C.V., Roach, R.,
- 1923 2015. Unsaturated zone hydrology and cave drip discharge water response: Implications for
- speleothem paleoclimate record variability. J Hydrol 529, 662-675.

- Markowska, M., Fohlmeister, J., Treble, P.C., Baker, A., Andersen, M.S., Hua, Q., 2019. Modelling the
  14C bomb-pulse in young speleothems using a soil carbon continuum model. Geochim. Cosmochim.
  Acta 261, 342-367.
- 1928 Martin-Chivelet, J., Munoz-Garcia, M.B., Edwards, R.L., Turrero, M.J., Ortega, A.I., 2011. Land surface
- 1929 temperature changes in Northern Iberia since 4000 yr BP, based on delta C-13 of speleothems.
- 1930 Global and Planet. Change 77, 1-12.
- 1931 Martin-Garcia, R., Alonso-Zarza, A.M., Martin-Perez, A., Schroder-Ritzrau, A., Ludwig, T., 2014.
- 1932 Relationships between colour and diagenesis in the aragonite-calcite speleothems in Basajaun Etxea
- 1933 cave, Spain. Sediment Geol 312, 63-75.
- 1934 Mattey, D., Collister, C., 2008. Controls on water drop volume at speleothem drip sites: An
- 1935 experimental study. J Hydrol 358, 259-267.
- 1936 Mattey, D., Lowry, D., Duffet, J., Fisher, R., Hodge, E., Frisia, S., 2008. A 53 year seasonally resolved
- 1937 oxygen and carbon isotope record from a modem Gibraltar speleothem: Reconstructed drip water
- and relationship to local precipitation. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 269, 80-95.
- 1939 Mattey, D.P., Atkinson, T.C., Barker, J.A., Fisher, R., Latin, J.P., Durell, R., Ainsworth, M., 2016. Carbon
- dioxide, ground air and carbon cycling in Gibraltar karst. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 184, 88-113.
- 1941 Mattey, D.P., Fairchild, I.J., Atkinson, T.C., 2009. Seasonal microclimate control on calcite fabrics,
- 1942 stable isotopes and trace elements in modern speleothem from St. Michaels Cave, Gibraltar.
- 1943 Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 73, A849-A849.
- 1944 Mattey, D.P., Fairchild, I.J., Atkinson, T.C., Latin, J.-P., Ainsworth, M., Durell, R., 2010. Seasonal
- 1945 microclimate control of calcite fabrics, stable isotopes and trace elements in modern speleothem
- 1946 from St Michaels cave, Gibraltar in: Pedley, H.M., Rogerson, M. (Eds.), Tufas and Speleothems:

- 1947 Unravelling the Microbial and Physical Controls. Geological Society of London Special Publication,1948 London, pp. 323-344.
- 1949 Maupin, C.R., Partin, J.W., Shen, C.C., Quinn, T.M., Lin, K., Taylor, F.W., Banner, J.L., Thirumalai, K.,
- 1950 Sinclair, D.J., 2014. Persistent decadal-scale rainfall variability in the tropical South Pacific
- 1951 Convergence Zone through the past six centuries. Clim Past 10, 1319-1332.
- McDermott, F., 2004. Palaeo-climate reconstruction from stable isotope variations in speleothems: a
  review. Quaternary Sci. Rev. 23, 901-918.
- 1954 McDermott, F., Atkinson, T.C., Fairchild, I.J., Baldini, L.M., Mattey, D.P., 2011. A first evaluation of the
- 1955 spatial gradients in delta O-18 recorded by European Holocene speleothems. Global and Planet.
- 1956 Change 79, 275-287.
- 1957 McMillan, E.A., Fairchild, I.J., Frisia, S., Borsato, A., McDermott, F., 2005. Annual trace element cycles
- 1958 in calcite-aragonite speleothems: evidence of drought in the western Mediterranean 1200-1100 yr
- 1959 BP. J. of Quaternary Sci. 20, 423-433.
- 1960 Menne, M.J., Durre, I., Vose, R.S., Gleason, B.E., Houston, T.G., 2012. An Overview of the Global
- 1961 Historical Climatology Network-Daily Database. J Atmos Ocean Tech 29, 897-910.
- Mickler, P.J., Stern, L.A., Banner, J.L., 2006. Large kinetic isotope effects in modern speleothems.
  Geol. Soc. Am. Bull. 118, 65-81.
- 1964 Millo, C., Strikis, N.M., Vonhof, H.B., Deininger, M., da Cruz, F.W., Wang, X.F., Cheng, H., Edwards,
- 1965 R.L., 2017. Last glacial and Holocene stable isotope record of fossil dripwater from subtropical Brazil
- 1966 based on analysis of fluid inclusions in stalagmites. Chem. Geol. 468, 84-96.
- 1967 Mischel, S.A., Scholz, D., Spötl, C., 2015. δ180 values of cave drip water: a promising proxy for the
- reconstruction of the North Atlantic Oscillation? Climate Dynamics 45, 3035-3050.

- 1969 Moerman, J.W., Cobb, K.M., Partin, J.W., Meckler, A.N., Carolin, S.A., Adkins, J.F., Lejau, S., Malang,
- 1970 J., Clark, B., Tuen, A.A., 2014. Transformation of ENSO-related rainwater to dripwater  $\delta$ 180
- 1971 variability by vadose water mixing. Geophys Res Lett 41, 7907-7915.
- 1972 Moquet, J.S., Cruz, F.W., Novello, V.F., Strikis, N.M., Deininger, M., Karmann, I., Santos, R.V., Millo,
- 1973 C., Apaestegui, J., Guyot, J.L., Siffedine, A., Vuille, M., Cheng, H., Edwards, R.L., Santini, W., 2016.
- 1974 Calibration of speleothem delta O-18 records against hydroclimate instrumental records in Central
- 1975 Brazil. Global and Planet. Change 139, 151-164.
- 1976 Morellón, M., Valero-Garcés, B., Vegas-Villarrúbia, T., González-Sampériz, P., Romero, O., Delgado-
- 1977 Huertas, A., Mata, P., Moreno, A., Rico, M., Corella, J.P., 2009. Lateglacial and Holocene
- 1978 palaeohydrology in the western Mediterranean region: the Lake Estanya record (NE Spain).
- 1979 Quaternary Science Reviews 28, 2582-2599.
- 1980 Moreno, A., Pérez-Mejías, C., Bartolomé, M., Sancho, C., Cacho, I., Stoll, H., Delgado-Huertas, A.,
- 1981 Hellstrom, J., Edwards, R.L., Cheng, H., 2017. New speleothem data from Molinos and Ejulve caves
- 1982 reveal Holocene hydrological variability in northeast Iberia. Quaternary Research 88, 223-233.
- 1983 Moreno, A., Sancho, C., Bartolomé, M., Oliva-Urcia, B., Delgado-Huertas, A., Estrela, M.J., Corell, D.,
- 1984 López-Moreno, J.I., Cacho, I., 2014. Climate controls on rainfall isotopes and their effects on cave
- 1985 drip water and speleothem growth: the case of Molinos cave (Teruel, NE Spain). Climate Dynamics

1986 43, 221-241.

- 1987 Moseley, G.E., Spötl, C., Cheng, H., Boch, R., Min, A., Edwards, R.L., 2015. Termination-II
- 1988 interstadial/stadial climate change recorded in two stalagmites from the north European Alps.
- 1989 Quaternary Science Reviews 127, 229-239.
- 1990 Müller, W., Fietzke, J., 2016. The role of LA-ICP-MS in palaeoclimate research. Elements 12, 329-334.

- Müller, W., Shelley, M., Miller, P., Broude, S., 2009. Initial performance metrics of a new customdesigned ArF excimer LA-ICPMS system coupled to a two-volume laser-ablation cell. J. Anal. At.
  Spectrom. 24, 209-214.
- 1994 Müller, W., Valley, J.W., Warter, V., Kodzon, R., Evans, D., Orland, I.J., 2015. Natural high-
- 1995 temperature metamorphic calcite as compositionally homogenous microanalytical standard?,
- 1996 Goldschmidt 2015, Prague.
- 1997 Murata, F., Terao, T., Hayashi, T., Asada, H., Matsumoto, J., 2007. Relationship between atmospheric
- 1998 conditions at Dhaka, Bangladesh, and rainfall at Cherrapunjee, India. Natural Hazards 44, 399-410.
- 1999 Myers, C.G., Oster, J.L., Sharp, W.D., Bennartz, R., Kelley, N.P., Covey, A.K., Breitenbach, S.F.M.,
- 2000 2015. Northeast Indian stalagmite records Pacific decadal climate change: Implications for moisture
- transport and drought in India. Geophys. Res. Lett. 42, 4124-4132.
- 2002 Nagra, G., Treble, P.C., Andersen, M.S., Bajo, P., Hellstrom, J., Baker, A., 2017. Dating stalagmites in
- 2003 mediterranean climates using annual trace element cycles. Sci. Rep. 7, 621.
- 2004 Noronha, A.L., Johnson, K.R., Southon, J.R., Hu, C., Ruan, J., McCabe-Glynn, S., 2015. Radiocarbon
- 2005 evidence for decomposition of aged organic matter in the vadose zone as the main source of
- 2006 speleothem carbon. Quaternary Sci. Rev. 127, 37-47.
- 2007 O'Neil, J.R., Clayton, R.M., Mayeda, T., 1969. Oxygen isotope fractionation in divalent metal
  2008 carbonates. J. Chem. Phys. 30, 5547-5558.
- 2009 Oerter, E.J., Sharp, W.D., Oster, J.L., Ebeling, A., Valley, J.W., Kodzon, R., Orland, I.J., Hellstrom, J.,
- 2010 Woodhead, J.D., Hergt, J.M., Chadwick, O.A., Amundson, R., 2016. Pedothem carbonates reveal
- 2011 anomalous North American atmospheric circulation 70,000–55,000 years ago. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S
- 2012 A 113, 919-924.

- 2013 Onac, B.P., Pace-Graczyk, K., Atudirei, V., 2008. Stable isotope study of precipitation and cave drip
  2014 water in Florida (USA): implications for speleothem-based paleoclimate studies. Isot. Environ. Health
  2015 Stud. 44, 149-161.
- 2016 Orland, I.J., Bar-Matthews, M., Ayalon, A., Matthews, A., Kozdon, R., Ushikubo, T., Valley, J.W., 2012.
- 2017 Seasonal resolution of Eastern Mediterranean climate change since 34 ka from a Soreq Cave
- 2018 speleothem. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 89, 240-255.
- 2019 Orland, I.J., Bar-Matthews, M., Kita, N.T., Ayalon, A., Matthews, A., Valley, J.W., 2008. Seasonal
- 2020 climate change as revealed by ion microprobe analysis of delta O-18 in Soreq Cave (Israel)
- 2021 speleothems. Geochimica Et Cosmochimica Acta 72, A709-A709.
- 2022 Orland, I.J., Bar-Matthews, M., Kita, N.T., Ayalon, A., Matthews, A., Valley, J.W., 2009. Climate
- 2023 deterioration in the Eastern Mediterranean as revealed by ion microprobe analysis of a speleothem
- that grew from 2.2 to 0.9 ka in Soreq Cave, Israel. Quaternary Research 71, 27-35.
- 2025 Orland, I.J., Burstyn, Y., Bar-Matthews, M., Kozdon, R., Ayalon, A., Matthews, A., Valley, J.W., 2014.
- 2026 Seasonal climate signals (1990-2008) in a modern Soreq Cave stalagmite as revealed by high-
- resolution geochemical analysis. Chemical Geology 363, 322-333.
- Orland, I.J., Edwards, R.L., Cheng, H., Kozdon, R., Cross, M., Valley, J.W., 2015. Direct measurements
  of deglacial monsoon strength in a Chinese stalagmite. Geology 43, 555-558.
- Orland, I.J., He, F., Bar-Matthews, M., Chen, G., Ayalon, A., Kutzbach, J.E., 2019. Resolving seasonal
  rainfall changes in the Middle East during the last interglacial period. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 116,
  24985-24990.
- 2033 Orland, I.J.d., 2013. Seasonality from speleothems : high-resolution ion microprobe studies at Soreq
  2034 Cave, Israel. Ann Arbor, MI : ProQuest LLC, 2013.

- 2035 Orr, P.C., 1952. Excavations in Moaning Cave. Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History Bulletin 1, 12036 19.
- 2037 Ortega, R., Maire, R., Deves, G., Quinif, Y., 2005. High-resolution mapping of uranium and other trace
- 2038 elements in recrystallized aragonite-calcite speleothems from caves in the Pyrenees (France):
- 2039 Implications for U-series dating. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 237, 911-023.
- 2040 Oster, J.L., Montañez, I.P., Kelley, N.P., 2012. Response of a modern cave system to large seasonal
- 2041 precipitation variability. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 91, 92-108.
- 2042 Pacton, M., Breitenbach, S.F.M., Lechleitner, F.A., Vaks, A., Rollion-Bard, C., Gutareva, O.S., Osintcev,
- 2043 A.V., Vasconcelos, C., 2013. The role of microorganisms in the formation of a stalactite in Botovskaya
- 2044 Cave, Siberia paleoenvironmental implications. Biogeosciences 10, 6115-6130.
- 2045 Parton, A., Farrant, A.R., Leng, M.J., Telfer, M.W., Groucutt, H.S., Petraglia, M.D., Parker, A.G., 2015.
- 2046 Alluvial fan records from southeast Arabia reveal multiple windows for human dispersal. Geol. 43,
- 2047 295-298.
- Peel, M.C., Finlayson, B.L., MCMahon, T.A., 2007. Updated world map of the Köppen-Geiger climate
  classification. Hydrology and Earth System Sciences 11, 1633-1644.
- Perrin, J., Jeannin, P.-Y., Zwahlen, F., 2003. Epikarst storage in a karst aquifer: a conceptual model
  based on isotopic data, Milandre test site, Switzerland. Journal of Hydrology 279, 106-124.
- 2052 Prokop, P., Walanus, A., 2003. Trends and periodicity in the longest instrumental rainfall series for
- the area of most extreme rainfall in the world, northeast India. Geographia Polonica 76, 25-35.
- 2054 Pu, J., Wang, A., Shen, L., Yin, J., Yuan, D., Zhao, H., 2016. Factors controlling the growth rate, carbon
- and oxygen isotope variation in modern calcite precipitation in a subtropical cave, Southwest China.
- 2056 Journal of Asian Earth Sciences 119, 167-178.

Railsback, L.B., 2018. A comparison of growth rate of late Holocene stalagmites with atmospheric
precipitation and temperature, and its implications for paleoclimatology. Quaternary Science
Reviews 187, 94-111.

Railsback, L.B., Brook, G.A., Chen, J., Kalin, R., Fleisher, C., 1994. Environmental controls on the
petrology of a late Holocene speleothem from Botswana with annual layers of aragonite and calcite.
J Sediment Res A64, 147-155.

2063 Railsback, L.B., Liang, F.Y., Romani, J.R.V., Grandal-d'Anglade, A., Rodriguez, M.V., Fidalgo, L.S.,

2064 Mosquera, D.F., Cheng, H., Edwards, R.L., 2011. Petrographic and isotopic evidence for Holocene

2065 long-term climate change and shorter-term environmental shifts from a stalagmite from the Serra

2066 do Courel of northwestern Spain, and implications for climatic history across Europe and the

2067 Mediterranean. Palaeogeography Palaeoc. 305, 172-184.

2068 Railsback, L.B., Liang, F.Y., Vidal-Romani, J.R., Garrett, K.B., Sellers, R.C., Vaqueiro-Rodriguez, M.,

2069 Grandal-d'Anglade, A., Cheng, H., Edwards, R.L., 2017. Radiometric, isotopic, and petrographic

2070 evidence of changing interglacials over the past 550,000 years from six stalagmites from the Serra do

2071 Courel in the Cordillera Cantabrica of northwestern Spain. Palaeogeography Palaeoc. 466, 137-152.

2072 Ramakrishnan, P.S., Subhash, C.R., 1988. Vegetation, biomass and productivity of seral grasslands of
2073 Cherrapunji in north-east India. Vegetatio 74, 47-53.

2074 Ridley, H., Baldini, J., Prufer, K., Walczak, I., Breitenbach, S., 2015a. High-resolution monitoring of Yok

2075 Balum Cave, Belize: An investigation of seasonal ventilation regimes and the atmospheric and drip-

flow response to a local earthquake. Journal of Cave and Karst Studies 77, 183-199.

2077 Ridley, H.E., Asmerom, Y., Baldini, J.U.L., Breitenbach, S.F.M., Aquino, V.V., Prufer, K.M., Culleton,

2078 B.J., Polyak, V., Lechleitner, F.A., Kennett, D.J., Zhang, M., Marwan, N., Macpherson, C.G., Baldini,

- 2079 L.M., Xiao, T., Peterkin, J.L., Awe, J., Haug, G.H., 2015b. Aerosol forcing of the position of the
- 2080 intertropical convergence zone since AD1550. Nat. Geosci. 8, 195–200.
- 2081 Riechelmann, D.F.C., Deininger, M., Scholz, D., Riechelmann, S., Schroder-Ritzrau, A., Spotl, C.,
- 2082 Richter, D.K., Mangini, A., Immenhauser, A., 2013. Disequilibrium carbon and oxygen isotope
- 2083 fractionation in recent cave calcite: Comparison of cave precipitates and model data. Geochim.
- 2084 Cosmochim. Acta 103, 232-244.
- 2085 Riechelmann, D.F.C., Schroder-Ritzrau, A., Scholz, D., Fohlmeister, J., Spotl, C., Richter, D.K., Mangini,
- 2086 A., 2011. Monitoring Bunker Cave (NW Germany): A prerequisite to interpret geochemical proxy
- 2087 data of speleothems from this site. J Hydrol 409, 682-695.
- 2088 Riechelmann, S., Breitenbach, S.F.M., Schroder-Ritzrau, A., Mangini, A., Immenhauser, A., 2019.
- 2089 Ventilation and Cave Air PCO2 in the Bunker-Emst Cave System (NW Germany): Implications for
- 2090 Speleothem Proxy Data. J Cave Karst Stud 81, 98-112.
- 2091 Riechelmann, S., Schröder-Ritzrau, A., Spötl, C., Riechelmann, D.F.C., Richter, D.K., Mangini, A.,
- 2092 Frank, N., Breitenbach, S.F.M., Immenhauser, A., 2017. Sensitivity of Bunker Cave to climatic forcings
- highlighted through multi-annual monitoring of rain-, soil-, and dripwaters. Chemical Geology 449,
- 2094 194-205.
- 2095 Rittner, M., Muller, W., 2012. 2D mapping of LA-ICPMS trace element distributions using R.
- 2096 Computers & Geosciences 42, 152-161.
- 2097 Roberts, M.S., Smart, P.L., Baker, A., 1998. Annual trace element variations in a Holocene
- 2098 speleothem. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 154, 237-246.
- 2099 Ronay, E.R., Breitenbach, S.F.M., Oster, J.L., 2019. Sensitivity of speleothem records in the Indian
- 2100 Summer Monsoon region to dry season infiltration. Sci Rep 9, 5091.

- Sade, Z., Halevy, I., 2017. New constraints on kinetic isotope effects during CO2(aq) hydration and
  hydroxylation: Revisiting theoretical and experimental data. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 214, 246265.
- 2104 Santer, B.D., Po-Chedley, S., Zelinka, M.D., Cvijanovic, I., Bonfils, C., Durack, P.J., Fu, Q., Kiehl, J.,
- 2105 Mears, C., Painter, J., Pallotta, G., Solomon, S., Wentz, F.J., Zou, C.-Z., 2018. Human influence on the
- 2106 seasonal cycle of tropospheric temperature. Science 361, eaas8806.
- 2107 Schubert, B.A., Jahren, A.H., 2015. Seasonal temperature and precipitation recorded in the intra-
- 2108 annual oxygen isotope pattern of meteoric water and tree-ring cellulose. Quaternary Science
- 2109 Reviews 125, 1-14.
- 2110 Schwarz, K., Barth, J.A.C., Postigo-Rebollo, C., Grathwohl, P., 2009. Mixing and transport of water in a
- 2111 karst catchment: a case study from precipitation via seepage to the spring. Hydrology and Earth
- 2112 System Sciences 13, 285-292.
- 2113 Scroxton, N., Burns, S.J., Dawson, P., Rhodes, J.M., Brent, K., McGee, D., Heijnis, H., Gadd, P.,
- Hantoro, W., Gagan, M., 2018. Rapid measurement of strontium in speleothems using core-scanning
- 2115 micro X-ray fluorescence. Chemical Geology 487, 12-22.
- Shen, C.C., Lin, K., Duan, W., Jiang, X., Partin, J.W., Edwards, R.L., Cheng, H., Tan, M., 2013. Testing
  the annual nature of speleothem banding. Sci Rep 3, 2633.
- 2118 Sherwin, C.M., Baldini, J.U.L., 2011. Cave air and hydrological controls on prior calcite precipitation
- and stalagmite growth rates: Implications for palaeoclimate reconstructions using speleothems.
- 2120 Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 75, 3915-3929.
- 2121 Shopov, Y.Y., Ford, D.C., Schwarcz, H.P., 1994. Luminescent microbanding in speleothems high-
- resolution chronology and paleoclimate. Geol. 22, 407-410.

- 2123 Sliwinski, M.G., Kitajima, K., Kodzon, R., Spicuzza, M., Denny, A., Valley, J.W., 2017. In situ  $\delta$ 13C and
- 2124 δ180 microanalysis by SIMS: A method for characterizing the carbonate components of natural and

engineered CO2-reservoirs. International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control 57, 116-133.

- Sliwinski, M.G., Kodzon, R., Kitajima, K., Denny, A., Spicuzza, M., Valley, J.W., 2015. In-Situ, Micron-
- 2127 Scale δ13C & δ18O Analyses (by SIMS) of Chemo-Isotopically Zoned Carbonate Cements of
- 2128 Diagenetic Origin—A Case Study on the Implications for the Thermal and Burial History of the Eau
- 2129 Claire Fm., Illinois Basin (USA). AAPG Annual Convention and Exhibition.
- 2130 Smart, P.L., Friedrich, H., 1987. Water movement and storage in the unsaturated zone of a maturely
- 2131 karstified aquifer, Mendip Hills, England, The conference on environmental problems in karst
- 2132 terrains and their solution. National Water Well Association, Bowling Green, Kentucky, pp. 57-87.
- 2133 Smith, C.L., Fairchild, I.J., Spotl, C., Frisia, S., Borsato, A., Moreton, S.G., Wynn, P.M., 2009.
- 2134 Chronology building using objective identification of annual signals in trace element profiles of
- 2135 stalagmites. Quat Geochronol 4, 11-21.
- 2136 Spengler, R.N., 2019. Fruit from the Sands: The Silk Road Origins of the Foods We Eat, 1 ed.
- 2137 University of California Press, Oakland, California.
- 2138 Spötl, C., Fairchild, I.J., Tooth, A.F., 2005. Cave air control on dripwater geochemistry, Obir Caves
- 2139 (Austria): implications for speleothem deposition in dynamically ventilated caves. Geochim.
- 2140 Cosmochim. Acta 69, 2451-2468.
- 2141 Spötl, C., Mattey, D., 2006. Stable isotope microsampling of speleothems for palaeoenvironmental
- studies: A comparison of microdrill, micromill and laser ablation techniques. Chem. Geol. 235, 48-58.
- 2143 Stoll, H., Mendez-Vicente, A., Gonzalez-Lemos, S., Moreno, A., Cacho, I., Cheng, H., Edwards, R.L.,
- 2144 2015. Interpretation of orbital scale variability in mid-latitude speleothem  $\delta$ 180: Significance of
- 2145 growth rate controlled kinetic fractionation effects. Quaternary Science Reviews 127, 215-228.

- Stoll, H.M., Müller, W., Prieto, M., 2012. I-STAL, a model for interpretation of Mg/Ca, Sr/Ca and
  Ba/Ca variations in speleothems and its forward and inverse application on seasonal to millennial
- 2148 scales. Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems 13, 09004.
- 2149 Surić, M., Lončarić, R., Lončar, N., Buzjak, N., Bajo, P., Drysdale, R.N., 2017. Isotopic characterization
- of cave environments at varying altitudes on the eastern Adriatic coast (Croatia) Implications for
- 2151 future speleothem-based studies. Journal of Hydrology 545, 367-380.
- 2152 Tabersky, D., Nishiguchi, K., Utani, K., Ohata, M., Dietiker, R., Fricker, M.B., de Maddalena, I.M.,
- 2153 Koch, J., Gunther, D., 2013. Aerosol entrainment and a large-capacity gas exchange device (Q-GED)
- for laser ablation inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry in atmospheric pressure air. J. Anal.
- 2155 At. Spectrom. 28, 831-842.
- 2156 Tadros, C.V., Treble, P.C., Baker, A., Fairchild, I., Hankin, S., Roach, R., Markowska, M., McDonald, J.,
- 2157 2016. ENSO-cave drip water hydrochemical relationship: a 7-year dataset from south-eastern
- Australia. Hydrology and Earth System Sciences 20, 4625-4640.
- Tan, M., Baker, A., Genty, D., Smith, C., Esper, J., Cai, B.G., 2006. Applications of stalagmite laminae
  to paleoclimate reconstructions: Comparison with dendrochronology/climatology. Quaternary Sci.
  Rev. 25, 2103-2117.
- 2162 Taylor, W., Shnaider, S., Abdykanova, A., Fages, A., Welker, F., Irmer, F., Seguin-Orlando, A., Khan, N.,
- 2163 Douka, K., Kolobova, K., Orlando, L., Krivoshapkin, A., Boivin, N., 2018. Early pastoral economies
- along the Ancient Silk Road: Biomolecular evidence from the Alay Valley, Kyrgyzstan. Plos One 13,
  e0205646.
- 2166 Thompson, G.M., Lumsden, D.N., Walker, R.L., Carter, J.A., 1975. Uranium series dating of
- 2167 stalagmites from Blanchard Springs Caverns, U.S.A. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 39, 1211-1218.

- Treble, P., Shelley, J.M.G., Chappell, J., 2003. Comparison of high resolution sub-annual records of
  trace elements in a modern (1911-1992) speleothem with instrumental climate data from southwest
  Australia. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 216, 141-153.
- 2171 Treble, P.C., Bradley, C., Wood, A., Baker, A., Jex, C.N., Fairchild, I.J., Gagan, M.K., Cowley, J., Azcurra,
- 2172 C., 2013. An isotopic and modelling study of flow paths and storage in Quaternary calcarenite, SW
- Australia; implications for speleothem paleoclimate records. Quaternary Sci. Rev. 64, 90-103.
- 2174 Treble, P.C., Chappell, J., Gagan, M.K., McKeegan, K.D., Harrison, T.M., 2005a. In situ measurement
- 2175 of seasonal  $\delta^{18}$ O variations and analysis of isotopic trends in a modem speleothem from southwest
- 2176 Australia. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 233, 17-32.
- Treble, P.C., Chappell, J., Shelley, J.M.G., 2005b. Complex speleothem growth processes revealed by
  trace element mapping and scanning electron microscopy of annual layers. Geochim. Cosmochim.
  Acta 69, 4855-4863.
- 2180 Treble, P.C., Schmitt, A.K., Edwards, R.L., McKeegan, K.D., Harrison, T.M., Grove, M., Cheng, H.,
- 2181 Wang, Y.J., 2007. High resolution Secondary Ionisation Mass Spectrometry (SIMS) delta O-18
- analyses of Hulu Cave speleothem at the time of Heinrich Event 1. Chem. Geol. 238, 197-212.
- 2183 Tremaine, D.M., Froelich, P.N., Wang, Y., 2011. Speleothem calcite farmed in situ: Modern
- 2184 calibration of d<sup>18</sup>O and d<sup>13</sup>C paleoclimate proxies in a continuously-monitored natural cave system.
- 2185 Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 75, 4929-4950.
- 2186 Valley, J.W., Kita, N.T., 2009. In situ oxygen isotope geochemistry by ion microprobe, MAC short
- 2187 course: secondary ion mass spectrometry in the earth sciences, pp. 19-63.
- 2188 Vanghi, V., Borsato, A., Frisia, S., Howard, D., Gloy, G., Hellstrom, J., Bajo, P., 2019. High-resolution
- 2189 synchrotron X-ray fluorescence investigation of calcite coralloid speleothems: Elemental
- incorporation and their potential as environmental archives. Sedimentology 66, 2661–2685.

- 2191 Verheyden, S., Genty, D., Deflandre, G., Quinif, Y., Keppens, E., 2008. Monitoring climatological,
- 2192 hydrological and geochemical parameters in the Pere Noel cave (Belgium): implication for the
- 2193 interpretation of speleothem isotopic and geochemical time-series. Int J Speleol 37, 221-234.
- 2194 Vonhof, H.B., de Graaf, S., Spero, H.J., Schiebel, R., Verdegaal, S.J.A., Metcalfe, B., Haug, G.H., 2020.
- 2195 High-precision stable isotope analysis of <5 μg CaCO3 samples by continuous-flow mass
- 2196 spectrometry. Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom. 34, e8878.
- 2197 Vonhof, H.B., van Breukelen, M.R., Postma, O., Rowe, P.J., Atkinson, T.C., Kroon, D., 2006. A
- 2198 continuous-flow crushing device for on-line delta H-2 analysis of fluid inclusion water in
- 2199 speleothems. Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom. 20, 2553-2558.
- 2200 Waite, A.J., Swart, P.K., 2015. The inversion of aragonite to calcite during the sampling of skeletal
- archives: Implications for proxy interpretation. Rapid Commun Mass Spectrom 29, 955-964.
- 2202 Walczak, I.W., 2016. Holocene climate variability revealed using geochemistry and Computed
- 2203 Tomography scanning of stalagmites from the North Atlantic Basin, Earth Sciences. Durham
- 2204 University, Durham, p. 199.
- 2205 Walczak, I.W., Baldini, J.U.L., Baldini, L.M., McDermott, F., Marsden, S., Standish, C.D., Richards, D.A.,
- 2206 Andreo, B., Slater, J., 2015. Reconstructing high-resolution climate using CT scanning of unsectioned
- 2207 stalagmites: A case study identifying the mid-Holocene onset of the Mediterranean climate in
- 2208 southern Iberia. Quaternary Sci. Rev. 127, 117-128.
- 2209 Wang, C., Bendle, J.A., Greene, S.E., Griffiths, M.L., Huang, J., Moossen, H., Zhang, H., Ashley, K., Xie,
- 2210 S., 2019a. Speleothem biomarker evidence for a negative terrestrial feedback on climate during
- Holocene warm periods. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 525, 115754.

- Wang, J.K., Johnson, K.R., Borsato, A., Amaya, D.J., Griffiths, M.L., Henderson, G.M., Frisia, S., Mason,
  A., 2019b. Hydroclimatic variability in Southeast Asia over the past two millennia. Earth Planet. Sci.
  Lett. 525, 115737.
- 2215 Wang, X.F., Edwards, R.L., Auler, A.S., Cheng, H., Kong, X.G., Wang, Y.J., Cruz, F.W., Dorale, J.A.,
- Chiang, H.W., 2017. Hydroclimate changes across the Amazon lowlands over the past 45,000 years.
  Nature 541, 204–207.
- 2218 Wang, Y.J., Cheng, H., Edwards, R.L., An, Z.S., Wu, J.Y., Shen, C.-C., Dorale, J.A., 2001. A high-
- resolution absolute-dated late Pleistocene monsoon record from Hulu Cave, China. Science 294,
  2345-2348.
- 2221 Wassenburg, J., Immenhauser, A., Richter, D., Jochum, K., Fietzke, J., Deininger, M., Goos, M., Scholz,
- 2222 D., Sabaoui, A., 2012. Climate and cave control on Pleistocene/Holocene calcite-to-aragonite
- transitions in speleothems from Morocco: Elemental and isotopic evidence. Geochim. Cosmochim.
  Acta 92, 23–47.
- 2225 Webb, M., Dredge, J., Barker, P.A., Müller, W., Jex, C., Desmarchelier, J., Hellstrom, J., Wynn, P.M.,
- 2226 2014. Quaternary climatic instability in south-east Australia from a multi-proxy speleothem record. J.
- 2227 of Quaternary Sci. 29, 589-596.
- 2228 Welte, C., Wacker, L., Hattendorf, B., Christl, M., Fohlmeister, J., Breitenbach, S.F.M., Robinson, L.F.,
- 2229 Andrews, A.H., Freiwald, A., Farmer, J.R., Yeman, C., Synal, H.A., Gunther, D., 2016. Laser Ablation -
- 2230 Accelerator Mass Spectrometry: An Approach for Rapid Radiocarbon Analyses of Carbonate Archives
- at High Spatial Resolution. Anal. Chem. 88, 8570-8576.
- 2232 Wiedenbeck, M., Bugoi, R., Duke, M.J.M., Dunai, T., Enzweiler, J., Horan, M., Jochum, K.P., Linge, K.,
- 2233 Kosler, J., Merchel, S., Morales, L.F.G., Nasdala, L., Stalder, R., Sylvester, P., Weis, U., Zoubir, A., 2012.

- 2234 GGR Biennial Critical Review: Analytical Developments Since 2010. Geostandards and Geoanalytical
  2235 Research 36, 337-398.
- 2236 Wong, C.I., Banner, J.L., Musgrove, M., 2011. Seasonal dripwater Mg/Ca and Sr/Ca variations driven
- 2237 by cave ventilation: Implications for and modeling of speleothem paleoclimate records. Geochimica
- et Cosmochimica Acta 75, 3514-3529.
- 2239 Wong, C.I., Breecker, D.O., 2015. Advancements in the use of speleothems as climate archives.
- 2240 Quaternary Science Reviews 127, 1-18.
- 2241 Woodhead, J.D., Hellstrom, J., Hergt, J.M., Greig, A., Maas, R., 2007. Isotopic and elemental imaging
- of geological materials by laser ablation inductively coupled plasma-mass spectrometry.
- 2243 Geostandards and Geoanalytical Research 31, 331-343.
- Woodhead, J.D., Horstwood, M.S.A., Cottle, J.M., 2016. Advances in isotope ratio determination by
  LA-ICP-MS. Elements 12, 317-322.
- 2246 Wortham, B.E., Montanez, I.P., Rowland, D.J., Lerche, M., Browning, A., 2019. Mapping Fluid-Filled
- 2247 Inclusions in Stalagmites Using Coupled X-Ray and Neutron Computed Tomography: Potential as a
- 2248 Water Excess Proxy. Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems 20, 2647-2656.
- 2249 Wu, X., Zhu, X., Pan, M., Zhang, M., 2014. Seasonal variability of oxygen and hydrogen stable
- isotopes in precipitation and cave drip water at Guilin, southwest China. Environmental Earth
- 2251 Sciences 72, 3183-3191.
- 2252 Wycech, J.B., Kelly, D.C., Kozdon, R., Orland, I.J., Spero, H.J., Valley, J.W., 2018. Comparison of δ18O
- analyses on individual planktic foraminifer (Orbulina universa) shells by SIMS and gas-source mass
- spectrometry. Chemical Geology 483, 119-130.

- 2255 Wynn, P.M., Fairchild, I.J., Borsato, A., Spotl, C., Hartland, A., Baker, A., Frisia, S., Baldini, J.U.L., 2018.
- 2256 Sulphate partitioning into calcite: Experimental verification of pH control and application to
- seasonality in speleothems. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 226, 69-83.
- 2258 Wynn, P.M., Fairchild, I.J., Frisia, S., Spotl, C., Baker, A., Borsato, A., EIMF, 2010. High-resolution
- sulphur isotope analysis of speleothem carbonate by secondary ionisation mass spectrometry.
- 2260 Chemical Geology 271, 101-107.
- 2261 Wynn, P.M., Fairchild, I.J., Spotl, C., Hartland, A., Mattey, D., Fayard, B., Cotte, M., 2014. Synchrotron
- 2262 X-ray distinction of seasonal hydrological and temperature patterns in speleothem carbonate.
- 2263 Environ Chem 11, 28-36.
- Yonge, C.J., Ford, D.C., Gray, J., Schwarcz, H.P., 1985. Stable isotope studies of cave seepage water.
  Chemical Geology 58, 97-105.
- Zeng, G., Luo, W., Wang, S., Du, X., 2015. Hydrogeochemical and climatic interpretations of isotopic
  signals from precipitation to drip waters in Liangfeng Cave, Guizhou Province, China. Environmental
  Earth Sciences 74, 1509-1519.

## 2270 Figure Captions:

Figure 1: Top Panel: Resolution of speleothem isotope records over time, compiled from the SISALv1b database. Individual record resolution (small black circles) and mean resolution of all available (black bars) and Holocene (blue bars) records published in a given year. Bottom panel: Total number of stalagmite records identified (grey bars), total number of stalagmite records in SISALv1b (black bars), and total number of Holocene records in SISALv1b (blue bars).

Figure 2: Illustration of different drip responses from Yok Balum Cave, Belize, over
approximately two months as captured by a series of automated drip loggers. Two clear rain
events and the subsequent drip responses are indicated by the vertical dashed red lines.
Rainfall amount is recorded directly over the cave site using a tipping bucket rain gauge.
Techniques are discussed in more detail in (Ridley et al., 2015a).

2282 Figure 3: A new drip categorisation scheme designed to emphasise cave drip seasonality. 2283 The scheme does not use classification boundaries as such, but instead uses the data distribution to understand the hydrology. The scheme uses descriptors that map onto 2284 2285 established drip terminology (see Panels B-D and main text for examples). A) Minimum and 2286 maximum hourly drip rates extracted for every month of record for numerous cave drips 2287 globally. The dashed line represents the 1:1 line, and all data points must necessarily plot over this (i.e., the minimum drip rate cannot exceed the maximum drip rate for any given 2288 2289 month). The closer a point plots to the dashed line, the lower the difference between 2290 monthly maximum and minimum values for that point; if a point sits on the line the 2291 minimum and maximum values for that month are identical. Panels B-D illustrate some 2292 common drip types (using synthetic data) and their pattern when plotted on this diagram. 2293 Panels B-D are schematic and are not based on actual collected datasets; the symbols used 2294 are arbitrary and are not linked to the symbols used in Panel A.

Figure 4: The simulated effects of sampling resolution on the climate signal extracted from a stalagmite. The stalagmite data are from stalagmite YOK-G (Yok Balum Cave, Belize), which was originally sampled with a micromill at a 100 micron (0.1 mm) step size (Ridley et al., 2015b). The chronology for the stalagmite is precise at the seasonal scale. The rainfall data

(bottom panel) are from the Punta Gorda meteorological station (~30 km to the southeastof the cave site).

Figure 5: Schematic of a sampling scheme for achieving ~50 micron spatial resolution. Plan 2301 2302 view of a stalagmite surface with 1 mm conventional holes on the right and trenches cut for 2303 low and high resolution. The red trench was milled with a 0.8 mm diameter drill and the (blue-2304 shaded) higher resolution trench was cut laterally, with each sample integrating 50 μm. The 2305 red corners highlight the area that is incorporated into subsequent steps, which in this case 2306 includes material from the current and the previous sample. In this example each high-2307 resolution sample (e.g., yellow shaded area) integrates a minimal amount of powder of an 2308 older sample (because the milling direction is upward).

Figure 6: Several examples of output generated by different geochemical-based techniques 2309 2310 for extracting seasonal climate. A) Variability in sulphate in speleothem calcite (Obi84, Obir 2311 cave, Austria) as determined by SR-µXRF (Wynn et al., 2014). The clear annual sulphur maxima 2312 are evident as brighter green colours. B) Ion microprobe-resolved strontium and phosphorous cycles apparent in stalagmite CC3 from Crag Cave, southwestern Ireland (Baldini et al., 2002). 2313 2314 The well-developed cycles illustrate stronger seasonality at the time of deposition (~8.336 ka 2315 BP) than currently present. C) Annual UV-luminescent banding in a stalagmite from Shihua 2316 Cave, Beijing, China (adapted from Tan et al. (2006)). D) well-develop carbon isotope ratio cycles in stalagmite YOK-G from Yok Balum Cave, Belize, constructed using data obtained via 2317 micromilling at a 100-micron spatial resolution and analyses of powders on an IRMS (Ridley 2318 2319 et al., 2015b) (see also Figure 4). E) Mg cycles apparent in stalagmite BER-SWI-13 from Learnington Cave, Bermuda, resolved using LA-ICPMS-derived Mg data (Walczak, 2016). All 2320 panels show three to four cycles, interpreted as annual. 2321

Figure 7: A synthetic rainfall input signal (orange circles) with an annual temperature range of 2322 2323 15 °C compared with two mean model outputs, one derived using an annual temperature range of  $10 \pm 6$  °C (grey line), and another derived using an annual temperature range of  $15 \pm$ 2324 6 °C (blue line). At the beginning of the simulated rainfall input signal record (year = 0), April 2325 2326 is the wettest month and November the driest month, but this shifts in polarity slowly through the record, moving through a brief phase with no seasonality in rainfall (year = 7), and then 2327 transitioning into a phase where April is the driest month (from year = 8). The vertical gridlines 2328 2329 highlight the month of April during every model year. The simulated rainfall input signal amplitude and polarity is reproduced by the model very satisfactorily, provided that the 2330 model temperature range is realistic, as it is in Model 2. Note that the polarity of the simulated 2331 rainfall input signal is still reproduced by Model 1, but modelled rainfall seasonal amplitude 2332 2333 is too large in order to compensate for the low amplitude of the modelled temperature range.

Figure 8: Temperature (top panel) and rainfall (bottom panel) modelling results (black dashed lines) against 'noisy' synthetic input datasets (solid coloured lines) for seven model years. The grey rectangle highlights one model year (Year 4) where the input rainfall signal polarity was reversed; the model detects this shift. The modelling results presented are the mean values of all successful model runs for each timeslice.

Figure 9: Mean modelled monthly temperature and rainfall data against Global Historical Climate Network (GHCN) and tree ring data. A) Stalagmite Keklik1 oxygen isotope ratio data from Bir-Uja Cave, Kyrgyzstan (input data) (Fohlmeister et al., 2017). B) Centennial-scale borehole temperature data from the Tian Shan region (Huang et al., 2000) from 1500 to 2000 C.E. (input data, shifted upwards for clarity) (blue diamonds), modelled July temperature (black curve) (output), and NTREND summer temperature reconstruction for

Asia Grid 2 (AG2) (red curve) (Cook et al., 2013). C) Modelled January rainfall (black curve)
(output) and GHCN January rainfall for Tashkent (orange curve), both in % of total annual
rainfall. The grey rectangles highlight the years 1797 and 1815 C.E. discussed in the text.

2348 Figure 10: Global seasonality in annual temperature (°C) and annual precipitation (mm). A) 2349 The annual temperature range was calculated as the maximum temperature of the warmest 2350 month minus the minimum temperature of the coldest month averaged over the period 2351 1970-2000. B) Precipitation seasonality was calculated as the precipitation amount of the 2352 wettest month minus the precipitation amount of the driest month averaged over the 2353 period 1970-2000. WorldClim Version 2 data (https://www.worldclim.org/) were obtained 2354 at a 2.5 minute (~4.5 km at the equator) spatial resolution (Fick and Hijmans, 2017). The 2355 data span the period 1970-2000 and thus may reflect anthropogenically-influenced temperature seasonality as discussed in Santer et al. (2018). Therefore, although the general 2356 spatial pattern of temperature (and potentially precipitation) seasonality may persist into 2357 the past, the magnitude of seasonality shifts may deviate from that presented here, 2358 2359 particularly when extending records into the preindustrial era.

Figure 11: Global seasonality in amount-weighted precipitation  $\delta^{18}$ O (‰ VWMOW). The amount-weighted mean (WM) monthly precipitation  $\delta^{18}$ O data (IAEA/WMO, 2001) were used to determine the annual range in precipitation isotopes globally (calculated as the maximum monthly WM  $\delta^{18}$ O minus minimum monthly WM  $\delta^{18}$ O at 267 stations (yellow symbols) with a complete 12-month dataset over the period 1961-1999. GNIP station data were interpolated onto a 2.5° X 2.5° global grid (~278 km X 278 km) (IAEA, 2001).

Figure 12: A Hovmöller plot of the annual cycle of total-column precipitable water vapour
for Central America, based on daily ERA5 re-analysis data across the region from -110 to -

- 2368 80W and 0 to 35N for the period 1979-2018. Also indicated are the latitudes of three key
- 2369 cave sites that have yielded stalagmites which have produced oxygen isotope records of
- 2370 rainfall.
- 2371

## 2372 Figures:




























